

TENDER RFT 029/15 CIVIL WORKS FOR OCEAN REEF ROAD CARRIAGEWAY DUPLICATION

**SUMMARY OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS**

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Lump Sum	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>Ertech Pty Ltd (Conforming and Alternative Offers)</p> <p>All requirements have been met.</p>	Yes	<p>It was founded in 1981. It has offices in Perth, Melbourne, Adelaide, Port Hedland, Kalgoorlie and Karratha. It has over 630 employees. An organisation chart and details of key personnel including their qualifications, skills and industry experience were provided. Details of specialised equipment that will be used to complete the works and afterhours contacts for emergency requirements were supplied. It is well resourced and can access local labour hire subcontractors for additional personnel if required. It operates with an accredited quality management system to ISO9001 and an accredited safety management system. Copies of its safety management plan and statistics were provided.</p>	<p>It demonstrated experience in completing similar projects for private organisations and governments. Examples of works included Catalina Marmion Avenue intersection civil works (completed 2013) for the Tamala Park Regional Council, Beeliar Drive improvement works from four to six lanes (2013) for Perron Investments, Connolly Drive duplication from Burns Beach Road to MacNaughton Crescent (completed 2009) and Whitfords Avenue carriageway duplication (due for completion December 2015) for the City. The works carried out for the Tamala Park Regional Council and the City involved earthworks, road works and stormwater drainage while working on main arterial roads with high traffic volumes.</p>	<p>It demonstrated a thorough understanding and appreciation of the City's requirements. It has been in the civil construction industry for many years and has in the past successfully completed similar projects for the City. Its Submission included a clear and well thought out construction methodology, a construction program and work staging diagrams. It proposed to carry out the works in six stages. Its alternative Offer provides a construction method eliminating the requirement for horizontal drilling in rocky ground.</p>	<p>Its head office in WA is located in Wangara.</p> <p>It will source material and services, where possible, from suppliers closest to the project. Also, it has numerous staff reside within the City.</p>	80%	<p>\$2,818,595 (Conforming Offer)</p> <p>\$2,683,805 (Alternative Offer)</p>	1

TENDER RFT 029/15 CIVIL WORKS FOR OCEAN REEF ROAD CARRIAGEWAY DUPLICATION

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Lump Sum	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Georgiou Group Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	It was formed in 1996. The company has offices in Queensland, New South Wales, Victoria and WA. It has more than 700 staff. An organisation chart and details of key personnel including their qualifications, skills and years of experience in the industry were provided. A list of major plant (to carry out civil works), large/small plant and equipment (for earthworks) and general plant that will be used to complete the works was supplied. It is well resourced and has the ability to provide additional personnel if required. It operates with an accredited quality management system to ISO9001 and a safety management system to AS4801. Copies of its safety management plan and statistics were provided.	It has been in the civil construction industry for a number of decades. The company has in the past completed similar projects for state and local governments. Examples of works included Lenore Road dual carriageway upgrade (completed 2014), Hepburn Avenue duplication (completed 2011) and Hartman Drive extension from Gngara Road to Hepburn Avenue (completed 2010) for the City of Wanneroo. These projects involved existing main road works, traffic management and presence of existing services.	It demonstrated a sound understanding of the City's requirements. It provided a comprehensive overview and staging of the works. Its proposed approach covered all aspects of requirements including site access/ establishment, waste management (excess topsoil retained on site) and supplier chain management. A construction program was supplied. The panel noted drainage by open trenching was suggested.	Its head office in WA is located in Osborne Park.  Approximately 5% of its workforce lives in the City. It stated the company would utilise a number of subcontractors and suppliers around the City for goods and services on this project.	75.2%	\$2,998,544	2

## TENDER RFT 029/15 CIVIL WORKS FOR OCEAN REEF ROAD CARRIAGEWAY DUPLICATION

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Lump Sum	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Densford Civil Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	It was established in 1991. It currently has about 60 full-time staff. Its structure of business and details of key personnel including their qualifications and industry experience were provided. An extensive list of plant and equipment that will be used was supplied. It indicated the company has significant resources available and has the ability to provide additional personnel if required. Afterhours contacts for emergency requirements were provided. It operates with an accredited quality management system to ISO9001 and a safety management system to AS4801. A copy of its safety procedures was supplied. Its safety statistics were not provided.	It has completed several road reconstruction projects over the past three years for state and local governments. These included Dampier Highway duplication (completed 2010) for MRWA, Mirrabooka Avenue extension (completed 2011) for the City of Wanneroo and Hodges Drive Duplication (completed 2013) for the City. These projects involved traffic and pedestrian management with staging of works.	It demonstrated a thorough understanding of the City's requirements. It submitted a comprehensive response and project plan covers all items including services lists. A preliminary program, construction sequence and timeframes to complete the works were provided.	It is located in Osborne Park.  It utilises various businesses in the City for goods and services.	72.3%	\$2,691,413	3

## TENDER RFT 029/15 CIVIL WORKS FOR OCEAN REEF ROAD CARRIAGEWAY DUPLICATION

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Lump Sum	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Tracc Civil Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	It was established in 2011. It currently employs 160 staff. An organisation chart and details of key personnel including their qualifications and industry experience were provided. A list of plant and equipment was supplied. Whilst the company will be able to supply most of the plant from its internal fleet, it regularly hires trucks and equipment from other companies. It indicated the company has sufficient road crews which it can draw from other projects if required to complete the works. It operates with an accredited quality management system to ISO9001 and safety management system to AS4801. A copy of its safety procedures was not supplied but safety references (index) and statistics were provided.	It demonstrated experience in completing similar projects for various organisations including local governments. However, only three examples of works were provided and these were Mundijong Road extension (completed 2014) for the City of Rockingham, Gilmore Avenue duplication (completed May 2015) for the City of Kwinana and Goddard Street in Rockingham (completed June 2015) for Landcorp.	It demonstrated a sound understanding of the City's requirements. Its proposed approach is to construct the new road initially and to complete all other works section by section. A construction program and timeframes to carry out the tasks were supplied. However, it did not appear to include retaining wall construction.	It is located in Bibra Lake.  It endeavours to purchase goods and services from local suppliers where possible.	68.6%	\$2,757,977	4

## TENDER RFT 029/15 CIVIL WORKS FOR OCEAN REEF ROAD CARRIAGEWAY DUPLICATION

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Lump Sum	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Ralmana Pty Ltd trading as R J Vincent & Co All requirements have been met.	Yes	It was established in 1955. It currently employs 237 permanent staff. An organisation chart and details of key personnel including their qualifications and years of experience were provided. A comprehensive list of equipment that will be used to carry out the works was provided. It is well resourced and has the ability to provide additional personnel if required. Afterhours contacts for emergency requirements were provided. It operates with an accredited quality management system to ISO9001 and a safety management system to AS4800. Copies of its safety management plan and statistics were supplied.	It demonstrated experience in completing similar projects for various organisations including local governments. Examples of works included Lenore Road realignment and upgrade stage 2 (2015 ongoing) for the City of Wanneroo and Bertram Road Duplication (completed 2012) for the City of Kwinana. Other examples of works were provided and these included civil subdivision works for Satterley Property Group (Marmion Avenue intersection completed 2012) and Capricorn Village Joint Venture (Marmion Avenue extension from Jindalee to Yanchep completed 2007).	It demonstrated a sound understanding of the required tasks. Whilst its response was brief, the proposed methodology included a list of tasks to be carried out to complete the project, from mobilisation/site setup and traffic control to earthworks, road works and drainage works.	Its head office is located in Balcatta. It will source fuel, labour hire and consumables from local suppliers around the City where possible.	68.1%	\$3,131,347	5

## TENDER RFT 029/15 CIVIL WORKS FOR OCEAN REEF ROAD CARRIAGEWAY DUPLICATION

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Lump Sum	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
WBHO Infrastructure Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	It was formed in 2015 with the merger of CECK (civil construction company established in 1987) and WBHD-Carr (incorporating Carr Civil Constructing and Northcoast Contractors). It has offices in Queensland, New South Wales, Victoria and WA. It currently employs 500 staff. Its structure of business and details of key personnel including their qualifications and experience in the industry were supplied. Details of specialised equipment and afterhours contacts for emergency requirements were provided. It has the ability to provide additional personnel if required. It operates with an accredited quality management system to ISO9001 and a safety management system to AS4801. Copies of its safety management plan and statistics were supplied.	It demonstrated experience in completing projects of a similar nature for state and local governments. Examples of works included Toodyay Road widening (completed June 2015), Road improvement works on Melville – Mandurah Highway, Ennis Avenue/Port Kennedy Drive (completed June 2015) for MRWA, Flores and Place Roads intersection upgrade (completed 2013) for the City of Greater Geraldton.	It demonstrated a sound understanding of the City's requirements. Its proposed construction methodology included a list of tasks to be carried out to complete the works, from pre-mobilisation (preparation of safety and traffic management plans), site establishment and site clearing to subgrade preparation and asphalt.	Its WA office is located in Subiaco.  It will ensure requirements are firstly met where possible through businesses closest to the project site.	68.1%	\$2,926,698	5

## TENDER RFT 029/15 CIVIL WORKS FOR OCEAN REEF ROAD CARRIAGEWAY DUPLICATION

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Lump Sum	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Jaxon Civil Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	It indicated it has been at the forefront of construction in WA for more than 50 years. The date of when the company was formed was not provided. It employs over 100 staff. An organisation chart and details of four only key personnel including their qualifications and experience in the construction industry were supplied. It stated it is sufficiently resourced and has the ability to provide additional personnel if required. It will utilise a combination of dry and wet hire of heavy mobile equipment. Afterhours contacts for emergency requirements were provided. It operates with an accredited quality management system to ISO9001 and a safety management system to AS4801. Copies of its safety management plan and statistics were supplied.	It demonstrated experience in completing similar projects for state governments. Examples of works were provided and these included Guildford Railway Station carpark upgrade (completed September 2015) for the Public Transport Authority, Thomas Road widening at Oakford (completed 2013) and Northwest Coastal Highway realignment at Northhampton (completed 2012) for MRWA. Some of these works were carried out in regional areas which involved managing high speed and not high volume traffic. Examples of works completed for local governments.	It demonstrated an understanding of the required tasks. It submitted a general response but a Gantt chart and timeline to carry out the tasks were provided. It proposed to complete the works in 12 stages. Works to commence on eastbound lane (stages one to four), westbound lane (stages five to eight), kerbing, footpaths, traffic bollards and spotting for line marking and signs on both eastbound and westbound lanes (stages nine to twelve).	It is located in South Perth and has a regional office in Port Hedland.  It indicated every effort will be made to include local companies for goods and services.	60.6%	Failed to meet the acceptable score.  Tendered lump sum price is \$\$2,807,329.	

## TENDER RFT 029/15 CIVIL WORKS FOR OCEAN REEF ROAD CARRIAGEWAY DUPLICATION

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Lump Sum	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Wormall Civil Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	It commenced operations in 1984. It has approximately 250 staff. An organisation chart and details of key personnel including their qualifications and industry experience were provided. Details of specialised equipment that will be used to carry out the works were supplied. The ability to provide additional personnel if required and afterhours contacts for emergency requirements were not addressed. It has an accredited quality management system to ISO9001 and a safety management system to AS4801. Copies of its safety policy and statistics were supplied.	It demonstrated experience in completing civil construction projects for various organisations. Examples of works included Shenton Road Underpass at Swanbourne (completed 2013) for Scotch College and Kwinana Freeway extension (completed 2009) for The Southern Gateway Alliance. The value of these works was not provided. For the Kwinana Freeway extension project, the company was engaged as a contractor to load sand and maintain limestone access roads.	It demonstrated an understanding of the required tasks. A Gantt chart including a list of tasks and timeframes to complete the works was supplied. However, only general construction procedures and sample methodology for subdivision works that the company carried out in the past were provided.	Its head office is based in Maddington. It supports other WA companies where possible and purchase goods and services from local businesses / subcontractors.	54.6%	Failed to meet the acceptable score. Tendered lump sum price is \$2,705,000.	



## TENDER RFT 029/15 CIVIL WORKS FOR OCEAN REEF ROAD CARRIAGEWAY DUPLICATION

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Lump Sum	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
BCL Group Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	It is a Perth based civil and landscape contractor servicing areas throughout WA. The date of when the company was established and the number of full-time employees were not supplied. An organisation chart and details of key personnel including their role, skills and experience were provided. A small range of equipment was supplied. It indicated other equipment is sourced on a project by project basis and the company has the resources to increase its fleet size or capacity if required. Afterhours contacts were not supplied. It has its own quality management system and a safety policy in place. A copy of its safety management plan was provided but safety statistics were not supplied.	It demonstrated experience in completing roads upgrade for local governments including the Shire of Laverton (main street upgrade completed 2014) and the Shire of Morawa (main street upgrade completed April 2015). Other examples of works were provided and these included construction of playing fields and associated infrastructure (completed June 2015) for the Cities of Kalgoorlie Boulder and Swan (due for completion 2016). These projects involved streetscapes, ovals, bulk earthworks, road pavement and asphalt works with minimal traffic volumes and traffic management.	It demonstrated an understanding of the required tasks. It proposed to undertake the works in three stages with construction of two new roundabouts (stage one) and one other new roundabout (stage two) and construction works for the widening of existing carriageway (stage three). An indicative program was provided.	It is located in Wangara. One of its subcontractors resides within the City.	54.3%	Failed to meet the acceptable score. Tendered lump sum price is \$3,542,743.	

## TENDER RFT 029/15 CIVIL WORKS FOR OCEAN REEF ROAD CARRIAGEWAY DUPLICATION

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Lump Sum	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>Curnow Group (Hire) Pty Ltd</p> <p>All requirements have been met.</p>	Yes	<p>It has been operating since 2009. It has over 30 employees. An organisation chart and details of key personnel including their qualifications and industry experience were provided. Details of specialised equipment that will be used to complete the works and afterhours contacts for emergency requirements were supplied. It utilises a recruitment firm for additional personnel if required. It has its own quality management system and a safety policy in place. Copies of its safety management plan and statistics were provided.</p>	<p>It demonstrated experience in delivering roadwork projects for various organisations including local governments. Examples of works were provided and these included Northbridge Plaza Redevelopment (completed 2014) for the City of Perth, Tomah Road project (completed 2013) for Landcorp and Neerabup project (completed 2011) for the City of Wanneroo. These are small value projects but involved earthworks, pavement, road construction and drainage works.</p>	<p>It proposed staging the works to minimise impact on the general public and manage traffic with minimal disruption. A preliminary program was supplied. However, it submitted a brief response with limited information on proposed construction methodology.</p>	<p>Its head office is located in Wangara.</p> <p>Most of its subcontractors are located in the Cities of Joondalup and Wanneroo.</p>	53.4%	<p>Failed to meet the acceptable score.</p> <p>Tendered lump sum price is \$2,921,788.</p>	

## TENDER RFT 029/15 CIVIL WORKS FOR OCEAN REEF ROAD CARRIAGEWAY DUPLICATION

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Lump Sum	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>The Trustee for the Croker Unit Trust (Crocker Construction)</p> <p>All requirements have been met.</p>	Yes	<p>It was established in 1978. It currently employs approximately 50 staff. Its structure of business and details of key personnel including their qualifications and industry experience were provided. An extensive plant list was supplied. It will utilise a local casual workforce services for additional personnel if required. It has an accredited quality management system to ISO9001 and a safety management system to AS4801. A copy of its safety management plan was provided. Its safety statistics and afterhours contacts for emergency requirements were not supplied.</p>	<p>It demonstrated experience in completing similar projects. Examples of works provided were predominantly sub-division works. These included Wangara Industrial sub-division (completed 2011) for Landcorp, The Glades at Byford residential subdivision (2012 ongoing) for LWP Property Group and Lakeside Estate Hammond Park (completed 2013) for J.H. Properties. The works carried out at The Glades at Byford – Doley Road and Hammond Road Beeliiar - roundabout were of a similar nature to the City's requirements. One location is a major thoroughfare and the other has high traffic and on top of major existing services.</p>	<p>It did not fully demonstrate its understanding of the City's requirements. Whilst its Submission included a Gantt chart and timeframes to complete the works, only a brief overview of its proposed construction methodology was provided.</p>	<p>It is located in Forrestdale.</p> <p>It stated the anticipated benefits to the local community include increased capacity for local businesses to provide goods and services for the project.</p>	52.8%	<p>Failed to meet the acceptable score.</p> <p>Tendered lump sum price is \$2,736,934.</p>	

## TENDER RFT 029/15 CIVIL WORKS FOR OCEAN REEF ROAD CARRIAGEWAY DUPLICATION

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Lump Sum	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>Scott Construction &amp; Development Pty Ltd</p> <p>All requirements have been met.</p>	Yes	<p>It was established in 1996. An organisation chart and details of two key personnel including their qualifications and industry experience were provided. It did not address the number of full-time employees, afterhours contacts for emergency requirements and the ability to provide additional personnel if required. A list of equipment that will be used to carry out the works was provided. It has its own quality management system and a safety policy in place. It stated the company has had no lost time injury, incidents or accidents over the last two years. A copy of its safety procedures was supplied.</p>	<p>It demonstrated experience in completing civil construction projects for various organisations. It has in the past completed Joondalup Drive widening for the City of Wanneroo. Other examples of works were provided but these were mainly subdivision projects and transport yards and included Belgravia Estate (completed 2007) for Satterley Property Group/Department of Housing and Transport Yard North Fremantle (completed May 2015) for Toll Group.</p>	<p>It demonstrated some understanding of the City's requirements. It submitted a brief response and limited information on its approach to carry out the works. It stated two teams will be on site at all times and works will be completed from intersection to intersection. A basic construction program was supplied.</p>	<p>It is located in Balcatta.</p> <p>It will engage local contractors where possible. It suggested some of the mulch and topsoil created from site be utilised by the Duncraig Edible Garden Project for planting and composting.</p>	51.6%	<p>Failed to meet the acceptable score.</p> <p>Tendered lump sum price is \$2,887,852.</p>	

TENDER RFT 029/15 CIVIL WORKS FOR OCEAN REEF ROAD CARRIAGEWAY DUPLICATION

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Lump Sum	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>Viento Contracting Services Pty Ltd</p> <p>All requirements have been met.</p>	Yes	<p>It was formed in 2012. Its structure of business and details of key personnel including their qualifications and years of industry experience were provided. The number of full-time employees, details of equipment, afterhours contacts for emergency requirements and the ability to provide additional personnel if required were not addressed. It has its own quality management system and a safety policy in place. Copies of its safety system (index only) and statistics were supplied.</p>	<p>It has experience in completing roads maintenance and upgrades in regional areas for various mining companies. Examples of works were provided but included only three projects and these were Nammuldi Below Water Table Project (completed February 2015) for Rio Tinto, Hillside Rail Crossing (completed 2014) and Solomon Ammonium Nitrate Bulk Storage Facility (completed 2014) for Fortescue Metals Group. Though some of these works were on a large scale and involved clearing, drainage and asphalt, the projects were less similar in nature to the City's requirements.</p>	<p>It demonstrated an understanding of the City's requirements. It submitted a general overview of the construction methodology. It proposed to commence road construction from the west end of Ocean Reef Road and works on the four intersections will be carried out one at a time to lessen the impact on local road users.</p>	<p>It is located in Hazelmere.</p> <p>It stated the company is committed to utilise local suppliers where possible.</p>	46.7%	<p>Failed to meet the acceptable score.</p> <p>Tendered lump sum price is \$3,279,662.</p>	

## TENDER RFT 029/15 CIVIL WORKS FOR OCEAN REEF ROAD CARRIAGEWAY DUPLICATION

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Lump Sum	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>The Trustee for the GMF Trust trading as GMF Contractors Pty Limited</p> <p>All requirements have not been met. It did not address some of the selection criteria. The Submission was included for further assessment on the basis that clarifications could be sought from GMF Contractors Pty Limited, if shortlisted for consideration.</p>	Partially compliant.	It commenced operation 20 years ago and its core area of services is earthmoving. It currently has approximately 70 staff. An organisation chart and a list of equipment were provided. However, it submitted a brief response and limited information on key personnel, their qualifications and experience. It did not address the ability to provide additional personnel, if required and after-hours contacts for emergency requirements. Copies of its safety procedures and statistics were not supplied.	It demonstrated limited experience in completing similar projects. Examples of works included a list of projects under various headings (large factory works, shopping centres, government works, civil works and residential developments). However, it did not address the scope of works, period and dates, outcomes and similarity to the City's requirements.	It did not submit a response.	It is located in Malaga. It did not submit a response.	14.6%	Failed to meet the acceptable score. Tendered lump sum price is \$3,828,913.	