

SUMMARY OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Rank	Price (Year 1)
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Providing Similar Services	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Phoenix Motors Pty Ltd trading as Phoenix Holden and Clarkson Holden	Yes	Established in 1979, it now operates from 2 sites, Wangara and Clarkson. It employs more than 190 employees and has a total of 16 qualified automotive technicians and 13 automotive apprentices. It has a dedicated service manager at each of the sites who will be responsible for the management and quality control of the works under this Contract. The sites are equipped with all the required tools necessary to undertake the services and repairs. It has an OSH in place.	A brief response was provided. However, it stated that in 2009/10 the company carried out approximately \$5m worth of service and repairs work. It has also in the past supplied automotive products and services to the City of Joondalup. It indicated that service and repairs work are currently being carried out as required by all major Australian fleet companies. Referees were from the WA Police Department, Fleet Care and Easi Fleet.	It has demonstrated sound understanding of the required tasks. It has been in the automotive servicing industry for more than 20 years.	It is a WA company with operations in Wangara and Clarkson. The company employs about 200 people of which a significant number resides within the City of Joondalup.	80%	1	\$44,609 (Servicing) \$40,220 (Repairs)
All requirements have been met.								

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Rank	Price (Year 1)
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Providing Similar Services	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Wild West Hyundai	Yes	It is part of the Automotive Holdings Group (AHG), which is Australia's largest motoring group. This means it can access its network for all genuine parts as well as arrange new car warranty work on all makes and models. An organisational chart including a list of staff members, their roles, time at the company and industry experience were provided. It has a well equipped workshop with the most up to date equipment and technology available. In addition, it operates a fully self sufficient mobile service unit, designed to service all models of vehicles. It has an OSH policy in place.	It did not response specifically to this criterion. However, it has been providing similar works for the City of Joondalup and is the City's current contractor for light vehicle log book servicing and repairs. Referees included Wangara Car Hire, Mindarie Car Hire and Department of Child Protection.	It has demonstrated sound understanding of the required tasks. Log book servicing and repairs are part of the company's core services. It has also been providing similar service and repairs work for the City for the past 3 years.	It is a WA company located in Wangara.	80%	1	\$57,635 (Servicing) \$37,228 (Repairs)
All requirements have been met.								

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Rank	Price (Year 1)
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Providing Similar Services	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
G.T. Bristow-Stagg Pty Ltd trading as Carcare Lakeside	Yes	It has been trading since March 1997 and currently it employs 3 qualified motor mechanics and a 3 rd year apprentice. The owner is a member of the Motor Trade Association (MTA) of WA. Its workshop located in Joondalup is fully equipped and a list of equipment was provided. It will utilise a local towing company, Joondalup City Towing, for after hour's breakdown assistance. It will use Automotive Personnel to source additional staff for busy periods should the need arise. The company's workshop operates with safety procedures provided and supported by the MTA of WA.	It has demonstrated experience in providing similar services. Its current fleet customers are: Undercut Concrete Sawing and Drilling which has a small fleet of commercial vehicles; and Benchmark Designer Homes which has a small fleet of passenger including commercial vehicles. It has in the recent past completed similar works for Whitfords Car Hire which had a fleet of 45 passenger and commercial vehicles. The company has successfully completed similar log book servicing and repairs for the City from 2000 to 2004.	It has demonstrated sound understanding of the required tasks. It has been in the motor servicing and repairs industry for many years. The company has in the past successfully completed similar service and repairs work for the City.	It is a local company with its office and workshop located in Joondalup.	75%	2	\$42,263 (Servicing) \$40,060 (Repairs)
All requirements have been met.								

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Rank	Price (Year 1)
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Providing Similar Services	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
RAC Automotive Services Pty Ltd	Yes	It was established in 2004 and currently it employs approx. 140 employees across 8 operational sites. It has a team of experienced key personnel. It has provided details of personnel proposed for the Contract. A comprehensive list of specialised equipment that it will be used to carry out the work was also provided. The company has an OSH policy in place and a copy of its safety procedures manual was included in its Submission.	In 2009/10 it completed 64,000 service and repairs jobs across its 8 operational centres. It provided 3 examples of works and these were: for servicing and general repairs for RAC Motoring Pty Ltd; inspections for hail damaged vehicles and for international vehicles seeking a state driving permit for the Department of Planning and Infrastructure; and for servicing and repairing a fleet of approximately 20 vehicles for Matera Electrical.	It has demonstrated understanding of the requirements. The company has been providing similar services for a number of years. It did not indicate which of the various sites it would use for carrying out the servicing and repairs for the City. The panel is concerned if the City has to drop and or collect its vehicles from the various sites across the metropolitan area.	It is a WA company with its head office in Balcatta. It has 8 operational sites which are located in Joondalup, Balcatta, Morley, Osborne Park, Myaree, Bentley, Northbridge and Mandurah. It also has a call centre located in Joondalup which employs 250 people, majority being local residents.	68%	3	\$59,014 (Servicing) \$42,688 (Repairs)
All requirements have been met.								
Grand Toyota	No	Not assessed - non compliant tender						
All requirements have not been met.		Did not fully complete the pricing schedule, particularly, for Items 6.2, 8.4 and 13.1 in clause 3.4.3 of the RFT.						

SCHEDULE OF ITEMS AND MANUFACTURERS LOG BOOK SERVICE INTERVAL

Item 1 - 10,000 km Intervals from 10,000 km up to 80,000 km	
1.1	Year 2007/08/10, Honda Civic Hybrid FD3620, 1.3 litre engine, 4 cylinders, ULP fuel, auto transmission
1.2	Year 2006/08, Nissan TIIDA C11, 1.8 litre engine, 4 cylinders, ULP fuel, auto transmission
Item 2 - 10,000 km Intervals from 50,000 km up to 80,000 km	
2.1	Year 2008, Mazda 6-6B, 2.5 litre engine, 4 cylinders, ULP fuel, auto transmission
Item 3 - 10,000 km Intervals from 40,000 km up to 130,000 km	
3.1	Year 2006, Ford Courier PH, 4x4 drive, 2.5 litre engine, 4 cylinders, DSL fuel, manual transmission
Item 4 - 10,000 km Intervals from 110,000 km up to 130,000 km	
4.1	Year 2006, Mazda B2500, 4x2 drive, 2.5 litre engine, 4 cylinders, DSL fuel, manual transmission
Item 5 - 10,000 km Intervals from 100,000 km up to 130,000 km	
5.1	Year 2006, Toyota Hiace TRH201R, 2.7 litre engine, 4 cylinders, ULP fuel, auto transmission
Item 6 - 10,000 km Intervals from 10,000 km up to 130,000 km	
6.1	Year 2007/08, Ford Ranger PJ, 4x2 drive, 3.0 litre engine, 4 cylinders, DSL fuel, auto transmission
6.2	Year 2007, Ford Ranger PJ, 4x4 drive, 3.0 litre engine, 4 cylinders, DSL fuel, auto transmission
Item 7 - 10,000 km Intervals from 40,000 km up to 130,000 km	
7.1	Year 2007, Holden Rodeo LX, 4x2 drive, 3.0 litre engine, 4 cylinders, DSL fuel, manual transmission
Item 8 - 10,000 km Intervals from 10,000 km up to 130,000 km	
8.1	Year 2007/08/10, Toyota Hiace KDH201R, 3.0 litre engine, 4 cylinders, DSL fuel, auto transmission
8.2	Year 2007, Toyota Hiace KDH201R, 3.0 litre engine, 4 cylinders, DSL fuel, manual transmission
8.3	Year 2008, Ford Ranger PJ, 4x2 drive, 3.0 litre engine, 4 cylinders, DSL fuel, manual transmission
8.4	Year 2008, Ford Ranger PJ, 4x4 drive, 3.0 litre engine, 4 cylinders, DSL fuel, manual transmission
8.5	Year 2008, Toyota Hilux KUN26R, 4x4 drive, 3.0 litre engine, 4 cylinders, DSL fuel, manual transmission
8.6	Year 2009/10, Toyota Hilux TGN16R, 4x2 drive, 2.7 litre engine, 4 cylinders, ULP fuel, auto transmission
8.7	Year 2010, Nissan Navara D40, 4x4 drive, 2.5 litre engine, 4 cylinders, DSL fuel, auto transmission

SCHEDULE OF ITEMS AND MANUFACTURERS LOG BOOK SERVICE INTERVAL ... cont'd.

Item 9 - 10,000 km Intervals from 90,000 km up to 150,000 km	
9.1	Year 2006, Toyota Commuter KDH221, 3.0 litre engine, 4 cylinders, DSL fuel, auto transmission
Item 10 - 10,000 km Intervals from 20,000 km up to 150,000 km	
10.1	Year 2008, Toyota Coaster XZB50, 4.1 litre engine, 4 cylinders, DSL fuel, auto transmission
Item 11 - 15,000 km Intervals from 15,000 km up to 75,000 km	
11.1	Year 2008, Holden Astra AH, 1.8 litre engine, 4 cylinders, ULP fuel, auto transmission
11.2	Year 2009/10, Hyundai Getz TB, 1.6 litre engine, 4 cylinders, ULP fuel, auto transmission
11.3	Year 2008, Toyota Camry ACV40, 2.4 litre engine, 4 cylinders, ULP fuel, auto transmission
Item 12 - 15,000 km Intervals from 15,000 km up to 135,000 km	
12.1	Year 2005, Ford Transit VJ, 2.4 litre engine, 4 cylinders, DSL fuel, auto transmission
12.2	Year 2006/07/08, Ford Falcon BF, 4 litre engine, 6 cylinders, LPG fuel, auto transmission
12.3	Year 2009, Ford Falcon FG, 4 litre engine, 6 cylinders, LPG fuel, auto transmission
12.4	Year 2008, Ford Falcon XT, 4 litre engine, 6 cylinders, LPG fuel, auto transmission
12.5	Year 2008, Holden Commodore VE, 3.6 litre engine, 6 cylinders, Dual fuel, auto transmission
12.6	Year 2007, Holden Commodore VE, 3.6 litre engine, 6 cylinders, ULP fuel, auto transmission
Item 13 - 15,000 km Intervals from 60,000 km up to 135,000 km	
13.1	Year 2006/08, Mitsubishi Express SJ, 2.4 litre engine, 4 cylinders, ULP fuel, manual transmission
Item 14 - 15,000 km Intervals from 15,000 km up to 135,000 km	
14.1	Year 2008, Volkswagen Caddy 2KA, 1.9 litre engine, 4 cylinders, DSL fuel, auto transmission
14.2	Year 2010, Hyundai iLOAD WB, 2.5 litre engine, 4 cylinders, DSL fuel, auto transmission