

**SUMMARY OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS**

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
ARM Architecture All requirements have been met.	Yes	It has substantial experience in multi-storey car park projects in both open air and underground types. Examples included Perth Arena, Swanston Square and One East buildings in Melbourne and the Q&A building in Brisbane. The nominated sub-consultants, Red Engineers and Reeve & Associates, also demonstrated considerable experience in similar car park projects. The nominated referees were: Public Transport Authority, Grocon, Becton, Digital Harbour and QIC.	The company has been in operation since 1988. It has 65 staff. The structure of the project team was supplied and supported by a profile for each nominated team member setting out their role, qualifications and relevant experience. The company has the ability to draw upon staff from both its offices should additional resources be required. The safety policy, procedures and safety record of the company was not addressed	ARM Architecture demonstrated an excellent understanding of the project. The comprehensive response set out a detailed methodology for the four stages of the project, its design philosophy, project timeline and budget control measures	The company has offices in Melbourne and Perth.  ARM Architecture are committed to the innovative use of ordinary building materials and strive for maximum impact without maximum cost.	69.3%	\$755,000	1

[illegible]

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Peter Hunt Architect All requirements have been met.	Yes	It demonstrated experience completing multi-storey car parks. Two projects were a joint venture with Silver Thomas Hanley (Joondalup and Midland Health Campus car parks). The remaining 3 projects were: Gold Coast Convention Centre (2008), Council House and Basement Car park (1999/2000) and WA Basketball Stadium and Car Park (2009). The nominated referees were: Joondalup Health Campus, City of Perth, BGC/Perkins Builders, Dept of Sport & Recreation and Building Management and Works, Gold Coast Convention Centre and the City of Vincent	It was established in 1970. It has 31 staff. An organisational chart was supplied and supported by details of the nominated team of 7 for the City's project. Profiles were provided for four of the team. A list of the nominated sub-consultants was provided, however supporting documentation was available on request only. The company has the resources to provide additional personnel from its two offices. The company has a written work health and safety policy. It has had no safety incidents.	Peter Hunt Architects demonstrated a thorough understanding of the project. The methodology addressed initial design studies, current context, budget and brief, liaison with City's consultants, design criteria, site assessment, client communication, each stage of the project and an indicative project timeline.	The company has offices in Perth and Sydney.  The response addressed various social and economic benefits to the community of the completed car park, however none of these were applicable to the assessable criteria for the services provided under this contract, rather the construction phase and completed project.	67.6%	\$554,910	3

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Woodhead Pty Ltd  All requirements have been met.	Yes	It demonstrated experience completing similar car park projects. It provided four examples: Adelaide central bus station car park, Adelaide airport car park, SA aquatic centre car park and design advisory services in the QEII Medical Centre car park project in WA. The South Australian projects were for car parks of four to six storeys. Two of the company's personnel nominated for the City's project worked on these projects. The nominated referees were: department of treasury, Adelaide City Council, Adelaide Airport Limited and Flinders University.	It was established in 1927 with 94 staff in total and 21 staff in Perth. A team of five has been nominated for the City's project. A CV for each member was provided. Additional resources are available from any of the company's other offices. Information on its nominated sub-consultant was also supplied. Woodhead Pty Ltd has a work, health and safety system in place and provided a copy of its safety policy in the submission. The company's safety record was not supplied.	The company demonstrated a good understanding of the requirements. The response addressed design approach, weekly milestones against each stage of the project, cost control, coordination of sub-consultants, communication and an indicative program.	The company has offices in five Australian capital cities and Singapore and Jakarta.  The response addressed achieving a quality urban design outcome for the car park and obtaining the highest possible value for the lowest cost.	58.9%	\$476,500	4

[illegible]

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Gresley Abas Pty Ltd Offer subject to negotiation of implied unlimited liability	Partially	It demonstrated some experience completing car park facility projects. Of the five projects listed two were for concept design or planning stage only. Its nominated sub-consultant demonstrated more substantial experience, citing the Joondalup Health Campus car park, Ocean Keys Shopping Centre extension and harbour Town development as examples of its work. The referees were: Australand, Town of Cambridge, Rendezvous Hotel, Colgan Industries, Insight Project Services, Lend Lease and Peter Hunt Architects.	It is a small firm that has been in operation since 2004 with 10 staff. The nominated project team consists of three from the architectural firm and six from the sub-consultant. CVs were supplied for two of the architectural team and all of the sub-consultant team. Additional resources was not specifically addressed, however the predicted workloads of the team indicates the ability. A company safety policy was supplied. Safety procedures and its safety record were not addressed.	The company demonstrated a good understanding of the requirements. Its response set out a thorough methodology for each of the stages project briefing, conceptual design, schematic design, development application phase, design development, contract documentation and tender and contract administration. An indicative project timeline was also supplied.	The company is located in Perth.  The company stated that several strategies could be considered that could bring direct benefits to local businesses and indirect social benefits. These strategies do not align with the assessable items of this criterion.	56.3%	\$488,250	6

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>Silver Thomas Hanley</p> <p>All requirements have been met.</p>	Yes	<p>Silver Thomas Hanley demonstrated experience completing various car park construction and extension projects. Those completed in the past seven years include Hollywood Hospital car park, St John of God Hospital Car Park, Joondalup Hospital Car park (In joint venture with Peter Hunt Architects), a feasibility study for Burswood car park and a joint design submission for the QEII car park facility with Hassell. The nominated referees were: Hollywood Hospital, St John of God Hospital and Joondalup Health Campus.</p>	<p>Silver Thomas Hanley has in operation for 60 years. It has 40 staff. The structure of the project team was detailed. The role and experience of each architectural team member was briefly described. No information was supplied for the specialist sub-consultant team. The company has the internal capacity to provide additional personnel and resources. Safety management was not addressed.</p>	<p>The company demonstrated an understanding of the requirements. The response set out an appreciation of the tasks, budget and program control, management of services consultants, document control and quality assurance and an indicative project timeline.</p>	<p>The company is located in West Perth.</p> <p>The car park design has the ability to draw additional patronage to the area and the construction phase to provide opportunities for local suppliers and contractors. The response does not align with the assessable items of this criterion.</p>	54.5%	\$647,735	7

[illegible]



Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>Fratelle Group Pty Ltd</p> <p>All requirements have been met.</p>	Yes	<p>It demonstrated some experience in projects with multi-storey car park facilities. Examples included apartments, mixed use and commercial buildings with basement and open air car parking. The value of these projects was generally of a smaller scale than the City's project, with some exceptions such as a recreation centre and mixed use apartment/commercial developments. The nominated sub-consultant has substantial experience completing multi-storey car park projects. The nominated referees were: Schoonens Nominees, the department of Building Management &amp; Works and the City of Armadale.</p>	<p>Fratelle Group Pty Ltd was established in 2001 and has 10 full-time, part-time and contract staff. The structure of the organisation and CVs of six of the nominated team were supplied. Additional personnel would be sourced in-house or from contract staff should it be required. Safety management was not addressed.</p>	<p>The company demonstrated a well developed understanding of the requirements. The response addressed the key issues of the site, an explanation of the services to be undertaken in each stage of the work, the deliverables in each stage and proposed an alternative program with an additional 95 days to the City proposed program.</p>	<p>The company is located in Northbridge.</p> <p>The response addressed encouraging local involvement, creating a positive environment for the local community, durability and maintenance minimisation and minimising anti-social behaviour within the new car park. The response does not align with the assessable items of this criterion.</p>	50.3%	\$736,015	8

[illegible]

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Woods Bagot Pty Ltd  Offer subject to cap on overall liability, exclusion of consequential and indirect losses and alignment of warranties with insurance cover.	Partially	Woods Bagot Pty Ltd demonstrated limited experience in providing architectural services for multi-storey car parks. Of the 11 examples provided, 3 were by Woods Bagot Pty Ltd and the remaining eight by its nominated sub-consultants. The nominated referees were: Perth Airport, Southern Health, Brookfield Properties, Shire of Katanning and the Department of Education.	Woods Bagot Pty Ltd is a large organisation established in Perth in 1997. It has 50 staff. The company structure and CVs of the nominated team members from both Woods Bagot and its sub-consultant were supplied. The ability to provide additional resources and personnel was not specifically addressed, however all consultants in the nominated team have sufficient capacity to provide any additional resources. Safety management was not addressed.	The company demonstrated a good understanding of the requirements addressing each phase of the works and the activities to be undertaken in each phase. A proposed program was also supplied. It is noted however that the submission indicated that it does not expect to have any involvement in construction documentation, which is a requirement of the tender.	The company is located in Perth.  The response stated that the car park could play a role in instigating a more vibrant urban landscape within Joondalup. The company employs Perth-based staff and it sources products and materials through its network of local suppliers. The response does not align with the assessable items of this criterion.	47.4%	\$598,800	10

[illegible]

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>TAG Architects</p> <p>All requirements have been met.</p>	Yes	It demonstrated limited company experience in projects incorporating car park facilities. Some examples of work completed by the firm included Churchlands High School music auditorium, Supreme Court architectural masterplan project and West Kimberley Regional Prison. It is noted that several key staff have had experience with prior employers in car park projects and its nominated hydraulic and electrical consultants demonstrated considerable experience in this type of project. The nominated referees were: the Departments of Building and Works and the Attorney General.	TAG Architects is a small architectural firm established in 2001 with 9 staff. An organisational chart and CVs of all staff were supplied. Information including CVs on all the nominated sub-consultants was also provided. Additional staff could be assigned to the contract if required. Safety management was not addressed.	The company demonstrated a good understanding of the requirements. The response set out the identified key issues of the project, a project timeline, project availability of the three key personnel and the methodology for consultation, management, the design process, developing the project brief, review of program and planning requirements and contract administration and reporting.	<p>The company is located in Perth.</p> <p>TAG Architects will source personnel and all associated services including sub-consultants from within WA. The response does not align with the assessable items in this criterion which are specific to Joondalup not WA as a whole.</p>	45.3%	\$668,800	12

[illegible]

[illegible]

[illegible]



<b>Respondent &amp; Description of Response</b>	<b>Is it Compliant? Yes or No</b>	<b>Comment Against Criteria</b>				<b>Evaluation Score</b>	<b>Price</b>	<b>Rank</b>
		<b>Demonstrated experience completing similar projects</b>	<b>Capacity</b>	<b>Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks</b>	<b>Social and economic effects on the local community</b>			
RAD Architecture Pty Ltd Insurance cover not fully compliant with required level of \$5M	Partially	It demonstrated limited experience in multi-storey car park projects. Four projects were supplied as evidence of its experience. These included Duxton Hotel additions, Civic Square apartments and Murray Street building and main Street Kwinana project. Insufficient information was supplied on the scope of the projects. The experience of one specialist sub-consultant was provided in more detail. Insufficient information was provided on projects completed by the other nominated sub-consultant. The referees were: Duxton Hotel, Duomark and St Thomas More College.	The company has been in operation for an unknown period of time and is located in Burswood. It has five full-time and 3 part-time staff. No information was provided on the skills of experience of any architectural staff or staff from one if its sub-consultants. Profiles of staff from one sub-consultant were supplied. The architectural firm has the capacity to engage up to thirteen full-time staff to cover any additional requirements. Safety management was not addressed.	No specific response was supplied to this criterion setting out a methodology and tasks to be undertaken by the lead architectural consultant. However, the tasks to be undertaken by the two sub-consultants were provided. The management strategies generally utilised by the company in undertaking projects was supplied.	The company is located in Burswood.  No response addressed this criterion.	20.4%	\$652,800	16