

SUMMARY OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Capacity	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Linfox Armaguard Pty Ltd t/a Armaguard	No	Not Assessed						
The Offer submitted by Armaguard was non compliant. It contained numerous departures from the requirements of the Request for Tender (RFT). The evaluation panel unanimously agreed that these departures, particularly its proposed amendments to Clause 7.2 of the RFT, represented a potential higher commercial and financial risk to the City.								

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Capacity	Social and economic effects on the local community			
West-Sure Group Pty Ltd t/a Secure Cash Logistics	Yes	It has been in the security industry for 9 years. The company has a team of key personnel with extensive industry experience ranging from 8 years to 18 years. It has several major clients of which the company provides similar services and they include Wilson Parking, Town of Vincent, Woolstores Shopping Centre, St John of God Hospital Murdoch, Curtin University and Edith Cowan University.	It has demonstrated sound understanding of the required tasks. The company has been providing similar cash collection services for 9 years. Its Submission included outlines of the processes to undertake the work. Most of its collections teams are two man operations, however, should the risk be found to be nominal then a single man will be dispatched with a CCTV monitored and GPS tracked vehicle. It will transfer the reconciled funds via Electronic Fund Transfer (EFT) to the City's nominated bank account at the end of each working day.	It commenced operations in 2000, providing a range of security services which include static guard, mobile patrol, and cash collection, counting and banking services in WA. It also provides alarm services in the Northern Territory. The company now employs 20 full time employees and 9 casual staff for the provision of services in WA and 3 full time employees and 1 casual staff at its Karratha operations. It has a fleet of 12 vehicles, most have CCTV equipment and all have GPS and Mobile Data terminals fitted. Its cash room is access controlled and has extensive CCTV internally and externally. It has an OH&S policy in place.	A small WA business, it operates from 3 sites with offices located in Morley and Karratha, WA and the Northern Territory.	87%	\$417,157	1
All requirements have been met								

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Capacity	Social and economic effects on the local community			
CTi Risk Management	Yes	It has demonstrated experience in completing similar projects. Examples of work completed in the past, and currently undertaken, include cash collection, counting and reconciliation for Mobil Petroleum (2004 to 2007), and collection of notes and coins for IGAs Ellenbrook, Swanview and Leeming (engaged in October 2008) and collection and transportation of money cassettes from approximately 850 assorted ticket machine for the City of Perth Parking (2008 to 2013).	It has demonstrated understanding of the required tasks as it has in the past completed similar projects for a number of major clients and is currently undertaking similar cash collection from parking ticket machines and associated services for the City of Perth.	It was established in 2004, offering primarily international protection services overseas and a small component of cash services in WA. Its WA office currently has 16 Security Officers and up to 10 vehicles on the road daily. It has an OH&S policy and procedures in place.	A small WA business with its office located in O'Connor, WA and its director resides in Hillary.	80%	\$477,834	3
All requirements have been met								

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Capacity	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Dodds Co Pty Ltd t/a Electrodry	Yes	It has only been in the coin collection and reconciliation business for 12 months. The most recent project undertaken involves weekly cash collections from a large number of vending machines from all over the Perth metropolitan areas. It currently has a 5 year contract, which expires in 2011, with Australia Post in the parcel delivery area. Its Submission provided insufficient information to demonstrate experience in completing similar projects.	It has demonstrated some understanding of the required tasks. Its Submission has provided an outline of the processes to undertake the required tasks. However, the company has only been providing cash collections, but from vending machines, for 12 months.	It commenced operations in 2003. It has 2 working directors, 2 full time employees and 3 part time staff. Its response to each of the criteria was brief.	It is a family business located in Quinns Rocks, WA.	42%	\$587,907	6
All requirements have been met								

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Capacity	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Black Diamond Protection Pty Ltd	Yes	A newly established company which commenced operations in November 2008. It has a management team with industry experience, with its Managing Director having previously worked for Cash Logistics and Security and personally managed the day to day operations of the City of Perth Ticket Machine Coin Collection contract for over 2 years. Its current clients include Dominos Pizza (6 stores) and Angus and Coote (2 stores).	It has provided a comprehensive response and included outlines of the processes and procedures for undertaking the cash collections and associated services. Its Managing Director has in the past managed similar cash collections for the City of Perth.	It has 72 full time employees including 61 licensed security officers and 8 cash-in-transit officers. Its Submission included details of its support team and resources proposed for the Contract. Details of specialized equipment such as coin counting machine, CCTV, monitored alarm system were provided. It operates with its internal Quality Management System.	A local supplier with its office in Joondalup.	71%	\$720,544	5
All requirements have been met								

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Capacity	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Newcrest Security & Investigations Services Pty Ltd	Yes	It has 18 years experience in operating a Security and Investigations firm and over 15 years experience in providing cash collection, collation and dissemination services for government and private organizations in WA. Since its inception, it has provided a wide range of guard, patrol and cash collection services to over 300 clients in WA. Its Submission included references of similar works that the firm completed and they were for the provision of cash collection services for Westralia Airports Corporation, Synergy and the City of Perth.	It has demonstrated understanding of the required tasks being involved in the cash collection industry for 15 years. Though its core area of works is predominantly in the provision of security services, its Submission included a number of references to cash collections undertaken by the firm.	Formerly known as FAL Security, it is well established and equipped with a range of marked and unmarked vehicles. It owns its own site with modern building equipped with full security, CCTV and other devices which include a coin/notes counting and recording machine. Its main focus is in the provision of a "first class" security service & has received a commendation presented by the WA Police Commissioner for its code of conduct stance, knowledge and the excellent training it delivers in support of law enforcement. It operates with its own internal quality management system and has an OH&S Policy in place.	Is a solely owned and operated WA company located in Malaga.	75%	\$1,175,624	4
All requirements have been met								

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Capacity	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Chubb Security Services Ltd	Yes	Has vast experience in the logistics and management of cash which involves a diverse range of activities such as transportation of cash and valuables in a variety of vehicle types, counting, processing and banking on behalf of its customers, ATM supply, replenishment and funding services, and the like. Chubb currently provides ticket vending machine coin and cash collection, verification and banking for the City of Subiaco (since 2002), Town of Cambridge and Wilson Security – Public Transport Authority (from 2007).	It has sound understanding of the required tasks through its vast experience in successfully providing similar services to a variety of organizations which include State and Local Government. Its Submission included a time line, listing each of the tasks for carrying out the cash collection services.	Is a specialist division of Chubb Australia. It has staff level in excess of 120 people in its WA office. The proposed Contract Manager has 22 years experience in security services and 14 years as Chubb Manager Customer Services in WA. It has a WA team of customer service representatives and its WA office has a fleet of over 30 vehicles, both armoured and covert. Its Central Base includes processing units in notes and coin counting, cash room and vaults. It also has in house vehicle servicing facility.	It is a national company with offices across Australia. Its WA office is located in North Perth.	86%	\$1,232,510	2
All requirements have been met								

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Capacity	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Brink's Australia Pty Ltd	Yes	It has demonstrated experience in completing similar projects. The company is a long established global firm with focus in providing a comprehensive range of secure logistics and cash management services that can be tailored to client's needs. It has in the past completed similar services for the City of Fremantle and Murdoch University (from 2003 to 2006).	It has been providing secure logistics and cash management services for decades. It has in the past completed similar services for the City of Fremantle.	It was founded in 1859 and now employs 39,000 personnel worldwide with 160 employees based in Australia. Its WA office operates a fleet of 6 vehicles, 5 armoured and 1 non-armoured, and an authorized cash counting facility with 25 employees, which includes 5 in administration, 4 in cash-room and 16 armed security officers.	It is a large international business with its head office located in the US and its WA branch is located in Belmont. It currently services several local businesses in Joondalup on an ad hoc basis.	71%	\$1,351,968	5
All requirements have been met								