

CITY OF JOONDALUP

MINUTES OF SPECIAL ELECTORS MEETING HELD ON MONDAY, 18 MARCH 2002 AT TOM SIMPSON PARK, OCEANSIDE PROMENADE, MULLALOO

ATTENDANCES

Mayor:

J BOMBAK, JP

Elected Members:

Cr P KIMBER	Lakeside Ward
Cr D CARLOS	Marina Ward
Cr C BAKER	Marina Ward
Cr J F HOLLYWOOD, JP	North Coastal Ward
Cr A WALKER	Pinnaroo Ward
Cr M O'BRIEN, JP	South Ward
Cr C MACKINTOSH	Whitfords Ward

Officers:

Chief Executive Officer:	D SMITH
Director, Corporate Services & Resource Management:	J TURKINGTON
Director, Planning & Community Development:	C HIGHAM
Director, Infrastructure & Operations:	D DJULBIC
Manager, Audit & Executive Services:	K ROBINSON
Urban Designer:	B WOODGUSH
Publicity Officer:	L BRENNAN
Committee Clerk:	J AUSTIN
Minute Clerk:	L TAYLOR

IN ATTENDANCE:

Mr Tony O'Gorman, MLA, Member for Joondalup
Mr Rob Johnson, MLA, Member for Hillarys
Mr Ken Travers, MLC, Member for North Metropolitan Region

APOLOGIES

Apologies: Crs Hurst, Kenworthy, Nixon, Rowlands, Barnett, Kadak and Patterson.

There were in excess of 500 members of the public in attendance, 359 of whom signed the attendance record. *For Attendance lists, click here:* [Attendance180302.pdf](#)

ITEM OF BUSINESS

The Mayor opened the meeting at 1905 hrs, and welcomed members of the public.

PURPOSE OF MEETING

The purpose of the meeting is to enable the community to vote on the following motions:

- 1 *Stop the relocation of the central car park to the grassed area in Tom Simpson Park, Mullaloo;*
- 2 *Defer the elements of the concept plan for which there is no clear and demonstrable community support and have these issues considered further when a new plan has been drafted;*
- 3 *Other matters that may be raised from the floor of the meeting relating to the Mullaloo Beach Precinct Plan or Preservation of Reserves Policy or any other matters of concern to residents of the City of Joondalup.*

For the information of electors, the Mayor advised that at its meeting held on Tuesday 12 March 2002, Council resolved to:

- “1 note that a preliminary revised concept plan has been prepared;*
- 2 endorse placing the preliminary revised concept plan on public exhibition for a period of six (6) weeks;*
- 3 give further consideration to the plan following the community consultation period, having regard to the comments received and the detailed report on costings and priorities.”*

This meeting was advertised in The Joondalup Community News on Thursday 28 February and Thursday, 14 March 2002.

The Mayor advised that this evening’s proceedings are governed by the Local Government Act 1995 and the City’s Standing Orders Local Law, and outlined the definition of an elector, being:

- a resident owner or occupier enrolled to vote at State elections;
- an owner of rateable property (eg an absentee land owner or an owner of business premises, vacant land or other non-residential property);
- an occupier of rateable property (eg a tenant of business premises or other non-residential property).

The Mayor advised that any decisions made at this electors meeting were not binding on the Council and were required to be submitted to the Council for consideration.

The Director of Planning and Community Development, Mr Clayton Higham, addressed the electors. He provided background information to the concept plan for Mullaloo and outlined key features of the revised plan which had been adopted by Council for the purpose of public consultation, and which had been made available to elected members at this evening's meeting. Mr Higham advised that this plan is on public exhibition for a period of six weeks to seek community feedback and stated that he and his staff were more than happy to brief any person or group. In the meantime, indicative costings would be looked at to see what costs and priorities might be proposed, in order to meet the terms of the Council's resolution.

In relation to the issues raised by Mr M Sideris, Mr Higham advised that the costs associated with the consultancies were as follows:

- In the 2000/01 budget year, Woods Bagot were engaged at a total cost of \$12,700.00. In the 2001/02 budget year, funds have been committed for consultancy work from Tabec (\$9,255.00) and Klyne Consulting (\$1,375.00). The plan, copies of which have been provided this evening, was drawn up by Connell Wagner at a cost of \$2,970.00.

Mr Keith Pearce, Secretary of the Joondalup Coast Care Forum:

Q1 Could I please have a clarification from the Council in relation to the handout provided within the Wanneroo Times in which it states "a small group of Mullaloo residents are campaigning to force our local Council to stop improvements for the clubhouse and prevent the club from building a shed to house its surf lifesaving boats. Please get behind our local surf lifesaving club by attending this meeting". Did your Council send this out or did one of your Councillors and to what purpose was this misinformation sent out?

A1 Response by the Chief Executive Officer: An undertaking is given that the document was not sent out by the City of Joondalup. No such undertaking can be given on behalf of any other person. That document was not officially sanctioned by the Council and was not sent by the Council.

Q2 Is your Council aware of any such group?

A2 Response by the Chief Executive Officer: An undertaking cannot be given as to whether such group exists. It is evident on the document that there is reference to a specific group but it is not known whether that group exists. Steps were taken to establish this over the last couple of days but have been unsuccessful.

Mr Pearce outlined his concerns about the proposed plan and suggestions put forward by the Ratepayers' Association and the fact that there was a grassed area which was not on Tom Simpson Park proper.

MOVED Keith Pearce, Joondalup Community Coast Care Forum SECONDED Helen Kraus, 6 Bluewater Rise, Mullaloo, that we the Electors of the City of Joondalup wish to inform the Council that we value the grassed area known as Tom Simpson Park, Mullaloo which currently includes the road reserve and hereby move that Council:

- 1 stop the relocation of the central carpark to the grassed area in Tom Simpson Park;**
- 2 stop the construction of any car park on the grassed area in Tom Simpson Park;**
- 3 include the grassed area currently on the unused road reserve into Tom Simpson Park proper.**

The following persons spoke to the Motion:

- Mr Brian Herne, 5 Koolama Place, Kallaroo. (Mr Herne raised the following questions)

Q1 Why has Council reserved this land?

A1 Officer's response: The park is in two parts. The section on which this meeting is being held is owned by the City, as a reserve for Recreation. The other section is a reserve managed by the City, and its designation is for Recreation and Parking.

Q2 Is this meeting discussing the future development of Mullaloo and the surrounding areas or just the surf club?

A2 Officer's response: No group has exclusive use of this park.

Q3 Is it correct that 13 metres of the road is owned by Council to widen the road into a double lane carriage?

A3 Officer's response: It is correct there is a wide road reserve, in part it is wider than 13 metres. There are no plans to double the road width.

- Mr M Sideris, 12 Page Drive, Mullaloo. (Mr Sideris raised the following question)

Q1 Can I have clarification of the title of this land we are on tonight?

A1 Officer's response: The northern part of the park is 2.5672 hectares. This land on which the meeting is being held is Lot 1, No 5 Oceanside Promenade, and has an area of 1.04 hectares owned by the City, and is freehold title.

The Motion was Put and

CARRIED

MOVED Bernadette Fee, 18 Oceanside Promenade, Mullaloo SECONDED Susan Kinsella, 18 Karalundie Way, Mullaloo that Lot 1 Oceanside Promenade, Mullaloo be included into Tom Simpson Park proper.

The Motion was Put and

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

MOVED Keith Pearce, Joondalup Community Coast Care Forum SECONDED Peter Webb, Laurel Street Mullaloo that we the Electors of the City of Joondalup wish to inform the Council that some of the elements of the Mullaloo Beach Concept Plan have no clear and demonstrable community support and we hereby move that Council defer the elements of the concept plan for which there is no clear and demonstrable community support and have these issues considered further when an amended plan has been drafted.

The following persons spoke to the Motion:

- Ms Stella Fabrikant, 1 Yulema Street, Mullaloo
- Mr Ken Zakrevsky, 49 Korella Street, Mullaloo
- Mr Brian Bowes, 11 Oldham Street, Mullaloo (Mr Bowes raised the following questions)

Q1 You mentioned that the suburbs of Greenwood and Warwick would be put forward for public consultation. Does the same apply to Hillarys, as I believe there are also precinct plans for that suburb?

A1 Chief Executive Officer's Response: The intention is to develop a community consultation strategy which would apply to the whole of the City. The policy would apply to any areas where in the future there was precinct planning proposed. Community consultation would be similar to that which is currently being sought, that Council has endorsed a plan to be placed on public exhibition, to seek the community's comments. If there are any elements within the plan that the community has strong opposition to, those views must be submitted to Council and will be taken into consideration by

Council. The plan which has been endorsed by Council embraces a number of the elements to which there was opposition, and there has been a concerted attempt to rectify those areas and allow the community a second chance to make their views clear on the amended plan.

Q2 How do the public normally make a submission if they do not like part of a plan?

A2 Chief Executive Officer's response: The plans are placed on public exhibition in strategic locations within the local government area. There is normally good press coverage calling for submissions. This local government has a very vocal community which appears to know when an item is out on exhibition. The Council has expanded the time of public exhibition; it is not uncommon to put some proposals out for six weeks to enable the community to be fully aware of issues. It is not known of any precinct planning at this stage that would affect the Hillarys area. There are a number of concepts being looked at for the Hillarys Boat Harbour area. Any of those matters which were crystallised into a plan would be extensively canvassed with the community.

- Mr Guenther Brenner, 18 Millimumul Way, Mullaloo
- Ms Stella Fabrikant, 1 Yulema Street, Mullaloo

The Motion was Put and

CARRIED

Ms C Woodmass, 25 Calbourne Way, Kingsley:

Q1 Why is it that, although at both previous Special Electors' meetings at Greenwood and Kingsley a request was put forward for an Extraordinary General Electors' meeting to be held to discuss precinct planning which would allow all suburbs of the City of Joondalup to be involved and learn how they can protect their suburbs, that meeting was not held?

A1 Response by Chief Executive Officer: The meeting planned to be held at the Joondalup Arena was considered not necessary by the Council, and supported unanimously by the Council and the members of the gallery present on the night, because it was clearly indicated that Council had completely abandoned in total any of the precinct planning for the nominated suburbs to be discussed at such a special meeting.

Q2 Did the public gallery vote in Council?

A2 Response by Mayor Bombak: The point made by the CEO was that most people in the public gallery were ecstatic with Council's decision.

- *Ms Woodmass queried how 50 people attending within the public gallery at the Council meeting referred to above, could represent the entire community, despite that over 3000 people attending meetings requested a Special Electors' meeting to be held at the Joondalup Arena.*

MOVED Catherine Woodmass, 25 Calbourne Way, Kingsley SECONDED Keith Pearce, Joondalup Community Coast Care Forum that we the Electors of the City of Joondalup move that Council maintain and preserve all parks and open spaces, school ovals, reserves and beaches in Mullaloo under their existing zones and that there be absolute prohibition on boundary alterations.

The Motion was Put and

CARRIED

AMENDMENT MOVED Dennys Hayes, 7 Merrifield Place, Mullaloo SECONDED Keith Pearce, Joondalup Community Coast Care Forum that the following words be included at the end of the above motion:

“.... unless such alteration is to increase the size of the parks, open spaces, school ovals, reserves and beaches.”

The following person spoke to the Motion:

- Mr Robin Wheelwright, 6 Livonia Place, Mullaloo

The Amendment was Put and

CARRIED

MOVED Helen Kraus, 6 Bluewater Rise, Mullaloo SECONDED Marilyn Zakrevsky, 49 Korella Street, Mullaloo that we the Electors of the City of Joondalup move that the City of Joondalup improve the facilities on the Mullaloo Foreshore Area by:

- **completing the cycle path in a location agreed to by the local residents and interested community groups;**
- **Upgrading both of the toilet and changeroom facilities;**
- **Upgrading the existing pathways and fences;**
- **Upgrading the children's playgrounds, providing shade over the top of the playgrounds and providing equipment suitable for pre-school aged children;**
- **Installing better lighting and barbeques in the area;**
- **Re-configuring the parking bays in each car park so as to maximise the number of parking bays, and also resurface and landscape the car parks;**
- **Improving the park cleanliness and the safety by ensuring that the contracted cleaners remove all glass, bottle tops and cigarette butts with a high powered machine and not by hand.**

The following person spoke to the Motion:

- Mr Keith Pearce, Joondalup Community Coast Care Forum

The Motion was Put and

CARRIED

MOVED Helen Kraus, 6 Bluewater Rise, Mullaloo SECONDED Marilyn Zakrevsky, 49 Korella Street, Mullaloo that we the Electors of the City of Joondalup move that the City of Joondalup improve the facilities in all of the parks and reserves in the locality of Mullaloo by:

- providing suitable playground equipment for pre-school children;
- upgrading the children's playgrounds;
- providing shade over the top of the playground;
- installing better lighting and barbeques, and;
- upgrading all of the toilet facilities in the other parks and reserves.

The Motion was Put and

CARRIED

Mr Peter Gray, 28 Clareville Crescent, Mullaloo:

- Mr Gray requested that the Council clarify its understanding of this meeting and issue a clear plan to the residents to debate clearly and properly.

MOVED Keith Pearce, Joondalup Community Coast Care Forum, SECONDED Ken Zakrevsky, 49 Korella Street, Mullaloo that we the Electors of the City of Joondalup move that the City of Joondalup proceed with the rezoning of the ten residential lots owned by the Council at Merrifield Place, Mullaloo to Parks and Recreation in recognition of the reasons the lots were purchased by a very forward-looking Council all those years ago.

The following person spoke to the Motion:

- Ms Bernadette Fee, 18 Oceanside Promenade, Mullaloo

**AMENDMENT MOVED Bernadette Fee, 18 Oceanside Promenade, Mullaloo
SECONDED Linda Gardner, 17 Merrifield Place, Mullaloo that the rezoning be
amended to read: “*virgin beach dune*”.**

The following persons spoke to the Amendment:

- Mr Gerry Kellaher, 77 West View Boulevard, Mullaloo
- Mr M Sideris, 12 Page Drive, Mullaloo
- Mr Liam McDonald, 68 West View Boulevard, Mullaloo

The Amendment was Put and

CARRIED

The original Motion, as Amended, being:

That we the Electors of the City of Joondalup move that the City of Joondalup proceed with the rezoning of the ten residential lots owned by the Council at Merrifield Place, Mullaloo to virgin beach dune in recognition of the reasons the lots were purchased by a very forward-looking Council all those years ago.

Was Put and

CARRIED

MOVED Mitch Sideris, President of Mullaloo Progress Association, SECONDED John Truswell, 12 Sector Place, Mullaloo that we the electors of the City of Joondalup support the current extensions of the Mullaloo Surf Club community centre, which incorporates the local area emergency evacuation centre, furthermore we move that the City of Joondalup retain the essential services by retaining the surf club access for boats and emergency services, retains the heliport evacuation area and retains the disabled parking facility close to the beach.

The following person spoke to the Motion:

- Mr Gerry Seifert, 10 Galley Place, Ocean Reef

The Motion was Put and

CARRIED

Moved Anne Willis, 4 Marjorie Street, Mullaloo, SECONDED Michael Caiacob, 7 Rowan Place, Mullaloo that we the Electors of the City of Joondalup move that any development approval for the Mullaloo Tavern by the Council firstly:

- 1 restrict the height to its existing level;**
- 2 so as not to aggravate the shortage of parking in the area, all bays other than those that they have already taken for the car park, be provided on site;**
- 3 that the redevelopment should be in accordance with the Town Planning Scheme No 2 and the Mullaloo Precinct Plan when it is agreed.**

The Motion was Put and

CARRIED

MOVED Sue Hart, 24 Mamo Place, Greenwood SECONDED Catherine Woodmass, 25 Calbourne Way, Kingsley that the City of Joondalup develop a public consultation policy that is put out for public comment for at least 60 days.

The following person spoke to the motion:

- Mr Martin Brueckner, 1 Squire Avenue, Heathridge

The Motion was Put and

CARRIED

Mrs Sue Hart, 24 Mamo Place, Greenwood:

Q1 Did any Councillors contribute to the yellow flyer provided within the Wanneroo Times?

A1 Response by Cr Baker: I contributed to the flyer. I was concerned that there was a misinformation campaign regarding the Mullaloo Surf Club, that its proposed boat shed extension roof would be used as a beer garden, which was one of the rumours circulating. The roof of the boat shed is not going to be used as a beer garden, or cafeteria, and the purpose of the flyer was to tell members of the public that if they were hearing stories to that effect they could disregard them.

Q2 Did you consult with any Mullaloo residents or the public?

A2 Response by Cr Baker: Yes, the former president of the Mullaloo Surf Lifesaving Club, and also several members.

Ms Catherine Woodmass, 25 Calbourne Way, Kingsley:

Q1 Isn't the statement within the flyer "... a small group of Mullaloo residents are campaigning to force our local Council to stop improvements to the clubhouse and prevent the club from building a shed to house its own lifesaving boats" misinformation? Didn't we establish earlier that this 'small group' does not exist.

A1 Response by Cr Baker: No, absolutely not. I received several calls from residents in the area as I am aware that Cr Mackintosh did. There is such a small group. It is important for the club to build the boat shed to serve the community.

Mrs Sue Hart, 24 Mamo Place, Greenwood:

Q1 Why didn't Cr Baker put his name on the flyer?

A1 Response by Cr Baker: Because I was asked to do it on behalf of a group of people.

Q2 Isn't that what a Councillor is paid for, to act on behalf of and listen to the residents?

A2 Response by Cr Baker: Yes, and the perception I had was that most people supported the proposed extensions to the Mullaloo Surf Club, as I did.

The following persons raised points in relation to the Mullaloo Surf Lifesaving Club and the Mullaloo Precinct Plan.

- Mr Peter Wells, 13 Page Drive, Mullaloo:
- Mr Keith Pearce, Secretary of the Joondalup Coast Care Forum

Ms Bernadette Fee advised that Tom Simpson donated the land and pointed out that tonight his grandson, Mr Alan Carstairs, was in attendance.

MOVED Catherine Woodmass, 25 Calbourne Way, Kingsley SECONDED Sue Hart, 24 Mamo Place, Greenwood that we the electors of the City of Joondalup move a motion to call for a full independent public inquiry and audit of costs into the precinct planning in the entire City of Joondalup.

The following persons spoke to the Motion:

- Ms Denise Chapman, 7 Gardinia Place, Mullaloo
- Ms Sue Hart, 24 Mamo Place, Greenwood (Ms Hart raised the following questions)

Q1 Has there been any more consultants fees since 27 February 2002? I have been told the total value of consultant fees for the current precinct action plan project is \$27,000 yet we have been advised that \$21,000 was for Mullaloo.

A1 Officer's response: There were some residual costs resulting from the public meetings and a couple of outstanding accounts received following that period. I am not aware of any additional consultants fees. The original question was in relation to the Greenwood and Warwick precincts, and not Mullaloo Planning Concept.

Q2 Why do we need consultants when we have a Planning Department?

A2 Response by Chief Executive Officer: The Council had to employ all the planning staff that would be required to produce some of the concept plans, and did not have sufficient resources.

The Motion was Put and

CARRIED

MOVED Ms Stella Fabrikant, 1 Yulema Street, Mullaloo SECONDED (name and address not provided) that the Meeting CONCLUDE.

The following person spoke to the motion:

- Mr M Sideris, 12 Page Drive, Mullaloo

The Motion was Put and

LOST

Mr Craig Fox, Kallaroo:

Mr Fox addressed the meeting and spoke of his many years of involvement in the area, and the responsibility of elected members.

Mr M Sideris, 12 Page Drive, Mullaloo:

Q1 At the Greenwood Special Electors' meeting, we asked for a copy of the design brief. As a result we received documentation which essentially triggered the calling of this meeting. I have an attachment which is identified as 'proposed project area - Mullaloo beach'. Why does this project area go three blocks north and all the way to Dampier Avenue?

A1 This question will be taken on notice.

Mr Gerry Seifert, 10 Galley Place, Ocean Reef

Q1 What is the latest tavern development proposal which is currently on display? It would appear that the al fresco dining area seems wider than the existing footpath area. Is there a proposed road realignment in order to cater for this?

A1 *Officer's response:* The proposals are only over the land over which the tavern is situated. The fact that the plans might show some al fresco dining is not a part of the current application, although it is anticipated that, should a tavern redevelopment proceed, it is quite likely they would apply for al fresco dining purposes. The City would have to establish just what might be approved in the footpath. There is no realignment of the road proposed by the tavern; they may have marginally set their building back from their current building line but the plan would need to be inspected. If Mr Seifert would like to call the City's office, this matter could be discussed further.

Mr Michael Caiacob, 7 Rowan Place, Mullaloo:

Q1 I have been informed by the Planning Department that you are currently looking at on-path seating proposals on the front of the tavern. Is that correct?

A1 *Officer's response:* As previously advised, there is no application for al fresco dining in the public footpath at this stage.

Mr Ken Zakrevsky, 49 Korella Street, Mullaloo:

Q1 I have viewed the plans and the al fresco area is clearly shown.

A1 *Officer's response:* As previously advised, the plans clearly show some tables and chairs in the public footpath, but this is not part of the current development application. The application is only over the tavern land, not over the public footpath, although the plans might show it.

Mrs M Macdonald, 5 Mair Place, Mullaloo:

Q1 The proposed development for the tavern site does not meet the requirements of District Planning Scheme No 2 with respect to car parking and does not meet the requirements in the cash-in-lieu car parking policy. Why then has the Planning Department put this out for public consultation? I understand that the only way this development can proceed is at the discretion of Councillors. Wouldn't it have been better to ask Councillors first before the public consultation period occurred?

A1 Officer's response: No, because the Scheme requires a certain procedure to be undertaken and an applicant has a right to lodge any application in whatever form they wish.

Q2 Can anyone submit a development application and it will be put to the public, irrespective of what it says? Can any plan be put out for public consultation, irrespective of whether it meets requirements for setbacks, carparking or cash-in-lieu policy?

A2 Officer's response: Yes, unless it is prohibitive, that is what the Scheme requires. The Council has a statutory obligation to consider plans that have been lodged.

Mr Michael Caiacob, 7 Rowan Place, Mullaloo:

Q1 In the proposed tavern development, it is indicated on all the tavern brochures that it has been in consultation with the Planning officers of Joondalup. What information has been given to the developers and consultants to indicate they should breach all the BCA and Joondalup City Council by-laws in relation to setbacks?

A1 Officer's response: There is no knowledge of breach of BCA requirements. Consideration of the Building Codes comes much later in the process. It is not known what discussions Planning staff have had with the developers.

Mr John Burns, 1 Darch Street, Mullaloo:

Q1 What steps has Council taken with respect to the change in the traffic situation and its effect on the feeder roads, with particular reference to the roads from Iluka Street, leading up to Laurel Street and feeding through to Karalundie Way? Whilst I support the concept of calmer traffic in front of the beach, I note that Iluka Street and Karalundie Way and Laurel Street become a very fast freeway as an alternative route around the blockage that will come as a result of the formation of the new precinct. I would like to know if there are any plans for traffic calming devices in those areas, and I would like a full traffic impact study undertaken for the residents. This was the highway that was originally planned.

Oceanside Promenade as it is now is the main feeder road whereas Karalundie Way, Laurel Street and surrounding streets are residential and should remain so.

- A1 *Officer's response:* At this stage the City is focussing traffic management on the local distributor roads, which are 9-10 metres wide. As far as the local streets are concerned, there are no immediate plans to undertake traffic management treatments unless the major roads have been addressed.

Mr Mitch Sideris, 12 Page Drive, Mullaloo:

Mr Sideris spoke in support of the previous speaker.

Mr George Samardali, 1 Mullaloo Drive, Mullaloo:

Mr Samardali addressed the meeting and raised his concerns at antisocial activities in the park.

Mr Peter Woods, 13 Marjorie Street, Mullaloo:

Mr Woods addressed the meeting and raised concern in relation to the tavern development and parking issues.

- Q1 What will the consultation process be in relation to the tavern? Will another plan be made and presented for consultation, and will Council again meet with the community to discuss its concerns?*

- A1 *Officer's response:* The Council has extended the public consultation period for 35 days, which extends to 4 April 2002. The plans may be viewed in the Council offices and officers are available to assist if required. Alternative arrangements could be made for those persons unable to attend Council's offices.

- Q2 Is the proposal five storeys?*

- A2 *Officer's response:* Five storeys in part. There is a level of retail/café/restaurant at street level of the tavern, with 15 residential-type units above, of which 10 are serviced apartments. Some of the units are single level and some two-storey.

Discussion ensued in relation to Council's former and current policy in relation to height of development.

Elector (no name or address provided):

Q1 Does Council have a Building Code, and can you clarify the policy in height requirements?

A1 Officer's response: The gentleman is welcome to meet and discuss the matter with Council staff, however currently there is no height policy for that commercial land.

CLOSE OF BUSINESS

There being no further business, the Mayor declared the meeting closed at 2127 hrs.