APPENDIX 6

ATTACHMENT 1

SUMMARY OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Capacity	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price (Option 1)	Qualitative Rank
McCorkell Constructions (WA) Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	It demonstrated considerable experience completing similar new and refurbishment projects Twenty eight project examples were supplied supporting its experience and these included renovation, extension and refurbishment works to Bakers House community centre for the City of Armadale, refurbishment, upgrade and extension of Medina Hall for the City of Kwinana, construction of Piara Waters sports pavilion for the City of Armadale and Charlottes Vineyard sports pavilion for the City of Swan.	McCorkell Constructions has been in operation since 1928 in Victoria. Its Perth office started in 2011 at Stirling Street and has 50 full-time staff. The company structure was provided and supported by the experience, qualifications and role of 12 key personnel. The company has sufficient equipment, the ability to provide additional resources and personnel and respond to emergency requirements. The company operates on accredited AS/NZS 4801:2001 Safety Management System, ISO 14001:2004 Environmental Management System and ISO 9001:2008 Quality Management System. A copy of its quality, safety and environment management system was provided but no safety record was supplied.	McCorkell Constructions demonstrated a comprehensive understanding of the project requirements. A detailed methodology specific to the project was supplied addressing site security, set out, services coordination, sequencing of finishes, key risks and risk mitigation, program risk and environmental risk. A well documented preliminary construction program was also included.	Its Perth office is at Stirling Street. This criterion was not specifically addressed.	65.4%	\$903,092	1

	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria						
Respondent & Description of Response		Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Capacity	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price (Option 1)	Qualitative Rank
LKS Constructions (WA) Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	LKS Constructions demonstrated experience completing refurbishment projects for local and state government organisations. Thirteen project examples were provided to demonstrate its experience and these included disability access upgrades for various train stations for PTA, an office fit out for the Claremont Scout Hall and Department of Child Protection Armadale office, a disability access upgrade for Melville Senior High School and WCIT Joondalup cafeteria upgrade and external works.	It has been in operation since 2010. It has 17 staff. The company structure was provided and supported by the CVs of three key personnel. The company has sufficient equipment to fulfil the requirements of the project. Afterhours contact and the ability to provide additional personnel and resources were addressed. Safety statistics for the past two years, occupational health and safety policy, and a sample Occupational, Health and Safety Management Plan of the company were provided.	LKS Constructions demonstrated a good understanding of the requirements. A detailed methodology specific to the project was submitted. This addressed premobilisation, site establishment, demolition and construction. A preliminary construction program was also included.	It is based in Malaga. The company will use local suppliers.	59.8%	\$976,400	2

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				1		
		Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Capacity	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price (Option 1)	Qualitative Rank
Adrina Project Management Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	The company did not demonstrate sufficient experience completing similar refurbishment and extension projects. Numerous project examples were supplied but almost all projects are small scale refurbishment of residence/classrooms/sc hool laboratory and new residence construction.	It started its operation in 1997 in Sydney and Melbourne. Its Perth office has been operation since 2001 in Mindarie and currently has 32 staff. The company's organisational chart and experience, qualification and role of three key personnel were provided. A list of specialised equipment was supplied. Afterhours contact and the ability to provide additional personnel and resources were addressed. Safety records and a safety management plan were provided.	Adrina Project Management demonstrated an understanding of the requirements. A methodology was supplied addressing mobilisation, site establishment, refurbishment works, internal fit-outs, commissioning, delivery management and traffic management. A provisional construction program was also provided.	Its Perth office is in Mindarie. The company employs local residents and will use local suppliers/services.	55.7%	\$929,475	3

	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria						
Respondent & Description of Response		Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Capacity	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price (Option 1)	Qualitative Rank
Classic Contractors Pty Ltd	Yes	The company demonstrated	The company has been in operation	Classic Contractors demonstrated an	It is located in Willetton.	51.9%	\$802,292	4
All requirements have been met.		experience completing similar new and refurbishment projects for local governments. Five project examples were supplied supporting its experience and these included extension and refurbishment works of the Armadale Post Office for the City of Armadale, extension and upgrade works of Cassidy Road Pavilion and Hume Road Pavilion for the City of Gosnells, refurbishment of exterior of Ferguson Pavilion for the City of Swan and construction of Tom Bateman Pavilion Number 2 for the City of Gosnells.	since 1996. It has 30 full time employees and is located in Willetton. Qualifications, experience and the role of three key personnel were provided but the company structure was not supplied. A brief list of specialised equipment was supplied but afterhours contact, the ability to provide additional resources and personnel and its safety record were not addressed. A copy of its safety management plan was provided.	understanding of the requirements. A brief methodology was supplied addressing preconstruction works, procurement, main works and finishing works with a provisional construction program.	This criterion was not specifically addressed.			

	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria						
Respondent & Description of Response		Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Capacity	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price (Option 1)	Qualitative Rank
R.E. Asset Logistics Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	The company did not demonstrate adequate experience completing projects of a similar nature. Only two project examples were supplied without any dates. These were refurbishment of single bed units at Cockburn Lodge retirement units for The Country Women's Association of WA and building fit out works for the cafe of St John of God Hospital in Midland	R.E. Asset Logistics, the maintenance and minor works division of Pyramid Group, started its operation in 2011. It has three staff and is located in Osborne Park. The structure of the business of Pyramid Group and experience, qualifications and roles of three key personnel were provided. After- hours contact and the ability to provide additional resources and personnel were provided but no equipment list was supplied. Copies of its safety records and health and safety manual were provided.	The company demonstrated a comprehensive understanding of the requirements. A detailed methodology was supplied with a provisional construction program. The methodology was accompanied with relevant images/drawings where necessary and addressed construction site risks and controls, site establishment, noise control, demolition, excavation and dust management, concrete slab, structural steel and wall construction, interior works, drainage installation and clean up.	It is located in Osborne Park. This criterion was not specifically addressed.	42.5%	\$868,880	5

	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria						
Respondent & Description of Response		Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Capacity	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price (Option 1)	Qualitative Rank
Linebay Holdings Pty Ltd Connolly Building Company All requirements	Yes	The company did not demonstrate experience completing similar projects. Fifteen project examples were supplied	Connolly Building Company has been in business since 2005. It is based in Joondalup and has	The company did not demonstrate an understanding of the requirements. The methodology	It is based in Joondalup.	35.6%	\$736,280	6
have been met.		without any dates and periods of contract. Majority of the projects are small scale refurbishment works and only Victoria Park Hillview Centre external restoration project is similar in scope.	two full time staff – Manager/Superviso r/Contract Administrator and Office Administrator. The structure of the business and a brief list of equipment were provided. The Manager is designated as the after hours contact and the company will use labour hire firms for additional personnel requirement. Safety was not addressed.	focussed on various management plans without any details of the refurbishment/extens ion works. No construction program was provided.	Building Company employs local residents and will use local material/servic e suppliers.			