

SUMMARY OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS

| Respondent & Description of Response | Is it Compliant? Yes or No | Comment Against Criteria | | | | Evaluation Score | Price | Rank |
|---|-------------------------------|--|---|---|---|------------------|--------------|------|
| | | Capacity | Demonstrated experience completing similar projects | Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks | Social and economic effects on the local community | | | |
| Curnow Group Pty Ltd All requirements have been met. | Yes | In operation for an unknown period of time & an unknown number of staff. An organisational chart was supplied and supported by the details of 8 staff. The experience of these employees is mostly civil construction. Two people have landscape construction experience. A list of equipment was supplied. An after-hours contact was not supplied. The resources and sub-contractors available for the contract were listed. The company's safety policy & safety statistics was supplied. | The company demonstrated substantial experience undertaking various civil projects. Some of these included landscape works. Eight references were supplied including: Cossill & Webbley, Cardno BSD, the City of Wanneroo and Porter Consulting. The referee comments were positive & confirmed a high level of satisfaction. The selected projects had minimal supervision, few variations & were completed on time and budget | Curnow Group Pty Ltd demonstrated a thorough understanding of the requirements. It provided a construction program which addressed all major components of the work. This was further supported by an itemised list of clarifications to the specification and a step by step description of the work methodology | The company is located in Joondalup. It uses other local suppliers and 50% of its employees reside in the City of Joondalup. | 68.4% | \$765,919.80 | 1 |

[illegible]

[illegible]

| Respondent & Description of Response | Is it Compliant? Yes or No | Comment Against Criteria | | | | Evaluation Score | Price | Rank |
|--------------------------------------|-------------------------------|--|--|---|--|------------------|-----------------------------------|------|
| | | Capacity | Demonstrated experience completing similar projects | Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks | Social and economic effects on the local community | | | |
| Environmental Industries Pty Ltd | Yes | In operation for 38 ⁺ years with 156 staff. Provided an organisational chart & supported by the experience, role and qualifications of 14 staff. Pictures were provided of some equipment the company owns. It was stated it has a \$5 million investment in plant & equipment, although a specific list was not supplied. An after-hours number was supplied. Additional resources were not addressed. A safety statement was made, but no evidence of a policy or procedure was supplied. | The company demonstrated experience in completing works of a similar nature to the City's project. Seventeen projects were listed supporting its experience. The company completed the last stage of landscaping of Burns Beach Road for the City. | A work process addressed the main components of the work. Clarification was sought from the company regarding its Offer. This revealed that it did not allow for expansion joints in the concrete paving & the removal of 50mm not the required 150mm depth of material had been allowed for in the Offer. The number of man hours per week allocated to the consolidation period was considered insufficient by the evaluation panel. The responses to the clarification points demonstrate a lack of understanding of critical components of the project. | The company is located in Canning Vale. The company uses other local suppliers and sources contract/temporary personnel locally where possible. | 46.2% | \$547,743 (Original) | 4 |
| All requirements have been met. | | | | | | | \$641,880 (With clarification) | |