

## TENDER 019/15 CIVIL WORKS FOR WHITFORDS AVENUE CARRIAGEWAY DUPLICATION

## APPENDIX 10

## SUMMARY OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS

## ATTACHMENT 1

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Ertech Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	It has been in operation since 1981 in mining, oil and gas, government, utilities infrastructure and land development sectors. It has more than 630 employees. The company organisation chart and management structure for this project was provided and supported by the resumes of its five key personnel. A comprehensive list of plant and equipment was supplied. After hours contact would be managed by the project engineer. All additional resources and personnel would be sourced in-house. A copy of its health and safety policy, safety management plan for this project and safety record for last two years were supplied. The company holds accreditation for AS/NZS 4801:2001, AS/NZS ISO 9001:2008, ISO 14001:2004 and Australian Government Building and Construction Occupational Health and Safety Scheme.	It demonstrated considerable experience completing similar projects to the Whitfords Avenue carriageway duplication. Five examples were provided supporting its experience and these included Catalina Marmion Avenue intersection civil works completed in 2013 for Tamala Park Regional Council, Beeliar Drive improvement works completed in 2013 for Perron Investments, Connolly Drive duplication completed in 2009 for the City of Joondalup and Mirrabooka Regional Centre improvement works for the City of Stirling (ongoing).	It demonstrated a thorough understanding of the project requirements. A detailed staged construction methodology specific to the project was supplied addressing plan overview, plant resourcing, temporary infrastructure, construction sequencing, staging of works, site access and traffic management. A pictorial representation highlighting work and traffic areas was provided. A well documented preliminary construction program was also included. The company stated the project will take 17 weeks, equal to that stated in the RFT.	Its head office is located in Wangara.  The company employs local residents and will use local material/service providers where possible.	74%	\$1,723,708	1

## TENDER 019/15 CIVIL WORKS FOR WHITFORDS AVENUE CARRIAGEWAY DUPLICATION

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
WBHO Civil Pty Ltd	Yes	WBHO Civil Pty Ltd was formed in 2011 by the merger of CECK and WBHO-Carr. It currently employs 415 personnel. The company structure and organisation chart for this project was provided and supported by the resumes of its four key personnel. A detailed list of specialised equipment was supplied with location and back up source. After hours contact would be managed by the project engineer. All additional resources and personnel would be sourced in-house from its workshop in Naval base and Geraldton branch.  A copy of its health and safety management plan policy and safety statistics for past five years were supplied. The company holds accreditation for AS/NZS 4801:2001 (Occupational Health and Safety Management System) and AS/NZS ISO 9001:2008 (Quality Management System) and is a Roads R4/Bridges B3 prequalified Main Roads WA (MRWA) contractor.	It demonstrated considerable experience completing similar projects to the Whitfords Avenue carriageway duplication. Out of 17 project examples submitted, four are similar to the Whitfords Avenue project. These are Toodyay Road widening completed in June 2015 for MRWA, road improvement works at Port Kennedy Drive completed in June 2015 for MRWA, Morawa Town Centre upgrade for the Shire of Morawa in 2014 and Ennis Avenue and Grange Drive intersection upgrade (Rockingham) completed in 2014 for Downer Mouchel and MRWA.	It demonstrated a comprehensive understanding of the project. A detailed methodology specific to the project was submitted. This addressed overview of works, safety, construction methodology, resourcing, temporary infrastructure, progress meeting and final inspection. A well documented preliminary construction program of 17 weeks was also included.	Its head office is in Subiaco and branch offices in Geraldton and Kwinana.  The company will utilise local businesses for the supply of goods and/or services where possible.	65.1%	\$1,981,920	2
All requirements have been met.								

## TENDER 019/15 CIVIL WORKS FOR WHITFORDS AVENUE CARRIAGEWAY DUPLICATION

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Densford Civil Pty Ltd	Yes	It has been in operation since 1991. The company is based in Osborne Park with 60 permanent staff. The structure of the company was not provided but the resumes of four key personnel for this project were supplied. Lists of specialised equipment and three after hours contacts were submitted. The ability to provide additional resources and personnel were not specifically addressed; however the company does have a staff of 60 to supply additional personnel requirements. Copies of a generic safety management plan and safety record for last four years were supplied. The company operates on ISO AS/NZS 4801:2001 (Occupational Health and Safety Management Systems), AS/NZS ISO 9001:2008 (Quality Management System) and ISO 14001:2008 (Environmental Management Systems), is a full member of Civil Contractors Federation and is a Roads R3/Bridges B2 prequalified Main Roads WA (MRWA) contractor.	It demonstrated experience completing similar projects to the Whitfords Avenue carriageway duplication. Four examples were provided supporting its experience and these are Hodges Drive carriageway duplication completed in 2013 for the City of Joondalup, Dampier Highway dual carriageway completed in 2010 for MRWA, Mirrabooka Avenue extension completed in 2011 for the City of Wanneroo and Greenlands Road stage two completed in 2011 for MRWA. Projects currently under construction include the A380 Blast Pavements, Long Term Car Park H and Precinct 2 Car Rental Facility of Perth Airport.	It demonstrated an understanding of the project requirements. A methodology specific to the project was supplied addressing site safety, surveys, mobilisation, staging of works, services, road works and traffic management. A preliminary construction program was also included with project duration of 18 weeks.	The company is based in Osborne Park  The company currently employs residents of the City and will use local material/service suppliers.	58.4%	\$2,036,438	NA
All requirements have been met.								

## TENDER 019/15 CIVIL WORKS FOR WHITFORDS AVENUE CARRIAGEWAY DUPLICATION

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
All Earth Group Pty Ltd	Yes	It has been in operation for more than 20 years. It currently employs 110 personnel. The structure of the company was provided and supported by the resumes of six key personnel. A list of specialised equipment was supplied. After-hours contact and the ability to provide additional personnel and resources were not addressed; however the company does have a staff of 110 to supply additional personnel requirements. The company operates on ISO AS/NZS 4801:2001 (Occupational Health and Safety Management Systems), AS/NZS ISO 9001:2008 (Quality Management System) and ISO 14001:2008 (Environmental Management Systems), is a member of Civil Contractors Federation and a Roads R1 prequalified MRWA contractor. Copies of safety statistics for last three years, occupational safety and health policy and project quality, health and safety plan were provided.	The company demonstrated experience completing similar carriageway duplication projects. Out of eight project examples submitted, two are similar to the Whitfords Avenue project. These are widening, construction and overlay of additional overtaking lane in Gascoyne completed in 2012 for MACA Civil and road widening works between Centenary Avenue and Manning Road completed in 2014 for the City of South Perth.	The company demonstrated an understanding of the project requirements. A provisional program of 17 weeks was supplied and supported by a work methodology addressing construction method, project resources and traffic management.	Its head office is in Maddington and a branch office in Port Hedland.  The company will use local material/service suppliers where possible.	57.9%	\$2,548,695	NA
All requirements have been met.								

## TENDER 019/15 CIVIL WORKS FOR WHITFORDS AVENUE CARRIAGEWAY DUPLICATION

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Roads 2000 Pty Ltd	Yes	Roads 2000 has formed an alliance with Crocker Construction to deliver this project. Roads 2000 is based in Wangara since 1999 and has 32 staff. Crocker Construction has been in operation for more than 40 years and is based in Maddington with unknown number of employees. The organisational chart of Roads 2000 was provided and supported by the resumes of eight and four key personnel from Roads 2000 and Crocker Construction respectively. A brief list of specialised equipment was also supplied. After hours contact and the ability to provide additional resources and personnel were addressed.	The companies demonstrated experience completing similar projects to the Whitfords Avenue carriageway duplication. Numerous project examples were provided to support their experience and these included roadwork for Wangara industrial subdivision for Landcorp (2004-2011), roadwork for The Glades estate at Byford for LWP Property Group (2012) and roadwork for Meadow Springs estate for Mirvac (2013-ongoing).	The companies demonstrated an understanding of the project requirements with a generic methodology and a provisional program.	Roads 2000 is based in Wangara and Crocker Construction is based in Maddington.  Roads 2000 employs residents of the City.	56.4%	\$1,831,484	NA
All requirements have been met								

## TENDER 019/15 CIVIL WORKS FOR WHITFORDS AVENUE CARRIAGEWAY DUPLICATION

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
MACA Civil Pty Ltd	Yes	MACA Limited, an international civil and mining contracting group providing services to the Australian and Latin American mining and construction industries, has been in operation since 2002. MACA Civil Pty Ltd is a subsidiary of MACA Limited. The company is located in Welshpool and has 1300 employees. The organisation structure of the group and company was provided and supported by qualifications, experience and roles of five key personnel. A brief list of equipment was supplied but no information was provided on its ability to provide additional resources and after hours contacts.	It demonstrated experience completing similar projects to the Whitfords Avenue carriageway duplication. Three project examples for MRWA were provided supporting its experience and these are 45 km long Indian Ocean Drive upgrade, Onslow Road upgrade and design, construction and sealing of three sections of Goldfields Highway.	The company demonstrated an understanding of the project requirements. A provisional program of 17 weeks was supplied and supported by a work methodology addressing construction concepts and techniques and traffic management.	The company is located in Welshpool.  This criterion was not specifically addressed.	53%	\$2,588,149	NA
All requirements have been met.								

## TENDER 019/15 CIVIL WORKS FOR WHITFORDS AVENUE CARRIAGEWAY DUPLICATION

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Jaxon Civil Pty Ltd	Yes	Jaxon Civil is a part of Jaxon Group and has been in operation for more than 50 years. The company is based in South Perth and has over 100 staff. The Group structure and the management structure for this project were provided with the qualification and employment history of four key personnel. A list of specialised equipment was supplied. Ability to provide additional personnel and resources was addressed but no after hours contacts were provided.	The company did not demonstrate sufficient experience completing similar carriageway duplication projects in metropolitan areas. Out of eight project examples submitted, Thomas Road widening project completed in 2013 for MRWA and Northwest Coastal Highway realignment project completed in 2012 for MRWA are similar in scope but not in high traffic metropolitan areas.	Itl did not demonstrate sufficient understanding of the project requirements. The submission provided sample task instructions but no specific construction methodology addressing various scope of works. A provisional project program was supplied.	The company is based in South Perth.  The company will use local material/service suppliers where possible.	50.7%	\$1,954,228	NA
All requirements have been met.								

## TENDER 019/15 CIVIL WORKS FOR WHITFORDS AVENUE CARRIAGEWAY DUPLICATION

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Curnow Group	Yes	It has been in operation since 2009. The company is located in Joondalup with unknown number of staff. The organisational chart of the company was supplied with the resumes of three key personnel. The company has proposed a Graduate Engineer as the Project Manager whose experience in roadwork project was not elaborated. A list of specialised equipment was supplied. The Project Manager was nominated as the after-hours contact but the ability to provide additional personnel and resources were not addressed. The company operates its own quality management system. A brief safety policy was supplied but no safety statistics and safety management plan were provided.	It did not demonstrate experience completing similar carriageway duplication projects. Out of fourteen project examples submitted, only two are similar to the Whitfords Avenue project. These are Tomah Road (Carnarvon) project completed in 2013 for Landcorp and Neerabup Road project completed in 2012 for the City of Wanneroo.	The company demonstrated an understanding of the project requirements. A provisional program was supplied and supported by a methodology to complete the work in eight phases.	Curnow Group's head office is in Joondalup.	49.8%	\$1,836,629	NA
All requirements have been met.								



## TENDER 019/15 CIVIL WORKS FOR WHITFORDS AVENUE CARRIAGEWAY DUPLICATION

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>The Trustee for the Dowsing Family Trust t/as Dowsing Concrete</p> <p>All requirements have been met.</p>		It has been in operation since 1985. The company is located in Welshpool with more than 50 staff. The organisational chart of the company was provided and supported by the qualification and experience of 11 key personnel. A list of specialised equipment was supplied. After hours contact and the ability to provide additional resources and personnel were addressed. Copies of its health and safety management plan and safety records were supplied.	It did not demonstrate sufficient experience completing similar carriageway duplication projects. Project examples submitted are mostly construction of bus embayments and minor road widening and intersection upgrade works.	It did not demonstrate an understanding of the project requirements. A generic project management methodology was provided without a detailed construction methodology. It proposed to complete the work in 20 weeks, three weeks more than as stated in the RFT. The start date for the construction was proposed on 20 July 2015 but the project program reflected the start date as 17 August 2015.	<p>The company is located in Welshpool.</p> <p>The company employs local residents.</p>	47.1%	\$2,101,396	NA

## TENDER 019/15 CIVIL WORKS FOR WHITFORDS AVENUE CARRIAGEWAY DUPLICATION

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
TRACC Civil Pty Ltd	Yes	It was established in 2011. It has 95 staff. The organisational chart of the company was provided and supported by role, qualification and experience of three key personnel. A list of specialised equipment was supplied. After hours contact was not provided and the company stated that it has access to additional equipment, if needed.  The company operates on ISO AS/NZS 4801:2001 (Occupational Health and Safety Management Systems), AS/NZS ISO 9001:2008 (Quality Management System) and ISO 14001:2008 (Environmental Management Systems). Copies of its occupational health and safety policy and safety records were supplied but a copy of its safety management plan/procedure was not provided.	Two project examples (Mundijong Road Extension project for the City of Rockingham in 2013 and Gilmore Avenue Duplication for the City of Kwinana) were submitted by the company to demonstrate its experience. It provided dates of contract for only one project.	It did not demonstrate an understanding of the project requirements. A brief methodology was provided without a detailed construction methodology. A project program of 17 weeks was supplied.	It is located in Bibra Lake.  The company currently employs residents of the City and will use local material/service suppliers.	43.5%	\$2,389,158	NA
All requirements have been met								

## TENDER 019/15 CIVIL WORKS FOR WHITFORDS AVENUE CARRIAGEWAY DUPLICATION

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Ngarda Civil & Mining	Yes	It has been in operation for an unknown period with unknown number of employees. The submission did not provide any information on its structure of business, details of its support team, specialised equipment list, after hours contacts, its ability to provide additional personnel and resources and its safety records. The company operates on ISO AS/NZS 4801:2001 (Occupational Health and Safety Management Systems), AS/NZS ISO 9001:2008 (Quality Management System) and ISO 14001:2008 (Environmental Management Systems).	The company did not demonstrate experience completing similar carriageway duplication projects. Four project examples were provided to support its experience, but none in carriageway duplication. Periods and dates of the four example contracts were supplied but only one project was completed in the past two years.	It demonstrated an understanding of the project requirements. A stage wise construction methodology with pictorial representation specific to the project was supplied addressing mobilisation, survey and set-out, traffic management drainage, earthworks and pavement construction.	Its head office is located in West Perth with a regional office in Darwin.  The company currently employs local residents and will use local material/service suppliers.	37.7%	\$1,779,099	NA
All requirements have been met.								

## TENDER 019/15 CIVIL WORKS FOR WHITFORDS AVENUE CARRIAGEWAY DUPLICATION

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
All Civils WA and Asphalt Services	Yes	All Civils WA has formed an alliance with Asphalt Services to deliver this project. Asphalt Services is located in Hope Valley and has been in operation for the past 15 years with an unknown number of employees. The organisational chart of Asphalt Services was provided. The submission provided a list of equipment for application of asphalt works but no bulk earthworks equipment details was supplied. After hours contacts were mentioned but ability to provide additional resources was not addressed. Asphalt Services operates on AS/NZS ISO 9001:2008 (Quality Management System). Safety records were provided but copies of health and safety policy and plan were not supplied.	The companies did not demonstrate experience completing similar projects to the Whitfords Avenue carriageway duplication. All example projects provided are asphalt works only projects. Period of the projects were mentioned but no dates provided.	All Civils WA and Asphalt Services did not demonstrate sufficient understanding of the project requirements. A provisional program was supplied and supported by a methodology to complete the work in 12 stages. The submission proposed to construct three intersections concurrently which could place considerable traffic management issues.	Asphalt Services is located in Hope Valley.  This criterion was not specifically addressed.	36.3%	\$1,746,239	NA
All requirements have been met.								

## TENDER 019/15 CIVIL WORKS FOR WHITFORDS AVENUE CARRIAGEWAY DUPLICATION

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
CGH Civil Pty Ltd	Yes	It has been in operation since 2005 and provides civil construction and plant hire services to the construction industry. It has 12 staff. A brief list of equipment and resumes of its two key personnel were provided. The organisational structure of the company, after hours contacts for emergency requirements and its ability to provide additional resources were not supplied. A copy of the company's integrated management system was provided. No safety record was supplied.	The company did not demonstrate experience completing similar carriageway duplication projects. It provided civil construction and plant hire services to Leighton Contractors for various construction projects. No period and dates of contracts was supplied.	The company demonstrated an understanding of the project requirements. A provisional program was supplied and supported by a methodology to complete the work.	It is located in Bibra Lake.  This criterion was not addressed.	36%	\$2,586,002	NA
All requirements have been met.								

## TENDER 019/15 CIVIL WORKS FOR WHITFORDS AVENUE CARRIAGEWAY DUPLICATION

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Watpac Civil and Mining Pty Ltd (Conforming Offer)	No	Non-compliant Not assessed						
All requirements have not been met.								
Watpac Civil and Mining Pty Ltd (Alternative Offer)	No	Non-compliant Not assessed						
All requirements have not been met								
Brierty Limited	No	Non-compliant Not assessed						
All requirements have not been met								