APPENDIX 10

SUMMARY OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS

ATTACHMENT 1

			Comment Again	st Criteria				
Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Capacity	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price (Option 1)	Qualitative Rank
Adrina Project Management Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	The company demonstrated experience completing refurbishment and extension projects. Numerous project examples were supplied supporting its experience and these included Administration Building extension for Mindarie Regional Council, refurbishment of classrooms for Gilmore College and North Perth Primary School and refurbishment works of various community facilities for the City of Stirling.	It started its operation in 1997 in Sydney and Melbourne. Its Perth office has been operation since 2001 and currently has 32 staff. The company's organisational chart and experience, qualification and role of three key personnel were provided. After- hours contact and the ability to provide additional personnel and resources were addressed. Safety statistics for the past two years and a safety management plan of the company were provided.	It demonstrated a good understanding of the requirements. The construction method statement addressed mobilisation, site establishment and logistics, refurbishment works, internal fit-outs and services, commissioning and delivery management. A provisional construction program was also provided	Its Perth office is at Mindarie. The company employs local residents and will use local suppliers/ services.	62.8%	\$679,649	1

		Comment Against Criteria						
Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Capacity	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price (Option 1)	Qualitative Rank
CPD Group Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	The company demonstrated considerable experience completing similar new and refurbishment projects for local governments and the Department of Finance. Fourteen project examples were supplied supporting its experience and these included refurbishment of Merv McIntosh Pavilion for the City of Canning, Belmont Sports Club renovations for the City of Belmont, alterations and additions to Yunderup Sport and Recreation Centre for the Shire of Murray and Troy Park and Marmion Reserve for the City of Melville. A description of the scope of works, value and period and dates for all 14 projects were also submitted.	It has been in operation since 1979 and has 75 full-time staff. The company structure was provided and supported by the experience, qualifications and role of five team members responsible for this contract. After- hours contact was not provided and the ability to provide additional personnel and resources were not specifically addressed. A copy of its safety management plan was provided but no safety record was supplied.	It demonstrated a good understanding of the project requirements. A methodology specific to the project was supplied addressing project risks, constraints and issues, contract management system, key personnel, mobilisation and site establishment, site works, building works, commissioning and close out.	Its head office is at Welshpool. The company will source materials and supplies locally and engage local subcontractors	56.9%	\$495,402	2

			Comment Against Criteria					
Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Capacity	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price (Option 1)	Qualitative Rank
Quality Group Services Pty Ltd t/as Cercon Building All requirements have been met.	Yes	It demonstrated experience completing new and refurbishment projects for local government, state government and private organisations. Numerous project examples were provided to demonstrate its experience and these included refurbishment works for various police stations and high schools for the Department of Finance, remodelling works for various outlets of KFC and McDonalds, insurance repair works to commercial and residential properties for HBF Insurance and Wesfarmers and renovation works of various public car park ablutions for the City of Perth.	It has been in operation since 2001 and has unknown number of staff. The company structure was provided and supported by the qualifications and experience of four key personnel. The Managing Director was designated as after-hours contact but no contact number was supplied. Ability to provide additional personnel and resources and safety statistics were not addressed. Occupational health and safety policy, and the Safety Management Plan of the company were provided.	It demonstrated an understanding of the requirements. The methodology addressed key project requirements, site establishment, demolition, breakdown of construction stages, inspection handover and demobilisation. A preliminary construction program was also included.	It is located in Osborne Park. This criterion was not addressed.	50.6%	\$503,589	3

			Comment Again	st Criteria				Price Qualitative Option 1) Rank
Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Capacity	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	(Option 1)	
The Trustee for the Devereux Family Trust t/as Devco Builders All requirements have been met.	Yes	It demonstrated considerable experience completing similar new and refurbishment projects for local governments and private organisations. Numerous project examples were supplied supporting its experience and these included refurbishment works of Bull creek library for the City of Melville, Loton Park refurbishment for the City of Vincent, refurbishment of Centenary Park for the City of Belmont, refurbishment to front entry including and civil and road works of Craigie Leisure Centre for the City of Joondalup and refurbishment of Maguire Pavilion for the City of Swan.	The company has been in operation since 1986 and has ten full time employees. An organisational profile of the company was provided supported by qualifications, experience and the role of five key personnel. The Construction Manager and Operations supervisor were nominated as after- hours contact and the company has credit accounts with Hire Guys and Kennard's. Safety statistics and copies of its health and safety policy and occupational health and safety management plan were provided.	It did not demonstrate an understanding of the requirements. The submission did not provide specific methodology and construction program to carry out the works.	It is located in Wangara. It employs local residents and will use local material/ service suppliers.	41.5%	\$693,052	NA

			Comment Again	st Criteria			core (Option 1)	
Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Capacity	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score		Qualitative Rank
PRC Building Services Pty Ltd	Yes	It did not demonstrate sufficient experience	The company has been in business	The company did not demonstrate	The company will use local	37.7%	\$572,494	NA
All requirements have been met.		completing similar projects. Five project examples were supplied. Majority of the projects are small scale refurbishment works and only heritage building upgrade of Fremantle Markets is similar in scope.	for the past seven years. It is based in Malaga and has 15 full time staff. The structure of the business and a qualifications and experience of three key staff were supplied. The Manager is designated as the after hours contact and the company will use labour hire firms for additional personnel requirement. Safety statistics and a copy of its occupational health and safety policy were provided.	adequate understanding of the requirements. The methodology primarily focussed on roofing works with small details on other refurbishment/extens ion works. No construction program was provided.	material/ service suppliers.			

TENDER 038/15 REFURBISHMENT OF KINGSLEY MEMORIAL CLUBROOMS

		Comment Against Criteria						
Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Capacity	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price (Option 1)	Qualitative Rank
Devlyn Constructions Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	The company did not demonstrate adequate experience completing projects of a similar nature. All three project examples supplied were for bathroom and toilet facility upgrades for the Insurance Commission of WA, Department of Mines and Petroleum and Glengarry Hospital	It has been in operation since 1990 and has more than 40 staff. Its head office is in Canning Vale with a branch office in Bunbury. The team structure for this project was supplied with the experience, qualifications and roles of three key personnel. After- hours contact and the ability to provide additional resources and personnel were not addressed. The company's occupational health and safety policy was provided but safety records were not supplied.	The company did not demonstrate an understanding of the requirements. The methodology supplied is for a project of the Insurance Commission of WA. A six weeks project timeframe was proposed for this project but the proposed project program is of 24 weeks.	This criterion was not addressed.	32.5%	\$639,032	NA

TENDER 038/15 REFURBISHMENT OF KINGSLEY MEMORIAL CLUBROOMS

			Comment Again	st Criteria				
Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Capacity	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price (Option 1)	Qualitative Rank
ZD Constructions 93 Pty Ltd	No			Non-complia	int			
All requirements have not been met.			Not assessed					