

SUMMARY OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Australian Asset Protection Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	Established in 2005 with an office located in Subiaco, Perth. Employ 9 FTE's in Perth office and 180 security officers. No details of key personnel provided. Minimal details provided on specialised equipment and local infrastructure. Indicated that a 24 hour contact number would be available. No details provided on control room, emergency requirements.	No experience demonstrated for community patrols. Minimal local government experience provided. Experience demonstrated was more for static patrols and event control.	Details provided appear to be generic and not tailored to the requirements of the City. Details of methodology, protocols and procedures provided but were of a generic nature.	Little information was provided that demonstrated an understanding of this criterion. Local businesses would be used to purchase Goods and Services where appropriate	42.4%	\$999,278.28	6

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Newcrest Security and Investigations Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	Established in 1990 with an office located in Malaga. No details provided on number of FTE's employed. Details of the company structure were provided but no details of key personnel. No details of specialized equipment and local infrastructure, but indicated that personnel were available 24/7. Only details of Managing Director were provided.	No experience demonstrated for community patrols. WA contracts are mainly for static guards, building security checks, mobile random patrols and alarm responses. No local government experience provided.	Details provided appear to be generic and were referenced for the City of Swan and not tailored to the requirements of the City. Details of protocols and procedures were provided.	A basic understanding was provided but did not address criteria in detail.	43.8%	\$993,447.00	5

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>Southern Cross Protection Pty Ltd</p> <p>All requirements have been met.</p>	Yes	<p>Employees 400 FTE's nationwide with its main office in NSW. Only four (4) key personnel in the Perth office and new personnel would need to be employed if awarded the City contract. Only general details of specialized satellite tracking equipment provided. Operates a 24hr national response centre but no details provided on its location. No details of after hour's contacts provided.</p>	<p>No experience demonstrated for community patrols. WA contracts mainly for building security checks, random patrols and alarm responses. Some local government experience but did not elaborate on type of services provided.</p>	<p>Demonstrated little understanding of requirements and advised that a transition plan was included in their offer, but details were not provided. Services to be provided were generic and did not appear to be tailored for the requirements of the City.</p>	<p>Little information was provided that demonstrated an understanding of this criterion. Local businesses would be used to purchase Goods and Services where appropriate.</p>	44.15%	\$1,589,516.76	4

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Charter Security Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	Established in 1996, head office in Melbourne and an office in Perth with 34 FTE's. No location of Perth office provided or company structure. Details of key personnel not provided. Only details of GPS equipment provided and minimal details on local infrastructure but indicated that personnel were available 24/7. No information on control room provided. Details of safety and management provided.	Minimal details provided which were for retail businesses and static guards and little experience demonstrated for community patrols. Contracts are mainly for retail building security checks, loss management, random patrols and alarm responses. Some local government experience demonstrated but minimal details provided on types of services undertaken.	Demonstrated an understanding of the requirements and provided a transition plan. Details of services to be provided were reasonably generic and were not specific for the requirements of the City.	Reasonable understanding of this criteria and proposed to use local businesses for the purchase of goods and services.	58.4%	\$1,250,797.00	3

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
MSS Security	Yes	MSS Security have branches throughout Australia and employees 707 FTE's in Perth and 4,500 employees Australia wide. Perth office located in Osborne Park and company is well structured, has all the appropriate specialized equipment and key personnel are very skilled and have extensive experience. A 24/7 operations centre is locally based. Safety Management guidelines provided.	MSS Security have a significant client base with BHP Billiton, Collie Power Station, Wesfarmers CSBP and other large private organizations, and Parliament House for State Government. No experience was demonstrated for local government. Security services provided appear to be more building security and alarm responses. Long term contracts are held demonstrating client satisfaction.	MSS Security demonstrated a very good understanding of the requirements and provided a methodology and detailed transition plan to provide the required level of service and understanding of the requirements to meet KPI's.	Patrol vehicles would be serviced by local businesses and understanding of social effects on the community was demonstrated.	79.1%	\$1,007,009.64	2
All requirements have been met.								

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Wilson Security All requirements have been met.	Yes	Established in 1992, employees 600 FTE's in Perth with its main office located Belmont. Company is well structured, has appropriate specialized equipment and skilled operators. Key personnel very skilled with extensive experience. A 24/7 operations centre is located in Belmont and detailed methodology provided. Comprehensive safety management policy provided.	Fully demonstrated extensive experience in undertaking and completing similar contracts for both local and state governments, and private organizations. Wilson Security is the current service provider and have provided a high standard of service delivery to date. Commitment to long term contracts was demonstrated.	Demonstrated a comprehensive understanding of the requirements, KPI's, and ability to provide the required service level and outcomes. A detailed methodology was provided that further demonstrated a complete understanding of local government and COJ requirements. Success factors were identified with complete measurement systems provided.	Patrol vehicles are serviced by local businesses and the understanding of social effects on the community was fully demonstrated.	95.6%	\$1,285,869 (Option 2)	1