

SUMMARY OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price for each individual location	Rank
		Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the requirements	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Devco Holdings Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	Demonstrated comprehensive experience in projects of similar size & nature. Values ranged \$40,000 to \$2.5 million.	In operation since 1986 with 11 employees. Provided org chart & experience, qualifications & role for all employees. Provided full list of equipment, a/h contacts, safety policy & ability to provide additional resources.	Demonstrated good understanding of requirements. Addressed general work methodology, comprehensive construction programs, site supervision & sub-contractors.	Based in Wangara. Have employees living locally and use local supplier and sub-contractors where possible.	78.1%	Forrest Park \$978,800 Seacrest Park \$1,361,720 Fleur Freame Pavilion \$1,736,000	1
Midland Constructions Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	Demonstrated experience in projects of similar nature including renovations, upgrades & asbestos removal. Values ranged \$100,000 to \$16 million.	In operations since 2004 with 25 employees. Provided org chart & experience, qualifications and role for 9 staff. Provided details of equipment, a/h contact, safety plan & ability to provide additional resources.	Demonstrated good understanding of requirements. Provided construction programs, site supervision & sub-contractors.	Based in Bayswater. They would use local sub-contractors where possible.	75.5%	Forrest Park \$800,000 Seacrest Park \$1,170,000 Fleur Freame Pavilion \$1,820,000	2

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price for each individual location	Rank
		Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the requirements	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>KMC Group</p> <p>All requirements have been met.</p>	Yes	Demonstrated experience in completing projects of a similar size and value to the City's project.	In operation 20+ years with 11 employees. Provided details of experience, qualifications and role for 9 key employees. Provided details of a/h contact. Have a safety plan in place. Did not address equipment or additional resources.	Demonstrated good understanding of requirements. Addressed general work methodology, comprehensive construction programs, site supervision & sub-contractors.	<p>Based in Willetton.</p> <p>Have staff who live in local area and use local trades where possible.</p>	72.9%	<p>Forrest Park \$1,027,800</p> <p>Seacrest Park \$1,273,200</p> <p>Fleur Freame Pavilion \$1,827,600</p>	3
<p>Tricrest Investments Pty Ltd T/as Tricrest Construction</p> <p>All requirements have been met.</p>	Yes	Demonstrated experience in projects of similar nature including alterations & additions. Values ranged \$450,000 to \$1.3 million.	In operation since 1998 with unknown no. of employees. Provided details of experience, qualifications and role for 3 key employees. Provided details of a/h contact, equipment, safety plan & additional resources.	Demonstrated good understanding of requirements. Provided brief work methodology, comprehensive construction programs, site supervision & sub-contractors.	<p>Based in Osborne Park.</p> <p>They use local sub-contractors, employ local staff and support local sport groups.</p>	71.8%	<p>Forrest Park \$969,569</p> <p>Seacrest Park \$1,416,752</p>	4

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price for each individual location	Rank
		Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the requirements	Social and economic effects on the local community			
CPD Group Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	Demonstrated experience in 10 projects of similar nature including refurbishment works. Values ranged \$25,000 to \$900,000.	In operation since 1994 with 65 staff. Provided an org chart & experience, qualifications & role for 8 key staff. Provided details of safety plan & ability to provide additional resources. Did not provide list of equipment or a/h contact.	Demonstrated good understanding of requirements. Addressed pre-start, general work methodology, provisional construction programs and site supervision.	Based in Welshpool. 25% of their employees reside in the City. They use local businesses & trades where possible.	71.7%	Forrest Park \$1,028,230 Seacrest Park \$1,358,410 Fleur Freame Pavilion \$1,845,340	5
Unifine Pty Ltd T/as Merit Projects All requirements have been met.	Yes	Demonstrated experience in 14 recent projects of similar nature. Values ranged \$3.6 million to \$16 million.	In operation since 1991 with 22 employees. Provided an org chart & experience, qualifications and role for 7 key employees. & details of safety plan. Did not address a/h contact, ability to provide additional resources or equipment.	Demonstrated understanding of requirements. Provided provisional construction programs & nominated site supervision. Did not address general work methodology.	Based in Perth. Criterion not addressed.	69.9%	Forrest Park \$993,396 Seacrest Park \$1,489,749 Fleur Freame Pavilion \$2,027,898	6

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price for each individual location	Rank
		Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the requirements	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Palace Homes & Construction Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	Demonstrated experience in projects of similar nature such as clubrooms & kitchens. Values ranged \$30,000 to \$1.2 million.	In operation for 14 yrs with unknown no. of employees. Provided details of experience, and role for 4 employees. Provided details of a/h contact & safety plan. Additional resources was not addressed.	Demonstrated understanding of requirements. Provided construction programs for each site, site supervision & sub-contractors.	Based in Inglewood. They use local sub-contractors where possible.	67.9%	Forrest Park \$767,768.78 Seacrest Park \$1,147,928.69	7
Classic Contractors All requirements have been met.	Yes	Demonstrated experience in projects of similar nature such as refurbishments & a sports pavilion. Values ranged \$330,000 to \$1.3 million.	In operation since 1995 with 23 staff. Provided an org chart & experience, qualifications and role for 7 key employees. & details of safety plan. Did not address a/h contact, ability to provide additional resources or equipment.	Construction programs were supplied supporting their understanding of requirements. A list of sub-contractors was included. They did not address site supervision or a general work methodology.	Based in Willetton. Criterion not addressed.	65.5%	Forrest Park \$843,038 Seacrest Park \$1,297,180 Fleur Freame Pavilion \$1,894,500	8

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price for each individual location	Rank
		Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the requirements	Social and economic effects on the local community			
West Coast Contraction & Demolition Pty Ltd	Yes	Not addressed adequately. No experience of company was listed other than experience of 3 key staff.	In operation since 2008 with an unknown no.of staff. Supplied basic org chart & experience & qualifications for 3 key staff & details of safety plan. Did not address equipment or ability to provide additional resources.	Construction programs were supplied supporting their understanding of requirements. Site supervision was nominated. They did not address general work methodology. Sub-contractors details were not supplied.	Based in West Perth.	50.4%	Forrest Park \$927,253	9
All requirements have been met.								
Briklay Pty Ltd T/as Briklay Builders	Yes	Demonstrated experience in projects such as houses, units, offices & schools. Values ranged \$150,000 to \$10 million.	Unknown number of years in operation with 14 staff. The experience of their staff was not sufficiently addressed. They did not address equipment, a/h contact, additional resources or safety.	Provided only provisional construction programs and details of 2 sub-contractors. Insufficiently addressed.	Based in Bellevue.	43.9%	Forrest Park \$1,120,237	10
All requirements have been met.								
Niche Construction WA Pty Ltd	No							
Late Tender. Not assessed.								

Tenderer Name	Forrest Park	Seacrest Park	Fleur Freame Pavilion	A+B	A+C	B+C	A+B+C
	A	B	C				
Devco Holdings Pty Ltd	\$978,800.00	\$1,361,720.00	\$1,736,000.00	\$2,293,709.60	\$2,660,504.00	\$3,035,765.60	\$3,994,989.60
Midland Construction Pty Ltd	\$800,000.00	\$1,170,000.00	\$1,820,000.00	\$1,920,750.00	\$2,554,500.00	\$2,915,250.00	\$3,600,500.00
KMC Group	\$1,027,800.00	\$1,273,200.00	\$1,827,600.00	\$2,301,000.00	\$2,855,400.00	\$3,100,800.00	\$4,128,600.00
Tricrest Investments Pty Ltd t/as Tricrest Construction	\$969,569.00	\$1,416,752.00		\$2,386,321.00			
CPD Group Pty Ltd	\$1,028,230.00	\$1,358,410.00	\$1,845,340.00	\$2,276,999.97	\$2,749,160.96	\$3,149,978.10	\$4,007,812.09
Unifine Pty Ltd T/as Merit Projects	\$993,396.00	\$1,489,749.00	\$2,027,898.00	\$2,483,145.00	\$3,021,294.00	\$3,517,647.00	\$4,456,043.00
Palace Homes & Construction Pty Ltd	\$767,768.78	\$1,147,928.69		\$1,884,249.65			
Classic Contractors	\$843,038.00	\$1,297,180.00	\$1,894,500.00	\$2,140,218.00	\$2,737,538.00	\$3,191,680.00	\$4,034,718.00

Forrest Park	Seacrest Park	Fleur Freame Pavilion	Total
Midland Construction Pty Ltd			\$3,600,500
Palace Homes & Construction Pty Ltd \$1,884,250	Devco Holdings Pty Ltd \$1,736,000		\$3,620,250
Midland Construction Pty Ltd \$1,920,750	Devco Holdings Pty Ltd \$1,736,000		\$3,656,750