

SUMMARY OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Pindan Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	It demonstrated a good understanding of requirements, providing a construction method statement, a provisional 48 week construction program & an outline of the Green Star accredited professional tasks. It has 2 accredited Green Star professionals & will also engage Wood & Grieve to manage the Green Star tasks. A list of 11 subcontractors were nominated in the submission for the project, however this did not include details of their previous experience, commitments or financial capability.	It has considerable experience completing similar projects. Examples include community buildings & leisure facilities for the Cities of Canning, Bayswater & Mandurah & the Shires of Murray, Roebourne & Ashburton. 3 projects are green star rated (2x 4star & 1x 5star). A profile of the nominated Green Star consultant (Wood & Grieve) was also provided. The firm has extensive experience providing services for Green Star rated projects.	It has been in operation since 1977 with more than 350 staff & 1,000 registered subcontractors. The structure of the company was described and supported by an organisational chart for the project team & the CVs of 6 key personnel, of which many have worked on previous Green Star rated projects and have extensive experience in the building industry. The equipment to be used in the project was supplied & the company has capacity to supply additional resources. An after-hours contact was not supplied.	The company endeavour to source 10% of its apprentices locally. The company is located in Belmont.	69.9%	\$4,026,923 \$95,851 (Car Park)	1

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Social and economic effects on the local community			
PS Structures Pty Ltd Security bond proposed in lieu of bank guarantee.	Partially	PS Structures demonstrated a good understanding of the requirements. It provided a construction method statement. A provisional 48 week construction program was supplied. An outline of the tasks to be undertaken by the Green Star accredited professional was supplied. IBMS Consultants have been nominated in this capacity for the project. Three subcontractors were nominated in the submission for the project. Details of the other subcontractors would be supplied upon award of the contract	PS Structures demonstrated substantial experience in construction projects with similarities to the City's project. A list of 22 projects was supplied. A further 5 projects were described in detail. These were a 6 star green rated building for A.I.M., the City of Wanneroo Library & Cultural Centre, Rio Tinto remote operations centre, FESA building & Cottesloe, Peppermint Grove & Mosman Park library, community centre & offices. The last listed project had many environmental features, but was not green star rated.	In operation since 2000 with 33 staff. An organisational chart was supplied with a chart for the proposed team & details of 7 key personnel. Although the source of the additional resources and personnel was not specifically addressed, the company has a network of subcontractors available for any additional requirements. The equipment to be used for the contract was not addressed other than details of a business management system. A copy of the company's safety system and safety record was supplied on a disk.	The company will use local suppliers and employ local residents where possible. The company is located in Balcatta.	66.3%	\$4,335,658 \$87,745 (Car Park)	2

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Devco Builders All requirements have been met.	Yes	Devco Builders demonstrated a satisfactory understanding of the requirements. The work will be carried out in accordance with the appropriate standards, but no actual construction method was supplied other than the provisional 44 week construction program. An outline of the tasks to be undertaken by the Green Star accredited professional (NDY Consultants) was supplied. A list of all the proposed subcontractors detailed their previous experience, commitments, financial capability and licences where applicable.	Devco Builders demonstrated experience completing refurbishment and extension works. The scale of the nominated 72 projects was limited; with the largest being \$2.5 million. 70% of the listed projects are below \$300,000 in value. None of the projects have any Green Star rating and no information was supplied of projects by its Green Star accredited professional. Referees included the Cities of Swan, Vincent and Bayswater, the MRC and the Department of Treasury and Finance.	It has been in operation since 1986 with approximately 29 employees. An organisational chart was supplied and supported by the roles, experience and responsibilities of five key personnel. A list of employees available for the contract was also supplied. A list of the company's equipment was supplied together with four after-hours contacts. A copy of the company's safety policy, safety record of the past 2 years, a safety management plan and job safety analyses were provided.	Devco Builders use local businesses and employ 3 City residents. The company is located in Wangara.	63.9%	\$4,278,336 \$81,565 (Car Park)	3

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Esslemont Cockram Construction All requirements have been met.	Yes	Esslemont Cockram Construction demonstrated an understanding of the requirements. A brief statement addressing the method of construction was supplied. A 46 week provisional construction program was supplied. An outline of the tasks to be undertaken by the Green Star accredited professional was supplied (in-house project manager). A list of proposed subcontractors was supplied, however this did not include details of their previous experience, commitments or financial capability	It demonstrated experience completing similar Green Star rated projects. Nine projects were described ranging in value from \$1.07 to \$46.2 million for community and school buildings and office fit-outs. The projects include 2 Green star design rated projects and one Green Star rated design & construct project. Clients include Hume City Council, Surf Coast Shire Council, Origin Energy & the Minister of Works. Referees were the Department of Treasury & Finance, SKM & Roger Gregson Architect.	In operation since 1861 in Australia with an unknown number of staff. Information was supplied of the company directors, CVs of six key staff and a general organisational chart. The company nominated two in-house Green Star accredited professionals. The company will use general construction equipment on the project. An emergency contact was supplied. A copy of the company's safety policy, safety record of the past 3 years, project safety plan and safety procedures and forms were provided	The company would seek to use local subcontractors. The company is located in Myaree.	62%	\$4,234,132 \$94,294 (Car Park)	4

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Gavin Construction All requirements have been met.	Yes	Gavin Construction demonstrated a satisfactory understanding of the requirements. A brief work methodology was supplied with a 43 week provisional construction program. A list of tasks to be undertaken by the Green Star accredited professional (Wood & Grieve Consultants) was supplied. A list of the nominated subcontractors was provided; however this did not include details of their previous experience, commitments or financial capability except for the nominated plasterer.	Gavin Construction demonstrated experience constructing similar or larger sized community facilities; however none were Green Star rated. Examples included youth centres, sports centre, a community hall and pavilion. The company is currently constructing a Green Star rated Blackwoods distribution centre in Karratha. 17 references were supplied including the Town of Kwinana, Shire of Roebourne and the Cities of Fremantle, Bayswater and Gosnells	Gavin Construction has been in operation for 40 years and 49 staff were listed on the company's organisational chart. A chart of the proposed project team was also supplied. Profiles of 19 key personnel detailed the role, qualifications and experience of each staff member. The company's general equipment is supplied by subcontractors and specialised equipment is hired when required. A copy of the company's safety policy, safety record of the past 5 years and a comprehensive safety management plan were provided	The company endeavours to use local suppliers where possible. The company is located in Como.	59.6%	\$3,937,642 \$79,832 (Car Park)	5

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Social and economic effects on the local community			
McCorkell Constructions Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	It demonstrated an understanding of the requirements. A statement of the method of construction set out all the general tasks and included green star items at commencement and completion of the project. This statement matched the supplied provisional program with completion of works in 41 weeks. An outline of the tasks carried out by the Green Star accredited professional was also provided. A list of the nominated subcontractors was provided; however this did not include details of their previous experience, commitments or financial capability	The company demonstrated experience completing construction projects. None were Green Star rated or for a community centre. 5 projects were described in detail with 2 having some water and energy efficiency features. A list of projects was also supplied. The value of the projects ranged from \$235,000 to \$20.1 million, with works varying from school refurbishments and additions to construction of a library. Two current projects are located in WA. One current project is for the City of Port Philip.	McCorkell Constructions has been in operation for more than 80 years in Australia and in WA since November 2011. 10 administration and supervisory staff and 30 on-site staff were listed. It was not clear how many employees are based in WA. A management team of three was proposed for the City's project. Details of these staff was supplied. The equipment to be used, after-hours contact and source of additional resources was not addressed. A copy of the company's safety policy and an OHS management plan was supplied. The company's safety record was not supplied.	The company stated that there may be direct/indirect employment resulting from the construction works and increased patronage of local catering facilities. The company's WA office is located in Subiaco.	53.8%	\$4,101,350 \$85,000 (Car Park)	6

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Social and economic effects on the local community			
FIRM Construction Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	FIRM Construction did not demonstrate an adequate understanding of the requirements. The company did not provide a statement of the method of construction or an outline of the tasks to be carried out by the Green star accredited professional. The company stated it will not be using subcontractors. The only information supplied was a provisional program which had completion of works in 10 months	The company demonstrated experience completing Green Star rated projects. Three example projects were supplied. These were a Women's Health Services building, a sport facility in York and a Department of Fisheries building. All are Green star rated. The Company is also currently completing two office buildings for Rio Tinto in the Pilbara. The nominated referees were: Hodge & Collard, Property Development Solutions, CODA Architects and Woodhead Architects	The company was established in 2003 with 56 staff. An organisational chart was supplied in the company's health, safety, environment and quality (HSEQ) document. A brief outline of six key staff was supplied. The company's nominated Green Star accredited professional is a consultant from NDY. A list of equipment & after hours contact was supplied. An overview of the company's HSEQ system was supplied, which included a safety policy. The company has had no lost time injuries in the past three years.	The company stated it was committed to engaging local personnel and local business	48%	\$4,967,251 \$81,565 (Car Park)	7

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Absecon Pty Ltd Cash retention proposed in lieu of bank guarantee	Partially	Absecon Pty Ltd did not demonstrate an adequate understanding of the requirements. The company did not provide a statement of the method of construction, an outline of the tasks to be carried out by the Green star accredited professional or any list of proposed subcontractors. The only information supplied was a provisional program which had completion of works in 42 weeks excluding delays for inclement weather, public holidays, RDOs and industry shutdown periods	It demonstrated experience completing projects with some similarity to the City's project. The projects include a sports clubroom, science lab refurbishment and education building, various school buildings, a small shop/ office building and extensions to a retirement village. No projects were Green star rated or had any listed environmental features. The referees were: Santelli Architects, Spotless, VDM Consulting, Hames Sharley, Montague Grant Architects & Elements Property Group.	Absecon is a member of the Pyramid Group with an unknown number of staff. Details of 3 key staff was provided including the Green Star professional, whose experience is primarily in building & asset maintenance, engineering and some efficiency designs in lighting and water. No experience was demonstrated in Green Star rated new builds. No equipment, source of additional resources or emergency contacts were supplied. The company has a safety policy in place.	Absecon Pty Ltd would seek to use local suppliers and employ local residents. The company is located in Osborne Park.	32.8%	\$4,264,914 \$74,000 (Car Park)	8