

## SCHEDULE OF ITEMS

ITEM	PLANT TYPE
<b>VARIOUS PLANT TO BE SUPPLIED <u>WITH</u> AN OPERATOR</b>	
<b>1</b>	<b>Backhoe</b>
1A	With extended hoe
	Size 300
	Size 600
	Size 900
1B	Without extended hoe
	Size 300
	Size 600
	Size 900
<b>2</b>	<b>Excavator</b>
2A	1.5 tonne
2B	3.5 tonne
2C	5 tonne
2D	10 tonne
2E	22 tonne
<b>3</b>	<b>Rock Breaker</b>
3A	With backhoe or excavator
<b>4</b>	<b>Loader</b>
4A	Bucket capacity 1.5 m - 2 m <sup>3</sup> min. Breakout force 9500 kgf
4B	With clearing rake
<b>5</b>	<b>Skid Steer Loader</b>
5A	Skid steer with truck only
5B	Skid steer with truck and trailer
5C	Mini skid steer
<b>6</b>	<b>Tip Truck</b>
6A	6 wheel truck
6B	8 wheel truck
6C	Semi bogie truck
6D	Semi tri-axle truck
<b>7</b>	<b>Grader</b>
7A	Grader 120 h
<b>8</b>	<b>Hiab Crane Trucks</b>
8A	12 tonne tandem truck fitted with 6 tonne crane

ITEM	PLANT TYPE
<b>9</b>	<b>Slewing Cranes</b>
9A	12 tonne
9B	16 tonne
9C	40 tonne all terrain
9D	55 tonne truck mounted
9E	55 tonne all terrain
9F	80 tonne all terrain
9G	100 tonne
9H	130 tonne
9I	Transport of counterweight for 55 AT or larger when required
<b>10</b>	<b>Rigger / Dogman</b>
10A	Dogman
10B	Rigger
<b>VARIOUS PLANT HIRE TO BE SUPPLIED <u>WITHOUT</u> OPERATOR</b>	
<b>11</b>	<b>Rollers</b>
11A	Self propelled vibratory, min. operating - weight 6 tonnes, drum width 1670 mm dual amp and dual frequency
11B	Vibratory roller with operating weight 2-3 tonne (type CC10)
11C	Multi tyred 15-20 tonne ballasted cap
11D	Multi tyred 30 tonne ballasted cap

## SUMMARY OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Qualitative Rank	Price Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the requirements	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Environmental Land Clearing Services All requirements have been met.	Yes	In operation for 40+ yrs with 4 staff & some casual operators. The structure consists of the owner, partner (son) and 2 plant/truck operators. All are experienced operators. A list was supplied of the company's plant, plus the model numbers and year of manufacture. After-hours contact was supplied. Safe work procedures were provided for vehicles and plant. The company has had no safety incidents in the past 5 years.	The company demonstrated substantial experience completing various types of works in the past 27 years including vegetation control, loading & cartage of trees & mulch, construction works and fire-breaks. Specific dates were not supplied, References were City of Stirling, Advanced Earth & Grass Growers. It is the one of the City's current plant hire Contractors	Provided a brief response to the criterion that did not address methodology. There were however, some statements in the response to experience regarding supervision of work, maintenance of equipment/vehicles and not overloading trucks.	The company is located in Neerabup.  It purchases parts, special repairs and fuel from other local suppliers.	59.9%	1	3

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Qualitative Rank	Price Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the requirements	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>Tonca Earthmoving</p> <p>All requirements have been met.</p>	Yes	<p>Is a small company in business since 2000 with 2 staff &amp; 4 long-term sub-contractors. The experience of the personnel was provided with the qualifications of employees and sub-contractors. A list of plant was supplied consisting of 2 skid steer loaders, 2 6-wheel trucks and 1 single axle truck. Additional resources could be sourced from the Sub-Contractors. A safety management manual was provided</p>	<p>The company demonstrated experience undertaking work similar to the City's requirements for the City of Stirling and Town of Cambridge. Works included earthworks in playgrounds, beaches, parks and natural areas. Both contracts are current. A list of 10 references was supplied.</p>	<p>The company demonstrated an understanding of the requirements. The response addressed being part of a panel contract, the allocation of work and the types of tasks similar to its existing local government clients</p>	<p>The company uses local suppliers where possible.</p> <p>The company is located in Stirling.</p>	58.5%	2	7

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Qualitative Rank	Price Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the requirements	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Dalco Earthmoving All requirements have been met.	Yes	In operation for 25+ years with an unknown no. of staff. The names of the director and 2 managers were supplied. No information was provided detailing the experience of any of the personnel or the organisational structure other than a statement that its operators are experienced. It has more than 50 items of plant. After-hours contacts & a safety management policy & procedures were supplied. It did not provide same level of information as first two ranked Offers	Demonstrated experience providing similar services to the City of Melville, BGC, Millstream Landscapes and Wilmac Plumbing. It is one of the City's current plant hire Contractors. No specific dates were supplied for its client list. The references supplied were Wilmac Plumbing, City of Melville and the City of Joondalup	Dalco demonstrated a good understanding of the requirements. It supplies a large range of plant covering the majority of the City's requirements, with multiple quantities of many types of equipment. It has the ability to supply at short notice and is familiar with the requirements of local government and specifically the City as the one of the City's current Contractors	The company is located in Wangara.  No response addressed this criterion.	55.9%	3	1

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Qualitative Rank	Price Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the requirements	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>All Earth Group Pty Ltd</p> <p>All requirements have been met.</p>	Yes	<p>In operation for 10+ years with 59 staff &amp; 200 sub-contractors. The roles, responsibilities and experience of 9 key personnel were supplied. No details of equipment operators were provided. The company operates a fleet of 40+ plant. This was not substantiated with a list of the type of equipment with the model and year of manufacture. After-hours contact was supplied. Additional resources would be provided from large number of sub-contractors. A safety policy was supplied</p>	<p>It demonstrated experience in providing similar services to various private organisations, local government and statutory authorities. Some of the local governments are the Cities of Canning, Cockburn, Fremantle, Gosnells, Melville, Swan and Stirling. Specific dates were not supplied for the client list, however it was stated that work was either project-based, on-going or repeat business.</p>	<p>The company demonstrated an understanding of the requirements. A flow chart was supplied, which demonstrated the process for receiving an order, mobilisation of equipment, completion of works, clean site and invoicing. The company is based in Maddington. This is a considerable distance from Joondalup. This distance will impact on the company's ability to mobilise plant at short notice to the City.</p>	<p>The company is based in Maddington.</p> <p>The company engages several sub-contractors from the local area.</p>	54.7%	4	9

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Qualitative Rank	Price Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the requirements	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>Kwik Transport &amp; Crane Hire</p> <p>All requirements have been met.</p>	Yes	<p>In operation since the 1990's with 100+ staff for both cranes &amp; haulage drivers. The structure of the organisation was not supplied, but a list of certificates for all crane operators and dogmen was detailed and a list of names and roles for administration / crane / transport divisions. Full technical details of nine cranes in its fleet were supplied. Several after-hours contacts were supplied. Additional resources was not specifically addressed. Safety was not addressed</p>	<p>Three customer testimonials were supplied as evidence of the company's experience. The works undertaken included crane hire and transport of mining and air-conditioning equipment. No specific dates were provided, but the work was undertaken in the past 10-25 years. Three references were provided: Flortech, Pindan and BGC</p>	<p>The company did not provide a specific response to this criterion. The general description of the company and experience infers an understanding only</p>	<p>Main base in Malaga plus depots in Bibra Lake, Mandurah and Two Rocks.</p> <p>No response addressed this criterion.</p>	49.2%	5	5

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Qualitative Rank	Price Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the requirements	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Stampalia Contractors All requirements have been met.	Yes	In operation since 1977 with an unknown number of staff. An organisational chart was supplied. No specific information was provided for its staff. A list of its equipment was provided including excavators, skid steer loaders, a tip truck, semi-loader, front-end loaders, water tanker and rock breaker. No information addressed additional resources or after-hours contact. A safety policy manual was supplied, but no safety record.	The company has current contracts for earthmoving equipment with the Water Corporation and Mayday Earthmoving. It undertakes waste collection for the following local governments: Wanneroo, Swan, Stirling, Cambridge, Bassendean, Mosman Park and Peppermint Grove. It provided three references for earthmoving: the City of Wanneroo, Water Corporation and E.F.F.M.	No specific response was supplied for this criterion. The response addressing experience did provide some information of understanding of supply of plant and invoicing.	The company is located in Neerabup.  No response addressed this criterion.	45.8%	6	2



Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Qualitative Rank	Price Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the requirements	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>Miniquip</p> <p>All requirements have been met.</p>	Yes	<p>In operation since 1989 with 12 full-time and 5 casual staff. An organisational chart was supplied. No information was provided demonstrating the experience of the employees. The model numbers and age of equipment was provided. After-hours calls are directed to the Operations Manager. Additional resources were not addressed. A safety and health management plan was provided. No safety statistics were provided other than a statement that the work undertaken for the Shire of Mundaring was incident-free.</p>	<p>The company has provided excavation and rock-breaking plant to the City of Cockburn and the Shire of Mundaring. It has provided these services to the Shire of Mundaring for the past 12 years. No period and dates were supplied for any other Contract. Three references were supplied: Shire of Mundaring, William Electrical and Pullella Earthmoving</p>	<p>A brief response stated that it would supply excavators, skid steer loaders and six wheel tip trucks for either wet or dry hire. Twenty-four hours notice is required for bookings and travel to and from the City would be 1 hour. The distance the company is from the City is a prohibitive factor for emergency and short-notice requirements.</p>	<p>The company is located in Bibra Lake.</p> <p>No response addressed this criterion.</p>	45.2%	8	6

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Qualitative Rank	Price Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the requirements	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Pondplan Excavating All requirements have been met.	Yes	In operation for 12 years. It has three operators. No specific information was supplied demonstrating the experience of its employees. A list of equipment was supplied. This included an excavator, a loader, mini excavators a skid steer loader and shredder. An after-hours contact was supplied. Additional resources were not addressed. A brief statement was made on safety. No policy or procedures were provided. The company has had no safety incidents.	The company did not provide specific examples of work undertaken, however it did provide a general description of the type of work it is able to undertake. No periods and dates of Contracts were supplied. It provided six references (Shire of Mt Marshall, Pemberton DEC, NAMS, Main Roads, Lazenby Contracting and SMRC)	No specific response addressed this criterion. The type of work the company can undertake was stated in the Offer, but no methodology was supplied.	Has bases in Gingin, Hamilton Hill and Henley Brook.  No response addressed this criterion.	35.1%	9	8



Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Qualitative Rank	Price Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the requirements	Social and economic effects on the local community			
J & V Earthmoving Contractors All requirements have been met.	Yes	in operation for 30+ years. with an unknown number of employees. No organisational structure or details of any of its employees was supplied. Employees have blue cards and the appropriate permits to operate machinery. A list of nine pieces of equipment was supplied. This included skid steer loaders, excavators, trucks and trailers. A mobile number was supplied for after-hours contact. Additional resources were not addressed. The company stated it follows the Town of Claremont safety policy, but did not supply a copy or any safety record	The company provided three examples of work completed in the past 12 months. The scope for these included demolition, playground equipment removal, road and footpath construction works, rubbish removal and green waste removal. These tasks are similar in scope to the City's requirements for plant hire. The references supplied were the Town of Claremont, Shire of Peppermint Grove and Royal Agricultural Society.	No specific response addressed this criterion.	The company is located in North Beach.  No response addressed this criterion.	32.2%	11	4

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Qualitative Rank	Price Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the requirements	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Harris Hire Shops All requirements have been met.	Yes	An equipment hire business in operation since 1998. It has an unknown number of employees. The owner has previous experience working with Mayday Hire. One rate was provided for a vibratory roller. No information was provided for additional resources, after-hours contact or safety.	No response addressed this criterion other than the supply of three references, one of which was illegible. The other two references were City of South Perth and KTB.	No response addressed this criterion.	The company has locations in Canning Vale, Upper Swan and Forrestfield.  No response addressed this criterion.	9.6%	12	10
Sherrin Rentals Late Tender received after the tender closing time.	No	Non-compliant not assessed						

## SUMMARY OF PRICE ASSESSMENT

Item	Description	Tonca Earthmoving	Stampalia Contractors	Dalco Earthmoving	Pondplan Excavating	Harris Hire Shops	J & V Earthmoving	All Earth Group Pty Ltd	MCD Excavator Hire	Jake Smith Excavations	Miniquip	Environmental Land Clearing Services	Kwik Transport & Crane Hire
2A	Excavator 1.5 tonne		\$168,525	\$152,320	\$163,200			\$179,175	\$195,840		\$167,552		
6B	8 wheel tip truck	\$190,170	\$180,270	\$190,170				\$212,835				\$179,605	
2C	Excavator 5 tonne		\$125,800	\$133,650			\$115,800	\$155,725			\$141,075		
4A	Loader Bucket capacity 1.5 m - 2 m 3		\$38,400	\$54,250	\$46,340			\$83,770				\$38,010	
5A	Skid steer with truck only	\$11,753	\$15,450	\$11,592	\$14,490		\$19,002	\$17,400			\$12,880	\$16,905	
4B	Loader With clearing rake		\$12,500	\$16,200				\$19,100				\$11,550	
2B	Excavator 3.5 tonne			\$7,410	\$7,600		\$6,451	\$11,085		\$8,690	\$8,265		
5C	Mini skid steer		\$4,625	\$4,752									
6A	6 wheel tip truck	\$2,365		\$2,480	\$2,790		\$2,100	\$2,770			\$2,635		
3C	Rockbreaker 5 tonne			\$3,198									
3E	Rockbreaker 22 tonne			\$4,375									
6C	Semi bogie tip truck	\$2,160	\$2,040	\$2,196				\$2,280					
6D	Semi tri-axle tip truck	\$1,820		\$1,778				\$1,800					
2E	Excavator 22 tonne		\$1,375	\$2,060	\$1,290			\$2,145			\$1,035		
5B	Skid steer with truck and trailer	\$730	\$950	\$720			\$1,436	\$1,190					
10A	Dogman			\$504									\$420
11B	Vibratory roller with operating weight 2-3 tonne (type CC10)			\$1,460		\$1,741		\$3,200					
3B	Rockbreaker 3.5 tonne			\$540									
9B	Crane 16 tonne			\$828									\$888
11A	Self propelled vibratory, min. operating - weight 6 tonnes, drum width 1670 mm dual amp and dual frequency		\$450	\$600				\$860					
11C	Multi tyred 15-20 tonne ballasted cap			\$730									
<b>PRICE RANKING</b>		<b>7</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>12</b>	<b>11</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>5</b>

## LEGEND

	Lowest price
	2 <sup>nd</sup> lowest price
	3 <sup>rd</sup> lowest price