

SUMMARY OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
McCorkell Constructions (WA) Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	<p>It has been in operation since 1928 and since 2011 in WA with 50 staff located in WA. A staff chart was provided together with details of six key staff, a breakdown of positions in the WA team and CVs of the nominated project and site managers. It has more than 30 site staff and listed 10 subcontractors. Many of the subcontractors worked on the original construction and the nominated project manager was the site manager for the project under previous employment with CPD Group.</p> <p>It nominated two after-hours contacts. The company has sufficient internal capacity to provide any additional resources that are required. The company operates a certified AS/NZS 4801 safety management system and has had no safety incidents in the 2014/15 and 2015/16.</p>	<p>McCorkell Constructions demonstrated experience completing similar refurbishment projects. Three examples were supplied supporting the experience. These were the Medina Hall refurbishment completed in 2014 for the City of Kwinana (\$1.6M), North Cottesloe Primary renovation of a heritage army building completed in 2014 (\$1.7M) and Bakers House extension and refurbishment completed in 2012 for the City of Armadale (\$1M). The nominated referees are: City of Armadale, City of Kwinana and Parry & Whyte Architects.</p>	<p>The company demonstrated a thorough understanding of the requirements. The methodology set out staff responsibilities, deployment, risk assessment, safety, a project specific construction methodology and program. The response addressed the use of subcontractors that worked on the project before and warranting previously completed work.</p>	<p>The company is located in Perth.</p> <p>The company uses trades in the northern suburbs of Perth and has approached the subcontractors used by the previous contractor.</p>	68.8%	\$715,850	1

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
D.B Cunningham Pty Ltd T/as Advantearing – Civil Engineers	Yes	Advantearing was established in 1980. It has nine engineering and administration staff and 5-20 labour personnel. An organisational chart was supplied with the details of 12 staff, detailing their role, experience and qualifications. It nominated seven subcontractors. The after-hours contact was nominated in the site plan as the site engineer. Additional personnel and resources were not addressed. The company operates an accredited ISO AS/NZS 4801 safety management system and provided its safety policy statement and safety record of 2012-2015.	Advantearing demonstrated limited experience in projects of a similar nature to the SES facility extension. Six example projects were supplied in the offer; however the three projects set out in detailed project sheets were for a Museum street enhancement, Oxford Street reserve redevelopment and a commercial unit construction. Only the commercial unit construction had elements of similarity to the SES facility extension. The three other projects were listed in title description only as renovations with values between \$100k-\$150k. The nominated referees were: City of Perth, City of Vincent and Downer-Mouchel.	The company demonstrated a satisfactory understanding of the requirements. The response detailed pre-planning and a general construction methodology supported by a construction program.	The company is located in West Perth. The company indicated that it intends to use local labour and suppliers.	53.7%	\$598,914	2
All requirements have been met.								

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>Adrina Project Management Pty Ltd</p> <p>All requirements have been met.</p>	Yes	<p>Adrina Project Management started its operation in 1997 in property development and then construction in 2005. It currently has 32 staff. The company's organisational chart was supported by a breakdown of staff their roles and additional details of the three staff that would be assigned to the contract. Seven subcontractors were nominated. After-hours contact and the ability to provide additional personnel and resources were addressed. Safety statistics for 2013/14 and 2014/15 and a safety management plan were provided</p>	<p>It demonstrated experience completing refurbishment and extension projects on a smaller scale to the SES facility. Five examples of work were supplied in detail. These included Osborne Park Bowling Club (\$183k), Nollamara Community Centre (\$205k) and Yokine Bowling Club (\$183k) for the City of Stirling, Oldham Community Centre Multipurpose Room extension (\$250k) for the City of Wanneroo and an extension to the Town of Mosman Park works depot (\$95k). An additional list of completed projects in less detail was also supplied. The projects included residential development projects, small-scale refurbishments (\$18k to \$279k) and also several commercial projects such as a warehouse and showroom and an IGA supermarket.</p>	<p>Adrina Project Management demonstrated an understanding of the requirements. The response addressed mobilisation, site establishment and logistics, other general site requirements, a construction method statement addressing the refurbishment of the existing bunker and construction of new works and a provisional construction program. The methodology addressed the previous works undertaken and potential issues of non-compliance or defective work and its assessment. The methodology did include a number of errors and the work traffic flow diagram had traffic on the wrong side of the road.</p>	<p>The company is located in Mindarie with a depot in Nowergup.</p> <p>The company employs local residents and will use local suppliers/ services.</p>	52.4%	\$684,935	3

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>Connolly Building Company</p> <p>All requirements have been met.</p>	Yes	<p>Connolly Building Company has been in operation since 2005 and has four employees. A simple company structure was supplied with details of four employees. The response included a list of 15 nominated subcontractors including some who previously worked on the project. After-hours contact was supplied. The ability to provide additional resources and personnel was not addressed. A safety plan and the company's safety record of 2014-16 were supplied.</p>	<p>The company demonstrated some experience undertaking refurbishment projects. Eight example projects were provided in the value range of \$12k to \$488k. Works included refurbishment of rooms in nursing homes, a refit of a works depot, refurbishment in a primary school and a toilet refurbishment. The scale of and complexity of the projects was low to average.</p> <p>The nominated referees were: City of Armadale and T & Z Architects (x2).</p>	<p>The company demonstrated an adequate understanding of the requirements. The methodology addressed the general requirements of: site location, commencement, sub-contractor appointment, drawings, site preparation, masonry/walls, fit-out, external works and included a project calendar.</p>	<p>The company is located in Joondalup.</p> <p>It stated it will use local trades.</p>	51.4%	\$637,680	4

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Budo Group Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	Budo Group Pty Ltd was established in 2012. It has six full-time and one part-time staff. A brief organisation chart was supplied with a breakdown of the roles of staff of the company was supplied with the CVs of the managing director and site supervisor. The after-hours contact was supplied. Additional resources would be supplied by sub-contractors. A safety statement was supplied with other documentation available on request. The company has had no safety incidents in the past two years.	The company demonstrated limited experience in projects of a similar nature to the SES facility. A list of projects undertaken by the director in two former companies was supplied. Many examples were specialist heritage restoration works and schools for the Department of Treasury and Finance. Five examples of work were supplied. Two were works undertaken by CPD Group. The director of Budo Group Pty Ltd is a former director of CPD Group Pty Ltd who left the organisation in 2013. The other three projects nominated were small refurbishment works (\$124-\$160k).	The company demonstrated some understanding of the requirements. A brief methodology was provided which addressed the general work requirements such as: assignment of a full-time site supervisor, variations, meetings, fencing, deliveries, site safety checks and the like. A program of the work was also included, however it format made it difficult to interpret. There did not appear to be any consideration of previously completed works in the program or methodology.	The company is located in Mariginiup. The company employs City residents and engages local suppliers.	44.4%	\$812,637	5

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
CLPM Pty Ltd All requirements have not been met.	No	Non-compliant not assessed – Excluded the requirement to provide all guarantees, warranties, certificates and as-constructed drawings of the works already completed by others.				-	\$709,147	NA
Linkforce Engineering Pty Ltd All requirements have not been met.	No	Non-compliant not assessed – Excluded the requirement to provide all guarantees, warranties, certificates and as-constructed drawings of the works already completed by others.				-	\$722,318	NA
ZD Constructions 93 Pty Ltd All requirements have not been met.	No	Non-compliant not assessed – Excluded provision of all guarantees, warranties, certificates and as-constructed drawings of the works already completed by others and only allowed for reports from structural and hydraulic consultants.				-	\$589,064	NA