APPENDIX 16 ATTACHMENT 1

SUMMARY OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS

		Comment Against Criteria						
Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
Curnow Group Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	In operation for an unknown period of time & an unknown number of staff. An organisational chart was supplied and supported by the details of 8 staff. The experience of these employees is mostly civil construction. Two people have landscape construction experience. A list of equipment was supplied. An after- hours contact was not supplied. The resources and sub- contractors available for the contract were listed. The company's safety policy & safety statistics was supplied.	The company demonstrated substantial experience undertaking various civil projects. Some of these included landscape works. Eight references were supplied including: Cossill & Webbley, Cardno BSD, the City of Wanneroo and Porter Consulting. The referee comments were positive & confirmed a high level of satisfaction. The selected projects had minimal supervision, few variations & were completed on time and budget	Curnow Group Pty Ltd demonstrated a thorough understanding of the requirements. It provided a construction program which addressed all major components of the work. This was further supported by an itemised list of clarifications to the specification and a step by step description of the work methodology	The company is located in Joondalup. It uses other local suppliers and 50% of its employees reside in the City of Joondalup.	68.4%	\$765,919.80	1

TENDER 020/11 LANDSCAPING SERVICES FOR BURNS BEACH ROAD, JOONDALUP

		Comment Against Criteria						
Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
Earthcare landscapes Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	Established in 1989 with an unknown number of staff. The role and responsibilities of 2 staff was provided with a brief description of 5 staff & their titles only. The nominated supervisor for the project previously supervised the first stage of the Burns Beach Road landscaping. A list of equipment was provided. After-hours contact was supplied. Additional resources were not addressed. A comprehensive safety document was supplied.	3 recent examples of work addressed the company's experience. Each had elements of similarity to the City's project including landscaping on a major road requiring traffic management. Three references were supplied. These were: National Lifestyle Villages, PRM Property and the City of Melville. The reference check comments were positive & confirmed a high level of satisfaction. All projects had minimal supervision, few variations & were completed on time and budget.	The company demonstrated a thorough understanding of the requirements. The major components of the work were addressed in the methodology and supported by a Gantt chart.	The company is located in Bibra Lake. The company supports local community activities such as community planting in projects.	58%	\$738,555.75	2

ATTACHMENT 1

TENDER 020/11 LANDSCAPING SERVICES FOR BURNS BEACH ROAD, JOONDALUP

•		Comment Against Criteria						
	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
GHEMS Holdings Pty Ltd T/as GHEMS Revegetation Environmental All requirements have been met.	Yes	In operation for 30 ⁺ years in Bassendean with an unknown number of staff. An organisational chart was provided with the qualifications and experience of 12 key staff. The staff have more experience in environmental types of work rather than simple landscaping. A full list of the company's equipment was supplied. After- hours contact and additional resources were not addressed. A comprehensive safety management policy was supplied	The company demonstrated experience in completing revegetation works, but did not demonstrate sufficient experience in completing hard landscaping works. Three references were provided and were Thiess, Western Power and Main Roads	The company demonstrated an adequate understanding of the requirements. The work methodology briefly addressed traffic management, weed eradication, earthworks, paving and plants.	The company is located in Bassendean. The company will utilise local suppliers where possible.	46.7%	\$1,089,331	3

TENDER 020/11 LANDSCAPING SERVICES FOR BURNS BEACH ROAD, JOONDALUP

	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria						
Respondent & Description of Response		Capacity	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
Environmental Industries Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	In operation for 38 ⁺ years with 156 staff. Provided an organisational chart & supported by the experience, role and qualifications of 14 staff. Pictures were provided of some equipment the company owns. It was stated it has a \$5 million investment in plant & equipment, although a specific list was not supplied. An after- hours number was supplied. Additional resources were not addressed. A safety statement was made, but no evidence of a policy or procedure was supplied.	The company demonstrated experience in completing works of a similar nature to the City's project. Seventeen projects were listed supporting its experience. The company completed the last stage of landscaping of Burns Beach Road for the City.	A work process addressed the main components of the work. Clarification was sought from the company regarding its Offer. This revealed that it did not allow for expansion joints in the concrete paving & the removal of 50mm not the required 150mm depth of material had been allowed for in the Offer. The number of man hours per week allocated to the consolidation period was considered insufficient by the evaluation panel. The responses to the clarification points demonstrate a lack of understanding of critical components of the project.	The company is located in Canning Vale. The company uses other local suppliers and sources contract/temporary personnel locally where possible.	46.2%	\$547,743 (Original) \$641,880 (With clarification)	4