

**SCHEDULE OF ITEMS**

<b>Item</b>	<b>Description</b>	<b>UOM</b>
1	Graffiti Paint Out	m <sup>2</sup>
2	Graffiti Removal – Chemical	m <sup>2</sup>
3	Graffiti Removal – High Pressure Water	m <sup>2</sup>
4	Graffiti Removal – Steam	m <sup>2</sup>
5	Graffiti Removal – Venturi Pick-up	m <sup>2</sup>
6	Graffiti Removal – Heritage	m <sup>2</sup>
7	Graffiti Removal – Abrasive Blast	m <sup>2</sup>
8	Graffiti Damage Inspection	Hour
9	Specialist Equipment Hire Cost plus percentage mark-up	%

## SUMMARY OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Graffiti Systems Australia	Yes	It has been in operation for more than 19 years and has 35 staff. The structure of the organisation was set out and supported by a description of the key responsibilities and authorities of key staff. The specific experience of its individual staff was not supplied. A full is of the equipment supplied. A/H will be provided by two staff living locally. Additional personnel will be sourced from its staff. The company has a safety policy in place. It has had no injuries in the past five years.	It demonstrated considerable experience performing graffiti removal services for local govt and private entities. The local government clients are the Cities of Subiaco, Swan, Nedlands, Bayswater and the Town of Cambridge as well as the City for the past eight years. The nominated referees were: Water Corporation, Downer Mouchel and the City of Subiaco. Additional contact names were supplied for the majority of the contracts list.	Graffiti Systems Australia demonstrated a comprehensive understanding of the requirements. It provided a well-documented process for each graffiti removal method listing when it is to be used, its advantages/ disadvantages and a description of the removal process and materials and equipment to be used. Hours of operation, digital photographic evidence and general administration processes were also addressed.	The company is located in Welshpool.  The company purchases all chemicals, paint and coatings locally. Two of its staff are residents of the City.	70.3%	Maximum Price \$887,942	1
All requirements have been met.							Minimum Price \$803,376	

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>Graffiti Force Pty Ltd</p> <p>All requirements have been met.</p>	Yes	It has been in operation since 2006 and has 12 staff. An organisational chart was supplied and supported by details of 11 of its staff. A list of equipment set out the age, size and capacity of each item. The company operates a 24 hour hotline which would be used for any after-hours requirements. The ability to provide additional personnel and resources was not specifically addressed other than access to additional painters. The company's safety policy and procedures was provided. It has had no safety incidents since its inception.	The company demonstrated substantial experience performing similar graffiti removal services for private organisations, state govt departments and local governments including the Cities of Swan, Subiaco, South Perth, Melville, Armadale, Stirling and the Towns of Victoria Park and Bassendean. It also currently provides specialist graffiti removal services within the City. The nominated referees were: WA Police, Town of Bassendean, Wormal Civil, City of Swan, Town of Cambridge and Telstra.	Graffiti Force Pty Ltd demonstrated a comprehensive understanding of the requirements. It provided a well-documented process for each graffiti removal method listing when it is to be used, its advantages/ disadvantages and a step by step methodology including materials and equipment to be used and obtaining waivers from owners of property prior to commencement of work.	<p>The company is located in Morley.</p> <p>The company will purchase all possible materials from within the local community, it will also fully utilise the WA Police graffiti cleanup program in conjunction with the City's contract, thus allowing further cost saving and value added services to the community.</p>	68.9%	<p>Maximum Price \$976,220</p> <p>Minimum Price \$883,247</p>	2

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Kleenit Pty Ltd	Yes	It was established in 1987 and has more than 60 mobile operators. The structure of the team was well-documented with the experience and role of a large number of its key personnel supplied. The specification of its high pressure cleaning units was supplied. It operates a diversion to mobile for A/H jobs. Additional resources would be supplied from its large number of operators. The company operates with a safety management system in place that is ISO 9001, ISO 14001 and AS/NZS 4801 compliant. It has had no safety incidents in the past two years.	Kleenit Pty Ltd demonstrated substantial experience providing similar graffiti removal services. An extensive list of the names of clients was supplied which includes local governments, state government departments and private organisations. Four contracts were described in detail setting out the work performed and the length of the contract. The nominated referees were: City of Stirling, Western Power and the Department of Building Management and Works (for schools).	The company demonstrated a thorough understanding of the requirements. The methodology addressed response times, reporting, graffiti removal methods, use of tablets, workflow, OHS checklists and GPS tracking.	The company is located in Kewdale.  The company indicated that only operators living within the City would be utilised on the City's contract. Goods and services will be purchased locally where possible and that it could recruit and train new staff from the local area and it could support and sponsor local community charities and youth groups associated with graffiti programs.	68.7%	Maximum Price \$999,954	3
All requirements have been met.							Minimum Price \$904,720	

[illegible]

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>The Pressure King</p> <p>All requirements have been met.</p>	Yes	It was established in 1999 and has 10 staff engaged on a full-time or casual basis. An organisational chart was supplied and supported by the role, qualifications and experience of each member of staff. All technicians have prior experience in graffiti removal. A full list of the equipment and vehicles was supplied. An A/H contact was provided. The nominated team will be supported by sub-contractors should additional staff be required. The organisation has a safety policy and a number of procedures in place. It has had no safety incidents since its inception.	The Pressure King demonstrated a good level of experience performing similar graffiti removal services to local government and private organisations. It is currently providing similar services to the Cities of South Perth and Belmont and the Town of Victoria Park. It has previously provided services to the City of Cockburn, City of Bayswater and Transfield Maintenance. The nominated referees were: City of Belmont, City of South Perth and the Town of Victoria Park.	The Pressure King demonstrated a thorough understanding of the requirements. The methodology addressed all the main requirements of the specification including removal times, measurement, site protocol, records and documentation, reporting and signage. An explanation of the method to be used on different surfaces was also provided.	<p>The organisation is located in Willetton.</p> <p>The organisation intends to use local suppliers where possible and can supply its services free of charge to graffiti community action days such as those held in the City of Belmont for church groups.</p>	63.7%	<p>Maximum Price \$1,645,473</p> <p>Minimum Price \$1,488,761</p>	5

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Perth Elite Cleaners Pty Ltd	Yes	It has been in operation for an unknown period of time. Its total number of staff was not supplied. It has 3 full-time and 1 part-time office staff. An organisational chart was supplied and supported by the role, and experience of two key personnel. No information was supplied on any staff that will perform graffiti removal. The list of equipment was limited to warm water pressure equipment. An A/H contact was supplied. The offer indicated it has the ability to provide additional resources. A safety policy was supplied. It has had no safety incidents in the past two years.	The company did demonstrate adequate experience in performing graffiti removal services. Three contracts for cleaning services were supplied as evidence of its experience. No information supported graffiti removal being a part of the services provided. The nominated referees were: Odeum Farms, Save the Children and Fresh Corp.	The company demonstrated some understanding of the processes involved in graffiti removal. The methodology supplied addressed the removal methods to be used, response times, photographic evidence and reporting. The response did not set out any detail of the processes involved in each type of graffiti removal.	The company is located in Osborne Park.  The company will use local suppliers and employ local residents where possible.	33.7%	Maximum Price \$3,525,527	6
All requirements have been met.							Minimum Price \$3,189,762	

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>Enviropath Pty Ltd</p> <p>All requirements have been met.</p>	Yes	It has been in operation since 2011 with 7 staff. The name, experience and qualifications were provided for all staff. No experience in graffiti removal was detailed. A list of its equipment was supplied; however most is for high pressure cleaning with only a small amount of the equipment relevant to graffiti removal. The response did not address additional personnel and resources or its safety record. The company has environmental and safety policies in place and also provided sample job safety analysis sheets and a risk assessment checklist.	The company did not demonstrate any experience performing graffiti removal services. The four example contracts are for high pressure cleaning of roads, paving and footpaths for the City of Fremantle, Joondalup, Stirling and Perth. The nominated referees were: The Cities of Perth, Stirling and Fremantle.	Enviropath Pty Ltd did not demonstrate an adequate understanding of the requirements. No specific response addressed its understanding of the requirements. The offer did not address any of the City's scope of work for graffiti removal methods, reporting and photographic evidence.	<p>The company is located in West Perth.</p> <p>No response was supplied for this criterion.</p>	31.3%	<p>Maximum Price \$1,645,570</p> <p>Minimum Price \$1,488,849</p>	7



Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Active Pressure Cleaners Pty Ltd	Yes	It commenced in April 2013. It has 12 staff. A list of staff was provided. Its staff have white cards, working at height, access and EWP licences. The previous experience of its two directors was detailed, however no specific information was provided for its graffiti removal operators. The organisation has sufficient equipment to perform the services. It stated it has the ability to provided additional personnel. A/H contact was not addressed. Safety was briefly addressed in the form of a safe work method statement. It has had no safety incidents since its inception.	The organisation did not demonstrate any experience performing graffiti removal services. The response was general in nature and did not provide specific information on the scope of work, outcomes, period and dates for any contract. Two referees were provided from the directors previous employers. No reference was provided for current work performed by the organisation.	Active Pressure Cleaners Pty Ltd did not demonstrate an adequate understanding of the requirements. Several methods for the removal of graffiti was briefly described, however the response did not address any of the specific detail relating to the City's scope of work such as reporting, graffiti paint-out and photographic evidence.	The company is located in Clarkson.  No response was supplied for this criterion.	27.3%	Maximum Price \$10,103,557	8
All requirements have been met.							Minimum Price \$9,141,314	

**TENDER PRICE ASSESSMENT**

		<b>Graffiti Systems Australia</b>	<b>Graffiti Force Pty Ltd</b>	<b>Kleenit Pty Ltd</b>	<b>FCT Surface Cleaning</b>	<b>The Pressure King</b>	<b>Enviropath Pty Ltd</b>	<b>Perth Elite Cleaners</b>	<b>Active Pressure Cleaners Pty Ltd</b>
1 Year	Penalty applied minimum 6 months	\$266,756	\$293,277	\$300,407	\$423,911	\$494,335	\$494,364	\$1,059,143	\$3,035,321
	Penalty applied maximum 12 months	\$259,917	\$285,757	\$292,705	\$323,516	\$481,660	\$481,688	\$1,031,985	\$2,957,493
	No/Penalty Bonus (meets target 7-8 months of year)	\$273,596	\$300,797	\$308,110	\$434,780	\$507,010	\$507,040	\$1,086,300	\$3,113,150
	Bonus applied minimum 9 months	\$283,856	\$312,077	\$319,664	\$451,084	\$526,023	\$526,054	\$1,127,036	\$3,229,893
	Bonus applied maximum 12 months	\$287,276	\$315,837	\$323,516	\$456,519	\$532,361	\$532,392	\$1,140,615	\$3,268,808
3 Years	Minimum Cost of Contract over 3yrs with maximum penalty applied each year	\$803,376	\$883,247	\$904,720	\$1,276,668	\$1,488,761	\$1,488,849	\$3,189,762	\$9,141,314
	Maximum Cost of Contract over 3 yrs with maximum bonus applied each year	\$887,942	\$976,220	\$999,954	\$1,411,055	\$1,645,473	\$1,645,570	\$3,525,527	\$10,103,557