

## SUMMARY OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS

| Respondent & Description of Response    | Is it Compliant?<br>Yes or No | Comment Against Criteria                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | Evaluation Score | Price                                                                         | Rank |
|-----------------------------------------|-------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------|
|                                         |                               | Capacity                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks                                                                                                                                                                       | Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | Social and economic effects on the local community                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |                  |                                                                               |      |
| The City of Wanneroo (Conforming Offer) | Yes                           | Its Waste Services Business Unit has been in operation since the City of Wanneroo's inception. The Unit has 3 sub-units: Domestic and Recycling; Commercial; and Bulk. It has up to 65 drivers, 3 Supervisors, a Co-ordinator and a Manager to oversee its day to day operations. It has a dedicated Customer Service Centre with 3 customer Service Officers. It has an accredited Quality Management System to ISO9001 and owns its Waste Services fleet. It also has a Safety Management System in place. | It has sound understanding of the required tasks as its Waste Services Unit has been providing a range of waste management services which includes bulk verge collections for the City of Joondalup for over a decade. | It has extensive experience in providing a complete range of waste management services for its residents. It has also for the past 10 years been providing similar services for the City of Joondalup. These services include domestic waste collection, combined bulk waste and greens collection and commercial waste collection. | Its Waste Services Unit is located in Wanneroo. It has a number of staff residing within the City of Joondalup & indirectly creates employment opportunities for local businesses. The Unit operates its own Greens Recycling Facility in Wangara. Large quantities of diesel & other fuels will be purchased from local service stations within the City of Joondalup. | 93%              | \$11,371,834 (Option 1)<br>\$12,167,232 (Option 2)<br>\$17,891,684 (Option 3) | 1    |
| All requirements have been met          |                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |                  |                                                                               |      |

| Respondent & Description of Response                                                                                                             | Is it Compliant?<br>Yes or No | Comment Against Criteria                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |                                                  |                                                        |                                                    | Evaluation Score | Price                   | Rank |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------|------------------|-------------------------|------|
|                                                                                                                                                  |                               | Capacity                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks | Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects | Social and economic effects on the local community |                  |                         |      |
| The City of Wanneroo (Alternative 1)                                                                                                             | Yes                           | Refer above comments on its conforming offer<br>Note: Its offer (alternative 1) proposed an earlier collection start time of 6:20 a.m. which was considered a minor variation to the start time of 7:00 a.m. stated in the Request (Clause 2.3.2.9 Hours of Work). |                                                  |                                                        |                                                    | 93%              | \$10,617,921 (Option 1) | 1    |
| Proposed earlier collection start time of 6.20am                                                                                                 |                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |                                                  |                                                        |                                                    |                  | \$11,361,013 (Option 2) |      |
| The City of Wanneroo (Alternative 2)                                                                                                             | Yes                           | Offer rejected in accordance with Clause 4.9 of conditions of tendering.                                                                                                                                                                                           |                                                  |                                                        |                                                    |                  | "At Cost plus 5%"       |      |
| Proposed 'At Cost plus 5%' price basis.                                                                                                          |                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |                                                  |                                                        |                                                    |                  |                         |      |
| Transpacific Cleanaway Pty Ltd                                                                                                                   | Not fully compliant           | -                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | -                                                | -                                                      | -                                                  | -                | -                       | -    |
| All requirements have not been met. Not compliant with Clause 3.3 Compliance Criteria.<br>Not compliant with Clause 7.2 Price Basis & Variations |                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |                                                  |                                                        |                                                    |                  |                         |      |

| Respondent & Description of Response | Is it Compliant?<br>Yes or No | Comment Against Criteria                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |                                                    | Evaluation Score | Price                                                                         | Rank |
|--------------------------------------|-------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------|------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------|
|                                      |                               | Capacity                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks                                                                                                                                                                 | Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects                                                                                                                                                                            | Social and economic effects on the local community |                  |                                                                               |      |
| Alvito Pty Ltd t/a Incredible Bulk   | Yes                           | Incredible Bulk became an entity in 2005, though its parent company Alvito Pty Ltd has been involved in bulk refuse collections for the past 19 years. It has an extensive range of plant and equipment, a fully equipped workshop and a dedicated customer service centre. A list of trucks and bobcats for kerbside collections has been provided with its Submission. It has an OH&S Policy in place. A copy of its safety manual was included in its Submission. | It has demonstrated understanding of the required tasks as the company has been in the waste collection industry for many years. It included a set of its monitoring procedures and tasks for waste collections. | It is currently providing waste collections for the Towns of Cambridge, Bassendean and Mosman Park. It also assists the City of Wanneroo, the City of Swan and the City of Stirling in their waste collections from time to time. | It is located in Neerabup, WA.                     | 76%              | \$13,527,162 (Option 1)<br>\$13,527,162 (Option 2)<br>\$17,430,522 (Option 3) | 2    |
| All requirements have been met       |                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |                                                    |                  |                                                                               |      |

**OPTION 1**

**Collection and delivery of clean green waste and rubbish to nominated site on a nine (9) monthly rolling schedule**

| <b>Estimated Cost Per Year</b> | <b>City of Wanneroo (Conforming Offer)</b> | <b>City of Wanneroo (Alternative 1)</b> | <b>Incredible Bulk</b> |
|--------------------------------|--------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------|------------------------|
| Year 1                         | \$2,112,175.00                             | \$1,972,145.00                          | \$2,512,500.00         |
| Year 2                         | \$2,190,325.48                             | \$2,045,114.37                          | \$2,605,462.50         |
| Year 3                         | \$2,271,367.52                             | \$2,120,783.60                          | \$2,701,864.61         |
| Year 4                         | \$2,355,408.12                             | \$2,199,252.59                          | \$2,801,833.60         |
| Year 5                         | \$2,442,558.22                             | \$2,280,624.94                          | \$2,905,501.45         |
| <b>Total (5 Years)</b>         | <b>\$11,371,834.34</b>                     | <b>\$10,617,920.49</b>                  | <b>\$13,527,162.16</b> |

**OPTION 2**

**Collection and delivery of clean green waste and rubbish to nominated site on a six (6) monthly rolling schedule**

| <b>Estimated Cost Per Year</b> | <b>City of Wanneroo (Conforming Offer)</b> | <b>City of Wanneroo (Alternative 1)</b> | <b>Incredible Bulk</b> |
|--------------------------------|--------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------|------------------------|
| Year 1                         | \$2,259,910.00                             | \$2,110,165.00                          | \$2,512,500.00         |
| Year 2                         | \$2,343,526.67                             | \$2,188,241.11                          | \$2,605,462.50         |
| Year 3                         | \$2,430,237.16                             | \$2,269,206.03                          | \$2,701,864.61         |
| Year 4                         | \$2,520,155.93                             | \$2,353,166.65                          | \$2,801,833.60         |
| Year 5                         | \$2,613,401.70                             | \$2,440,233.81                          | \$2,905,501.45         |
| <b>Total (5 Years)</b>         | <b>\$12,167,231.46</b>                     | <b>\$11,361,012.60</b>                  | <b>\$13,527,162.16</b> |

**OPTION 3**

**Collection and delivery of clean green waste and rubbish to nominated site annually, to occur during the first 6 months of the year; and another collection and delivery of clean green waste only to nominated site, to occur during the second half of the year.**

| <b>Estimated Cost Per Year</b> | <b>City of Wanneroo (Conforming Offer)</b> | <b>City of Wanneroo (Alternative 1)</b> | <b>Incredible Bulk</b> |
|--------------------------------|--------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------|------------------------|
| Year 1                         | \$3,323,155.00                             | \$3,102,780.00                          | \$3,237,500.00         |
| Year 2                         | \$3,446,111.74                             | \$3,217,582.86                          | \$3,357,287.50         |
| Year 3                         | \$3,573,617.87                             | \$3,336,633.43                          | \$3,481,507.14         |
| Year 4                         | \$3,705,841.73                             | \$3,460,088.86                          | \$3,610,322.90         |
| Year 5                         | \$3,842,957.87                             | \$3,588,112.15                          | \$3,743,904.85         |
| <b>Total (5 Years)</b>         | <b>\$17,891,684.21</b>                     | <b>\$16,705,197.30</b>                  | <b>\$17,430,522.39</b> |