

TENDER 022/11 PROVISION OF MARINE AND CIVIL ENGINEERING CONSULTANCY SERVICES

SCHEDULE OF ITEMS

Item	Description	UOM
1	Principal Marine Engineer	Per Hour
2	Marine Engineer	Per Hour
3	Principal Civil Engineer	Per Hour
4	Civil Engineer	Per Hour
5	Principal Structural Engineer	Per Hour
6	Structural Engineer	Per Hour
7	Disbursements	Per Item

SUMMARY OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price Rank	Qualitative Rank
		Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the requirements	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>Worley Parsons Services Pty Ltd (Conforming Offer)</p> <p>Was offered on the basis that an alternative price escalation formula incorporating the CPI and a reputable industry report such as the Mercer report would be considered by the City. The alternate price escalation could be considered by the City if Worley Parsons Services Pty Ltd offered significantly higher quality of services or no other Respondent was considered suitable.</p>	Partially	The company demonstrated extensive experience providing engineering services. 21 example projects were provided supporting its experience. Some of these include the Coral Bay Boating Facility, Emu Point and Bremer Bay maritime facilities, Challenger Boat harbour, Joondalup Administration building remedial works, Burns Beach road duplication. 4 references were provided. These are: Department of Transport and the Cities of Perth, Stirling and Rockingham	In operation since 1971. It has 32,900 staff worldwide & 100 engineers/ designers in its WA office. An organisational chart was supplied & supported by details of the staff nominated for structural, civil and marine engineering. CVs were also provided. No specific response addressed additional resources; however it has sufficient in-house resources. The company's safety policy and safety record was supplied.	The company demonstrated a comprehensive understanding of the requirements. The response addressed the work methodology for each engineering discipline and made specific reference to the relevant sections of the specification.	<p>The company is located in the Perth CBD.</p> <p>The company has current staff who reside in the City. It will endeavour to engage local residents for the delivery of surveys and data collection.</p>	78.7%	Civil 2 Structural 4 Marine 7	1

[illegible]

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price Rank	Qualitative Rank
		Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the requirements	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>ARUP Pty Ltd</p> <p>Was offered subject to two qualifications to the conditions of contract. These items were not deemed to increase Contractual risk to the City.</p>	Partially	It demonstrated substantial experience providing civil, structural & marine engineering services through 26 example contracts. These included significant marine-based projects such as Marina Bay Waterfront Promenade in Singapore, Sanctuary Cove in QLD, the Riverside project in the Perth CBD, Fremantle seawall, Darwin Marine supply base, Green Island Groyne in Cairns, the Joondalup Police Academy & other construction projects. 3 references were supplied from KBR, Fremantle Ports and Lime Tree Capitol Investors	In operation since 1963. It has 1,575 staff across Australasia. An organisational chart was provided & supported by details of 14 key staff. CVs were also provided. The proposed team for marine engineering is based in QLD. This is a concern for the Ocean Reef Marina Project. The location of the team may impact on the delivery of services to the project. A/H contact was supplied. Additional resources would be sourced in-house. It has a safety system in place & provided its safety record	ARUP Pty Ltd demonstrated a comprehensive understanding of the requirements. The response addressed design and documentation, feasibility studies, concept and preliminary design and costing, review and preparation of specifications, the tender process, contract administration and management.	<p>The company is located in West Perth.</p> <p>The company utilises local suppliers where possible and engages with the public and existing community groups as part of its consultation process when undertaking projects.</p>	75.4%	Civil 11 Structural 9 Marine 9	3

[illegible]

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price Rank	Qualitative Rank
		Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the requirements	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>AECOM</p> <p>Offer subject to amendments to two (2) conditions of contract and proposed four (4) new clauses. The proposed amendments and new clauses do not increase the risk to the City</p>	Partially	The company demonstrated significant experience in civil, coastal, electrical and structural engineering projects. The response provided 9 civil, 14 coastal, 2 electrical and 12 structural example projects. Examples included large scale civil projects, various marina and harbour projects and structural design of various public and community facilities. Six references were supplied from: City of Perth, City of Stirling, Department of Planning, Peet Limited, South Perth Yacht Club and the East Fremantle Yacht Club.	Commenced in 1990 with 45,000 staff worldwide and more than 600 in WA. An organisational chart was provided and supported by the details of 15 key staff including CVs. A/H contact & additional resources was not specifically addressed, although the company has more than sufficient resources to call upon for any requirements the City may have. The company has an integrated safety management system. A brief safety policy was supplied with the safety record of the past 3 years.	AECOM demonstrated a comprehensive understanding of the requirements. The response addressed the types of services to be undertaken, project management, reporting, meetings and contract administration. A further breakdown of tasks within the civil, coastal and structural disciplines was also provided.	<p>The company is located in the Perth CBD.</p> <p>The response did not address any of the assessable items of being situated locally, utilising local suppliers, employing local residents or supporting local community activities.</p>	73.5%	Civil 4 Structural 8 Marine 5	5

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price Rank	Qualitative Rank
		Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the requirements	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>GHD Pty Ltd</p> <p>Offer from GHD Pty Ltd was subject to several qualifications to the conditions of contract and tendering. It was included for further assessment on the basis that if GHD Pty Ltd offered a significantly higher quality of services or no other Respondent was considered suitable the amendments could be considered.</p>	Partially	An extensive list of projects completed for various engineering disciplines such as coastal marine and harbours, civil, transport infrastructure, water supply and structural. The scope was briefly described for each project. Various projects had elements of similarity to the City's requirements. Six references were supplied. These are: Geraldton Port Authority, Port of Townsville, City of Perth, City of Wanneroo, Main Roads WA and the Town of Victoria Park	Commenced in 1928 & WA office in 1972. It has 6,000 employees worldwide and 600 in the WA office. A chart of the various departments of the company was provided and an organisational chart provided the structure of the proposed team for the contract. This was supported by the CVs of the team members. Two after-hours contacts were supplied and additional resources would be sourced in-house. A safety policy, chart of the company's safety system and safety record was supplied.	The company demonstrated a good understanding of the requirements. The response addressed the services to be undertaken as stated in specification, a general methodology and approach to projects and included specific information on investigations and design, a communication strategy and recording of modifications to plans.	<p>The company is located in the Perth CBD.</p> <p>The company would use other local suppliers where possible.</p>	72.7%	Civil 4 Structural 3 Marine 8	6

[illegible]

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price Rank	Qualitative Rank
		Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the requirements	Social and economic effects on the local community			
URS Australia Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	The company demonstrated experience in completing projects in marine, civil and structural engineering disciplines. Examples of civil/structural, road, bridge and marine based projects were supplied supporting the company's experience. Periods and dates were provided for each example project. Four references were supplied. These are: Henderson Group, Northerly Group, Mindarie Regional Council and the Shire of Broome.	In operation for 30 yrs with more than 160 staff in WA and 46,000 worldwide. Ten key personnel were nominated for the City's Contract. The names, position, qualifications, industry experience and length of service were provided for each proposed team member. This was further supported by a CV for the key personnel. Three after-hours contacts were supplied. The source of additional personnel was not addressed. A safety policy and safety record was supplied.	URS Australia Pty Ltd demonstrated sufficient understanding of the requirements. The response addressed management of the panel contract, communication with the City and management of individual projects and the management of resources.	The company is located in the Perth CBD. The company uses local suppliers where possible and employees local residents.	69.3%	Civil 3 Structural 2 Marine 2	8

[illegible]

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price Rank	Qualitative Rank
		Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the requirements	Social and economic effects on the local community			
TABEC Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	TABEC Pty Ltd demonstrated considerable experience in completing various civil engineering projects. An extensive list of residential projects and some projects with a water component were provided as evidence of the company's experience. Dates and periods of the projects were supplied for all examples. Three references were supplied. These were Landcorp, Benchmark Projects and Cedar Woods.	In operation for 11 yrs with 22 staff. It has 8 engineers and nominated 4 staff to the City's Contract. The structure of the company was described and supported by CVs of key personnel. Three after-hours contracts were provided. Additional resources would be sourced in-house for general civil services and specialist services would be obtained from sub-consultants. All technical staff have attended safety awareness training. A sample of contract conditions for safety was supplied.	The company demonstrated a good understanding of the requirements. The response addressed the key issues associated with civil infrastructure projects and provided a three phase methodology addressing local structure planning, subdivision planning and detailed design and construction management.	The company is located in East Perth. The company would utilise local suppliers where possible.	63.9%	Civil 10 Marine 10	10

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price Rank	Qualitative Rank
		Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the requirements	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Cardno (WA) Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	Cardno (WA) Pty Ltd demonstrated a satisfactory level of experience completing similar projects. Some of the examples included a canal development, marina development, Hiillarys Boat Harbour north harbour wall construction, residential subdivision, water conservation study and design of the West Coast dual use path upgrade for the City. Twelve references were provided including the Cities of Gosnells, Armadale, Swan, Cockburn and the Shires of Capel, Victoria Plains and Gold Coast City Council.	Cardno (WA) Pty Ltd has 3,000 employees worldwide. It has been in operation for an unknown period of time and did not state the number of staff in WA. An organisational chart was provided and supported by the CVs of relevant key personnel. An after-hours contact was not supplied. Additional resources were not specifically addressed. No response addressed safety.	The company did not adequately address its understanding of the requirements. The response was general in nature and did not provide a specific methodology addressing the scope of works.	The company is located in Subiaco. Local companies would be sourced and utilised where possible.	50.1%	Civil 7 Structural 7 Marine 4	11

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price Rank	Qualitative Rank
		Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the requirements	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Wave Solutions – A Division of Danisman Pty Ltd	Yes	The company demonstrated experience in providing civil engineering services through nineteen example projects. The majority of these were in the mining industry, but also included a greenfield subdivision in Perth and a water treatment plant in Collie. Three references were supplied. These are: Qube Property Group, SMRC and BHP Billiton Iron Ore	The company has been in operation for an unknown period of time. It has 9 staff in its civil and infrastructure department. A brief structure was described and CVs were provided for 8 of the key personnel. After-hours contact was addressed in the communications section of the response. Additional resources were not addressed. Safety was not individually addressed; however it was referenced in the quality assurance response	The company demonstrated an adequate understanding of the requirements. A flow chart demonstrated the general work process. The response also addressed project delivery, standards, communication, reporting and key performance indicators. The marine consultancy services will be provided by sub-contractors	The company is located in Osborne Park. The response to this criterion did not address any of the assessable items of being situated locally, utilising local suppliers, employing local residents or supporting local community activities.	47.3%	Civil 5 Structural 7 Marine 11	12
All requirements have been met.								

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price Rank	Qualitative Rank
		Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the requirements	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Kleyweg Consulting Pty Ltd	Yes	Brief examples of work undertaken since January 2011 were provided as evidence of the experience of the company. These included engineering services and feasibility reports. The main consultant is a former experienced employee of Worley Parsons and has recently started the consultancy firm. Five references were provided. These are: Public Transport Authority, City of Stirling, TPG, Dynamic Planning and Graeme Morris Project Planning	In operation since January 2011 with 2 staff. CVs were supplied for the staff. They have 18 & 5 years experience in civil & traffic engineering respectively. It nominated Serling Consulting & Development Remediation Strategies as sub-consultants. . A brief description of the experience & qualifications of the staff was supplied. An A/H contact was provided. Additional resources could be discussed with the City. The company has had no safety incidents since inception. It does not have a safety policy.	A brief response was supplied to this criterion. The main consultant's prior experience with the City of Joondalup through his previous employer (Worley Parsons) was supplied as evidence of knowledge of the City's work requirements. The response also briefly addressed the importance of timeframes, meetings and correspondence	The company is located in Guildford. The company would use local suppliers where possible.	45.8%	Civil 9	13
All requirements have been met.								

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price Rank	Qualitative Rank
		Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the requirements	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Woolacotts Consulting Engineers Pty Ltd	Partially	The company demonstrated experience providing a wide range of civil and structural engineering services to local government in the eastern states of Australia. No periods and dates were provided demonstrating the currency of the projects. It is currently undertaking the Kalgoorlie Regional Prison project for the Department of Treasury and Finance. Three references were provided. These are: Department of Treasury and Finance, David Payne Constructions and Sydney City Council	The company has been in operation for more than 80 years and recently established an office in WA. It has 131 staff in total across Australia and 8 in WA. The structure of the company was described with each persons name, experience & qualifications. This was supplemented by CV's of the personnel. After-hours contact and additional resources was not addressed. The company stated that it is committed to safety, but did not provide any safety policy or record	The company provided a brief response addressing its understanding of the requirements. The company has several certified project management professionals. A brief methodology addressed project initiation, planning, execution, monitoring and control and close of project and a communications plan. The response was general in nature and did address the specification in detail	The company is located in the Perth CBD. The company would use local businesses for surveys, geotechnical investigations and the like.	42.9%	Civil 6 Structural 5	14
Compliance criteria responses were omitted.								

[illegible]

[illegible]

