# SUMMARY OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS

			Comment Ag	ainst Criteria				
Respondent & Description of Response	Compliant? Yes or No	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
ARM Architecture All requirements have been met.	Yes	It has substantial experience in multi- storey car park projects in both open air and underground types. Examples included Perth Arena, Swanston Square and One East buildings in Melbourne and the Q&A building in Brisbane. The nominated sub- consultants, Red Engineers and Reeve & Associates, also demonstrated considerable experience in similar car park projects. The nominated referees were: Public Transport Authority, Grocon, Becton, Digital Harbour and QIC.	The company has been in operation since 1988. It has 65 staff. The structure of the project team was supplied and supported by a profile for each nominated team member setting out their role, qualifications and relevant experience. The company has the ability to draw upon staff from both its offices should additional resources be required. The safety policy, procedures and safety record of the company was not addressed	ARM Architecture demonstrated an excellent understanding of the project. The comprehensive response set out a detailed methodology for the four stages of the project, its design philosophy, project timeline and budget control measures	The company has offices in Melbourne and Perth. ARM Architecture are committed to the innovative use of ordinary building materials and strive for maximum impact without maximum cost.	69.3%	\$755,000	1

			Comment Ag	ainst Criteria				
Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
Hames Sharley (WA) Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	Hames Sharley (WA) Pty Ltd demonstrated significant experience completing large- scale multi-storey car park projects. Ten examples included the Elder Street car park for the City of Perth, Fiona Stanley Hospital staff and public car parks, State Rehabilitation Centre car park, Crown Burswood Entertainment Complex car park and QE II Medical Centre car park and four other projects. The nominated referees were: City of Perth, Brookfield Multiplex, Crown Burswood and Colonial First State	The company was established in 1975 and has more than 180 staff. The Perth office has 70 staff. A company overview was provided and supported by profiles of the four staff nominated to the City's project as well as its sub- consultant team. Additional resources and personnel would be supplied from its Perth office team of 70 staff. The company has a fully developed OHS management system in place. Its safety record was not supplied	Hames Sharley (WA) Pty Ltd demonstrated a good understanding of the requirements. The response addressed its appreciation of the project in terms of integration into the urban fabric, function, structural design options, accessibility and public safety, sustainability and the planning process. A workflow briefly setting out each project stage and its tasks was supplied and supported by an indicative project plan	The company has offices in six Cities across Australia. The company stated its commitment to supporting other West Australian businesses and the employment of architectural graduates and work experience students.	68.6%	\$601,400	2

			Comment Ag	ainst Criteria				
Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
Peter Hunt Architect	Yes	It demonstrated	It was established	Peter Hunt	The company has	67.6%	\$554,910	3
All requirements have been met.		experience completing multi- storey car parks. Two projects were a joint venture with Silver Thomas Hanley (Joondalup and Midland Health Campus car parks). The remaining 3 projects were: Gold Coast Convention Centre (2008), Council House and Basement Car park (1999/2000) and WA Basketball Stadium and Car Park (2009). The nominated referees were: Joondalup Health Campus, City of Perth, BGC/Perkins Builders, Dept of Sport & Recreation and Building Management and Works, Gold Coast Convention Centre and the City of Vincent	in 1970. It has 31 staff. An organisational chart was supplied and supported by details of the nominated team of 7 for the City's project. Profiles were provided for four of the team. A list of the nominated sub- consultants was provided, however supporting documentation was available on request only. The company has the resources to provide additional personnel from its two offices. The company has a written work health and safety policy. It has had no safety incidents.	Architects demonstrated a thorough understanding of the project. The methodology addressed initial design studies, current context, budget and brief, liaison with City's consultants, design criteria, site assessment, client communication, each stage of the project and an indicative project timeline.	offices in Perth and Sydney. The response addressed various social and economic benefits to the community of the completed car park, however none of these were applicable to the assessable criteria for the services provided under this contract, rather the construction phase and completed project.			

			Comment Ag	ainst Criteria				
Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
Woodhead Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	It demonstrated experience completing similar car park projects. It provided four examples: Adelaide central bus station car park, Adelaide airport car park, SA aquatic centre car park and design advisory services in the QEII Medical Centre car park project in WA. The South Australian projects were for car parks of four to six storeys. Two of the company's personnel nominated for the City's project worked on these projects. The nominated referees were: department of treasury, Adelaide City Council, Adelaide Airport Limited and Flinders University.	It was established in 1927 with 94 staff in total and 21 staff in Perth. A team of five has been nominated for the City's project. A CV for each member was provided. Additional resources are available from any of the company's other offices. Information on its nominated sub- consultant was also supplied. Woodhead Pty Ltd has a work, health and safety system in place and provided a copy of its safety policy in the submission. The company's safety record was not supplied.	The company demonstrated a good understanding of the requirements. The response addressed design approach, weekly milestones against each stage of the project, cost control, coordination of sub- consultants, communication and an indicative program.	The company has offices in five Australian capital cities and Singapore and Jakarta. The response addressed achieving a quality urban design outcome for the car park and obtaining the highest possible value for the lowest cost.	58.9%	\$476,500	4

			Comment Ag	ainst Criteria				
Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
Designinc Perth Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	Designinc Perth Pty Ltd demonstrated a good level of experience completing similar multi storey car parks. Six examples were provided. These include the QEII car park, Sydney domestic terminal car park, Sydney International terminal car parks 1 & 2, Susan Street car park and Woy Woy railway station commuter car park. (Concept & schematic design). The nominated referees were: Probuild, Auburn City Council and Sydney Airport Corporation Limited.	It has been in operation for an unknown period of time with more than 200 staff. An organisational chart was supplied and supported with the CVs of its nominated team of five staff for the City's project. The current workload of each team member was also supplied. It confirmed its capacity for the project and additional resources could be supplied from the Perth and Sydney offices. Safety management was not addressed.	The company demonstrated a good understanding of the requirements. The methodology and outcomes of the stages of brief formulation, schematic design, design development, contract documentation, building tender and assessment, contract administration and defects liability were provided. An indicative project timeline was also supplied.	The company has offices in Perth, Adelaide, Melbourne and Sydney. The company supports local businesses where possible.	58.3%	\$553,750	5

			Comment Ag	ainst Criteria				
Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
Gresley Abas Pty Ltd	Partially	It demonstrated some	It is a small firm	The company	The company is	56.3%	\$488,250	6
Offer subject to negotiation of implied unlimited liability		experience completing car park facility projects. Of the five projects listed two were for concept design or planning stage only. Its nominated sub- consultant demonstrated more substantial experience, citing the Joondalup Health Campus car park, Ocean Keys Shopping Centre extension and harbour Town development as examples of its work. The referees were: Australand, Town of Cambridge, Rendezvous Hotel, Colgan Industries, Insight Project Services, Lend Lease and Peter Hunt Architects.	that has been in operation since 2004 with 10 staff. The nominated project team consists of three from the architectural firm and six from the sub-consultant. CVs were supplied for two of the architectural team and all of the sub- consultant team. Additional resources was not specifically addressed, however the predicted workloads of the team indicates the ability. A company safety policy was supplied. Safety procedures and its safety record were not addressed.	demonstrated a good understanding of the requirements. Its response set out a thorough methodology for each of the stages project briefing, conceptual design, schematic design, development application phase, design development, contract documentation and tender and contract administration. An indicative project timeline was also supplied.	located in Perth. The company stated that several strategies could be considered that could bring direct benefits to local businesses and indirect social benefits. These strategies do not align with the assessable items of this criterion.			

			Comment Ag	ainst Criteria					
Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price	Rank	
Silver Thomas Hanley All requirements have been met.	Yes	Silver Thomas Hanley demonstrated experience completing various car park construction and extension projects. Those completed in the past seven years include Hollywood Hospital car park, St John of God Hospital Car Park, Joondalup Hospital Car park (In joint venture with Peter Hunt Architects), a feasibility study for Burswood car park and a joint design submission for the QEII car park facility with Hassell. The nominated referees were: Hollywood Hospital, St John of God Hospital and Joondalup Health Campus.	Silver Thomas Hanley has in operation for 60 years. It has 40 staff. The structure of the project team was detailed. The role and experience of each architectural team member was briefly described. No information was supplied for the specialist sub- consultant team. The company has the internal capacity to provide additional personnel and resources. Safety management was not addressed.	The company demonstrated an understanding of the requirements. The response set out an appreciation of the tasks, budget and program control, management of services consultants, document control and quality assurance and an indicative project timeline.	The company is located in West Perth. The car park design has the ability to draw additional patronage to the area and the construction phase to provide opportunities for local suppliers and contractors. The response does not align with the assessable items of this criterion.	54.5%	\$647,735	7	

			Comment Ag	ainst Criteria				
Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
Worley Parsons Services Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	The company demonstrated experience providing engineering services to projects with car park facilities. Only one of these projects was completed in the past five years. Two projects were provided as evidence of the experience of its nominated architect and consultancy firm. The two projects were for office and commercial buildings with basement car parking.The nominated referees were: LEX Property Management, Department of Planning and infrastructure and the City of Perth.	It is a large multi- disciplinary engineering firm established in 1971. It employs more than 40,400 staff globally and 2,500 in its Perth office. CVs were supplied for each team member. The nominated principal architect has recently been employed by the company and his architectural firm is the nominated sub-consultant for architectural services. Additional engineering personnel would be supplied from the company's large number of staff. The company has a comprehensive safety system.	The company demonstrated an understanding of the requirements. The methodology briefly addressed the schematic/ concept design, design development, construction documentation and construction phases of the projects and generally set out the tasks for each stage. The company confirmed its ability to meet the City's program. An indicative detailed project timeline was not supplied.	The company is a global organisation with offices in capital cities across Australia. The company stated its commitment to providing local personnel, suppliers and contractors full, fair and reasonable opportunity to provide services to the project.	50.3%	\$779,098	8

			Comment Ag	ainst Criteria				
Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
Fratelle Group Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	It demonstrated some experience in projects with multi-storey car park facilities. Examples included apartments, mixed use and commercial buildings with basement and open air car parking. The value of these projects was generally of a smaller scale than the City's project, with some exceptions such as a recreation centre and mixed use apartment/commercial developments. The nominated sub- consultant has substantial experience completing multi- storey car park projects. The nominated referees were: Schoonens Nominees, the	Fratelle Group Pty Ltd was established in 2001 and has 10 full-time, part-time and contract staff. The structure of the organisation and CVs of six of the nominated team were supplied. Additional personnel would be sourced in- house or from contract staff should it be required. Safety management was not addressed.	0		50.3%	\$736,015	8
		department of Building Management & Works and the City of Armadale.						

			Comment Against Criteria					
Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
JCY Architects & Urban Designers All requirements have been met.	Yes	JCY Architects & Urban Designers demonstrated experience completing projects of a variety of types in terms of size, scope and value. A small proportion of the projects were for a stand-alone car park. Examples of works included: an ECU carpark and library, St Hilda's Sports courts and carpark, 167 Westralia Plaza and Queen Riverside Frasers suites. Its nominated sub- consultant has completed several stand-alone carparks and buildings with car parking facilities. The nominated referees were: Curtin University, PDC Project Management and Edith Cowan University.	JCY Architects & Urban Designers is a large architectural firm in operation for 25 years. It has 60 staff. The organisations structure and details of six experienced staff were supplied. A company profile and CVs of a team of four staff from its nominated sub- consultant was also provided. The ability to provide additional resources and personnel was not specifically addressed; however the firm has the internal capacity should it be required. A safety statement was supplied in the submission.	The company provided a brief response to this criterion. A statement of understanding of the project and site was provided with a proposed alternative program increasing City's program by four weeks and a basic project timeline. An itemised breakdown of the work within each stage of the project was not supplied.	The company is located in Perth. The company is committed to employing recently graduated architectural staff and providing further training to enhance their careers. If successful in the City's project it would be in a position to offer full-time employment to one. The response does not align with the assessable items of this criterion.	48.1%	\$870,080	9

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
Woods Bagot Pty Ltd Offer subject to cap on overall liability, exclusion of consequential and indirect losses and alignment of warranties with insurance cover.	Partially	Woods Bagot Pty Ltd demonstrated limited experience in providing architectural services for multi- storey car parks. Of the 11 examples provided, 3 were by Woods Bagot Pty Ltd and the remaining eight by its nominated sub-consultants. The nominated referees were: Perth Airport, Southern Health, Brookfield Properties, Shire of Katanning and the Department of Education.	Woods Bagot Pty Ltd is a large organisation established in Perth in 1997. It has 50 staff. The company structure and CVs of the nominated team members from both Woods Bagot and its sub-consultant were supplied. The ability to provide additional resources and personnel was not specifically addressed, however all consultants in the nominated team have sufficient capacity to provide any additional resources. Safety management was not addressed.	The company demonstrated a good understanding of the requirements addressing each phase of the works and the activities to be undertaken in each phase. A proposed program was also supplied. It is noted however that the submission indicated that it does not expect to have any involvement in construction documentation, which is a requirement of the tender.	The company is located in Perth. The response stated that the car park could play a role in instigating a more vibrant urban landscape within Joondalup. The company employs Perth-based staff and it sources products and materials through its network of local suppliers. The response does not align with the assessable items of this criterion.	47.4%	\$598,800	10

			Comment Ag	ainst Criteria						
Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price	Rank		
Hodge Collard Preston Architects All requirements have been met.	Yes	The company demonstrated experience in projects with car parking facilities. Twelve examples of projects were supplied, with seven including car parks. Some of projects are small in scale, completed more than seven years ago or a community building with no similarities to this project. The nominated referees were: Shire of York, City of Joondalup and Heaton Investments.	Hodge Collard Preston Architects has been in operation since 1976. It has 17 staff. The structure of the organisation and project team was provided. CVs were provided for the project team members including the nominated sub- consultant. The ability to provide additional resources was not specifically addressed, however its number of staff indicate the capacity to do so should it be required. Safety management was not addressed.	The company demonstrated a good understanding of the requirements. The response set out the tasks to be completed in each of the stages of schematic design, design development, contract documentation, tender and contract administration.	The company is located in West Perth. The company will use local printers in the Joondalup area for the project, endeavour to utilise local suppliers and products when designing, documenting and specifying and it currently has an employee residing within the City of Joondalup.	46.8%	\$507,200	11		

	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria						
Respondent & Description of Response		Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
TAG Architects	Yes	It demonstrated	TAG Architects is	The company	The company is	45.3%	\$668,800	12
All requirements have been met.		limited company experience in projects incorporating car park facilities. Some examples of work completed by the firm included Churchlands High School music auditorium, Supreme Court architectural masterplan project and West Kimberley Regional Prison. It is noted that several key staff have had experience with prior employers in car park projects and its nominated hydraulic and electrical consultants demonstrated considerable experience in this type of project. The nominated referees were: the Departments of Building and Works and the Attorney General.	a small architectural firm established in 2001 with 9 staff. An organisational chart and CVs of all staff were supplied. Information including CVs on all the nominated sub-consultants was also provided. Additional staff could be assigned to the contract if required. Safety management was not addressed.	demonstrated a good understanding of the requirements. The response set out the identified key issues of the project, a project timeline, project availability of the three key personnel and the methodology for consultation, management, the design process, developing the project brief, review of program and planning requirements and contract administration and reporting.	located in Perth. TAG Architects will source personnel and all associated services including sub-consultants from within WA. The response does not align with the assessable items in this criterion which are specific to Joondalup not WA as a whole.			

	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria						
Respondent & Description of Response		Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
Eames Architects Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	Eames Architects Pty Ltd demonstrated limited experience in multi-storey car park projects. Four examples were supplied which consisted of three mixed use buildings with two levels of basement car parking and one commercial building with two levels of car parking. Its nominated sub- consultant demonstrated experience in multiple mixed use buildings with car parking. The nominated referees were: Qube Property, 434 Safety Bay Rd Pty Ltd and Castelli Group.	It was established in 1980 and has nine staff. The CV of one director and staff from the engineering sub- consultant were supplied. The CVs of the staff from the sub- consultant do not clearly indicate what experience in multi-storey car parks each has. It was stated that extensive resources are available. All staff have completed a WorkSafe WA OHS construction induction and the firm has two staff trained in first aid. No actual safety management policy, procedures or safety record was supplied.	The company demonstrated an adequate understanding of the requirements. A typical project flow chart and draft project program was supplied. The project flow chart was generalised and not specific to the City's project.	The company is based in Nedlands. Should the company be successful, it would ensure that within the construction documentation the builder, where practical, would be required to seek quotes from local suppliers. The response does not align with the assessable items in this criterion.	44.8%	\$523,200	13

		Comment Against Criteria						
Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
Christou Design Group Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	Christou Design Group Pty Ltd demonstrated limited experience in multi- storey car park projects. Three projects were submitted as evidence of its experience. These were the Claremont Quarter development, The Mezz shopping centre and an eight storey car park in Kuala Lumpur. Its nominated specialist sub-consultant has considerable experience in car park projects. The nominated referees were: Brookfield Multiplex Constructions, Credentia Construction and Claremont Quarter Shopping Centre	It has been in operation for 28 years. It has approximately 31 staff. An organisational chart was supplied and supported by the CVs of three of the nominated project team of four staff. No information was supplied on the proposed sub- consultant team members. The ability to provide additional resources and personnel was not specifically addressed; however the company has the capacity to meet any requirements.	The company demonstrated some understanding of the requirements. The response was brief and lacked detail. The key tasks were listed for each of concept/schematic phase, design development and contract documentation.	The company is located in Claremont. The response to this criterion addressed whole of life operating costs, construction innovation and it has a buy local policy. The response does not align with the assessable items in this criterion.	43.5%	\$658,450	14

**Comment Against Criteria Respondent &** ls it Demonstrated Social and Evaluation Demonstrated **Description of** Compliant? Price Rank experience economic effects Score Capacity understanding of Response Yes or No completing similar on the local the required tasks projects community CADDS Architectural Yes **CADDS** Architectural It was established The company did \$457,000 The company is 39.4% 15 Drafting Drafting did not in 1993. It has not provide an located in Bibra demonstrate six offices with adequate response Lake. All requirements have experience in projects the Perth office to this criterion. A been met. of a similar size and located in Bibra statement of The company nature to the Citv's Lake. It has a understanding was encourages project. Four total of 80 staff supplied with a resourcing local example projects with eight in the brief methodology materials and were provided. All drafting division. and provisional labour where project program. were mixed use A structure of the possible in the buildings with car The methodology project team was construction phase parking facilities. supplied and did not provide of the project. Four of the five were supported by CVs sufficient detail with 50 bays or less of all eight of the demonstrating a full and one with 149 architectural appreciation of the bays that did not go tasks in each stage drafting team. Additional past planning of the project. approval stage. The personnel are nominated referees available for the were: Rio Tinto. project from the company's Manila Maximus Australasia and TJR Building. office. The company has an ISO 4801 safety and quality management system in place and has had no safety incidents since its inception.

	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria						
Respondent & Description of Response		Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
RAD Architecture Pty Ltd Insurance cover not fully compliant with required level of \$5M	Partially	It demonstrated limited experience in multi-storey car park projects. Four projects were supplied as evidence of its experience. These included Duxton Hotel additions, Civic Square apartments and Murray Street building and main Street Kwinana project. Insufficient information was supplied on the scope of the projects. The experience of one specialist sub- consultant was provided in more detail. Insufficient information was provided on projects completed by the other nominated sub- consultant. The referees were: Duxton Hotel, Duomark and St Thomas More College.	The company has been in operation for an unknown period of time and is located in Burswood. It has five full-time and 3 part-time staff. No information was provided on the skills of experience of any architectural staff or staff from one if its sub- consultants. Profiles of staff from one sub- consultant were supplied. The architectural firm has the capacity to engage up to thirteen full-time staff to cover any additional requirements. Safety management was not addressed.	No specific response was supplied to this criterion setting out a methodology and tasks to be undertaken by the lead architectural consultant. However, the tasks to be undertaken by the two sub- consultants were provided. The management strategies generally utilised by the company in undertaking projects was supplied.	The company is located in Burswood. No response addressed this criterion.	20.4%	\$652,800	16