

**CONTRACT COST EVALUATION**

Mix Type	% of Contract	Downer EDI Works Pty Ltd		Pioneer Road Services Pty Ltd		Asphaltech Pty Ltd (Option A)		Asphaltech Pty Ltd (Option B)		Roads 2000 Pty Ltd		Boral Asphalt (WA)	
		Job Size Rates	All Tonnage Rates	Job Size Rates	All Tonnage Rates	Job Size Rates	All Tonnage Rates	Job Size Rates	All Tonnage Rates	Job Size Rates	All Tonnage Rates	Job Size Rates	All Tonnage Rates
Supply, Delivery and Laying of Asphalt													
AC14	6%	135,000	140,000	144,000	Did not submit All Tonnage rates	122,000	112,000	117,120	107,520	134,000	134,000	140,000	140,000
AC10	12%	272,000	282,000	268,000		228,000	228,000	218,880	218,880	276,000	276,000	256,000	280,000
AC7	6%	138,000	143,000	149,000		126,000	116,000	120,960	111,360	144,000	144,000	140,000	140,000
SMA10	3%	85,500	85,500	118,000		91,500	76,500	87,840	73,440	85,500	79,500	92,500	81,000
SMA7	48%	1,245,000	1,320,000	1,215,000		1,177,500	1,185,000	1,130,400	1,137,600	1,192,500	1,192,500	1,125,000	1,215,000
SMA5	16%	415,000	440,000	445,000		400,000	400,000	384,000	384,000	410,000	410,000	375,000	405,000
Laterite SMA8 1% Red Oxide	3%	105,000	97,500	175,000		132,500	107,500	127,200	103,200	114,500	99,500	119,000	90,500
Supply on City Trucks ex-Plant													
10mm	4%	51,000	51,000	69,000	-	64,800	64,800	62,208	62,208	62,400	62,400	64,320	64,320
TOTAL		2,446,500	2,559,000	2,583,000	-	2,342,300	2,289,800	2,248,608	2,198,208	2,418,900	2,397,900	2,311,820	2,415,820

## SUMMARY OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Option	Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Demonstrated experience in completing similar services	Social and economic effects on the local community				
Downer EDI Works Pty Ltd	Yes	Large organisation with experienced employees. Included org. chart, safety policy and equipment. City's contract would be 15% of operational capacity.	Demonstrated good understanding of requirements with sample programme of works provided.	Have significant experience in completing similar services to local govt. and other organisations.	No response to criterion. Located in Maddington.	75%	Job Size	\$2,446,500	3
All requirements have been met.							All Tonnage	\$2,559,000	
Pioneer Road Services Pty Ltd	Yes	Large national company with 78 Perth employees. Experience of 3 key staff detailed and safety policy and equipment list provided.	Provided a brief statement addressing work methodology. Covers major aspects of work.	Demonstrated reasonable amount of experience with works of a similar nature.	No response to criterion. Located in Hazelmere.	71.5%	Job Size	\$2,583,000	4
All requirements have been met.									
Asphaltech Pty Ltd (Option A)	Yes	Experienced company in operation since 1994. Provided full staff structure, experience of staff, safety policy and equipment. City's contract would be 10% of operational capacity.	Provided well structured response including work flow chart, statement addressing methodology and example of construction control form.	Provided details of comprehensive experience in completing similar services for local government and other companies.	Would use local suppliers where possible, are based in Malaga.	77%	Job Size	\$2,342,300	2
All requirements have been met.							All Tonnage	\$2,289,800	

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Option	Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Demonstrated experience in completing similar services	Social and economic effects on the local community				
Asphaltech Pty Ltd (Option B)		Experienced company in operation since 1994. Provided full staff structure, experience of staff, safety policy and equipment. City's contract would be 10% of operational capacity.	Provided well structured response including work flow chart, statement addressing methodology and example of construction control form.	Provided details of comprehensive experience in completing similar services for local government and other companies.	Would use local suppliers where possible, are based in Malaga.	77%	Job Size	\$2,248,608	2
All requirements have been met.							All Tonnage	\$2,198,208	
Roads 2000 Pty Ltd	Yes	Small organisation with 21 experienced staff. Included brief safety statement and list of equipment. City's Contract would be 1/3 of operational capacity	Demonstrated a good understanding of the requirements, including a work process statement in submission.	Demonstrated a reasonable amount of experience with contracts of a smaller value than that of the City.	20% of employees are Joondalup residents. Based in Malaga.	64.9%	Job Size	\$2,418,900	5
All requirements have been met.							All Tonnage	\$2,397,900	

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Option	Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Demonstrated experience in completing similar services	Social and economic effects on the local community				
Boral Asphalt (WA)	Yes	Very large national organisation with new high capacity asphalt plant in Perth. Provided a full list of equipment, safety policy and experience & responsibilities of staff. City's contract would be small percentage of operational capacity.	Demonstrated good understanding of the requirements. They have comprehensive work processes and are quality assured.	Have demonstrated significant experience in completing works of a similar nature for local government and Best Roads.	No response to criterion. Located in Welshpool.	77.4%	Job Size	\$2,311,820	1
Most requirements have been met. Seeks to clarify Refusal Voids clause prior to entering into contract with City.							All Tonnage	\$2,415,820	