APPENDIX 10 ATTACHMENT 1

TENDER 014/1 CIVIL, ELECTRICAL, LANDSCAPING AND IRRIGATION WORKS FOR WHITFORDS AVENUE UPGRADE FROM FLINDERS AVENUE TO JOHN WILKIE TARN

SUMMARY OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS

			Comment Against C	Criteria				
Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price	Price Rank
Densford Civil Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	Densford Civil has been in operation since 1991. The company is based in Osborne Park with 65 permanent staff. The structure of the company and the proposed project organisational chart were provided supported by the resumes of five key personnel. A detailed list of specialised equipment with availability was supplied. The Project Manager and the Project Supervisors were designated as the after hours contacts for emergency requirements and the company has the ability to provide additional resources and personnel. Copies of its safety management plan, policy and safety records were supplied. The company operates on ISO AS/NZS 4801:2001, AS/NZS ISO 9001:2008 and ISO 14001:2008, is a full member of Civil Contractors Federation and is a Roads R3/Bridges B2 prequalified Main Roads WA (MRWA) and Tier 1 Water Corporation contractor.	It demonstrated extensive experience completing similar projects. Eleven examples were provided supporting its experience and these are construction of BP Baldivis Twin Travel Centres for Perkins Builders (2015), Bond Avenue, Perth Airport dual lane roundabout for Perth Airport Pty Ltd (2016), Hodges Drive carriageway duplication for the City of Joondalup (2013), Toodyay Road/Lilydale Road intersection for Downer Mouchel/MRWA (2016- 17) and Hutton Street freeway slip lanes for Downer Mouchel/MRWA (2017). Projects currently under construction - the upgrade of Underwood Avenue intersection for the City of Nedlands and road construction and upgrade in Gidgegannup for Downer Mouchel.	Densford Civil demonstrated a thorough understanding of the project requirements. A detailed construction methodology specific to the project was supplied addressing site location, plant and equipment, mobilisation, site access, staging of works, working hours, drainage, electrical, irrigation and landscaping works, traffic management and public and stakeholder engagement. A diagrammatic layout of the sequences of the work and a well documented preliminary construction program were also included.	The company is based in Osborne Park. It will use local material/service suppliers	71.3%	\$1,888,189	6

			Comment Against C	Criteria				
Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price	Price Rank
Jaxon Civil Pty Ltd (Conforming Offer) All requirements have been met.	Yes	Jaxon Civil is a part of Jaxon Group and has been in operation since 1958. The company is based in South Perth and has over 70 staff. The Group structure and the management structure for this project were provided with the experience and qualifications of three key personnel. A detailed list of specialised equipment for the civil and landscaping works was supplied. The company has the ability to provide additional personnel and resources and the Project Director, Project Manager and Site Supervisor for this project were designated as afterhours contacts. The company operates on ISO AS/NZS 4801:2001 (Occupational Health and Safety Management Systems), AS/NZS ISO 9001:2008 (Quality Management Systems). Copies of health, safety and environmental management plan, safety management policy and safety records of past two years were supplied.	The company demonstrated experience completing projects of similar value, complexity and nature. Fourteen project examples were supplied supporting its experience and these included Riseley Street Upgrade for AMP Capital Funds Management (2017), Northwest Coastal Highway widening for MRWA (2014), Thomas Road, Oakford widening for MRWA (2013), Turquoise Way path extension for Jurien Bay Chamber of Commerce (2017), shoulder grading and reconditioning along Albany Highway, South Western Highway, Great Eastern Highway and Toodyay Road for MRWA (2014) and Old Coast Road upgrade at Halls Head for Doric (2016-17).	Jaxon Civil demonstrated a thorough understanding of the project requirements. It provided a detailed three staged methodology with staging diagrams and work program. The methodology addressed traffic management and all activities for Earthworks and Pavement for new eastern road (stage 1), western roadworks (stage 2) and completion of works (stage 3).	The company is based in South Perth. The company employs local residents, will use local material/service suppliers and supports the Constable Care Child Safety Foundation.	68.5%	\$1,693,658	4

			Comment Against C	Criteria				
Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price	Price Rank
Jaxon Civil Pty Ltd (Alternative Offer) All requirements have been met.	Yes	Jaxon Civil is a part of Jaxon Group and has been in operation since 1958. The company is based in South Perth and has over 70 staff. The Group structure and the management structure for this project were provided with the experience and qualifications of three key personnel. A detailed list of specialised equipment for the civil and landscaping works was supplied. The company has the ability to provide additional personnel and resources and the Project Director, Project Manager and Site Supervisor for this project were designated as afterhours contacts. The company operates on ISO AS/NZS 4801:2001 (Occupational Health and Safety Management Systems), AS/NZS ISO 9001:2008 (Quality Management Systems). Copies of health, safety and environmental management plan, safety management policy and safety records of past two years were supplied.	The company demonstrated experience completing projects of similar value, complexity and nature. Fourteen project examples were supplied supporting its experience and these included Riseley Street Upgrade for AMP Capital Funds Management (2017), Northwest Coastal Highway widening for MRWA (2014), Thomas Road, Oakford widening for MRWA (2013), Turquoise Way path extension for Jurien Bay Chamber of Commerce (2017), shoulder grading and reconditioning along Albany Highway, South Western Highway, Great Eastern Highway and Toodyay Road for MRWA (2014) and Old Coast Road upgrade at Halls Head for Doric (2016-17).	Jaxon Civil demonstrated a thorough understanding of the project requirements. The alternative offer is based on redesigning the drainage to remove the need to bore concrete drainage pipes under existing asphalt surfaces that are not disrupted by the works. In addition, all drainage pipes and conduits will be installed using conventional open trench methods. The submission provided a detailed three staged methodology with staging diagrams and work program. The methodology addressed traffic management and all activities for Earthworks and Pavement for new eastern road (stage 1), western roadworks (stage 2) and completion of works (stage 3).	The company is based in South Perth. The company employs local residents, will use local material/service suppliers and supports the Constable Care Child Safety Foundation.	68.5%	1,482,658	1

			Comment Against C	Criteria				
Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price	Price Rank
Ralmana Pty Ltd t/a RJ Vincent (Conforming Offer) All requirements have been met.	Yes	RJ Vincent has been in operation since 1955. It currently has more than 200 employees with its head office located in Balcatta. The structure of the company was provided and supported by the qualifications and experience of eight key personnel. A detailed proposed organisation chart for this project was also supplied. The company has more than 200 items of plant and equipment and has access to labour and machinery hire companies for additional personnel and resources. The Site Supervisor and Site Engineer were designated as the after-hours contacts. The company holds accreditation for AS/NZS ISO 9001:2008 Quality Management System, AS/NZS 4801:2001 Occupational Health and Safety Management System and ISO 14001:2004 Environment Management System. Copies of safety record for the past three years, safety management policy and health and safety management plan of the company were provided.	The company demonstrated extensive experience completing similar road construction projects. Numerous project examples were provided to support its experience and these included Bertram Road duplication for the City of Kwinana (2012), Butler Railway bridges construction for Public Transport Authority (2013), Connolly Drive duplication and Lenore Road upgrade for the City of Wanneroo (2016), Lord Street roundabout construction for Stockland (2012), Neerabup Road intersection upgrade for Tamala Park Regional Council (2012), and Marmion Avenue duplication works from Lukin Drive to Butler Boulevard for the City of Wanneroo (2016).	RJ Vincent demonstrated an understanding of the project requirements. A detailed three phased construction methodology specific to this project was supplied addressing offline works, northbound carriage way works, topsoil/grass stripping, excavation, stormwater drainage, compaction, kerbing, brick paving, concrete works, asphalt works and line marking and traffic management. A pictorial representation highlighting the works was supplied but no construction program was included. The electrical works was also not addressed.	Its head office is located in Balcatta. The company employs local residents and use local suppliers and businesses.	66.9%	\$1,824,967	5

			Comment Against C	Criteria				
Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price	Price Rank
Ralmana Pty Ltd t/a RJ Vincent (Alternative Offer) All requirements have been met	Yes	RJ Vincent has been in operation since 1955. It currently has more than 200 employees with its head office located in Balcatta. The structure of the company was provided and supported by the qualifications and experience of eight key personnel. A detailed proposed organisation chart for this project was also supplied. The company has more than 200 items of plant and equipment and has access to labour and machinery hire companies for additional personnel and resources. The Site Supervisor and Site Engineer were designated as the after-hours contacts. The company holds accreditation for AS/NZS ISO 9001:2008 Quality Management System, AS/NZS 4801:2001 Occupational Health and Safety Management System and ISO 14001:2004 Environment Management System. Copies of safety record for the past three years, safety management policy and health and safety management plan of the company were provided.	The company demonstrated extensive experience completing similar road construction projects. Numerous project examples were provided to support its experience and these included Bertram Road duplication for the City of Kwinana (2012), Butler Railway bridges construction for Public Transport Authority (2013), Connolly Drive duplication and Lenore Road upgrade for the City of Wanneroo (2016), Lord Street roundabout construction for Stockland (2012), Neerabup Road intersection upgrade for Tamala Park Regional Council (2012), and Marmion Avenue duplication works from Lukin Drive to Butler Boulevard for the City of Wanneroo (2016).	RJ Vincent demonstrated an understanding of the project requirements. The alternative offer is based on open trenching all drainage and irrigation lines underneath existing pavement to remain and backfilling with cement stabilized sand and providing a new fence to match the existing one. A detailed three phased construction methodology specific to this project was supplied addressing offline works, northbound carriage way works, topsoil/grass stripping, excavation, stormwater drainage, compaction, kerbing, brick paving, concrete works, asphalt works and line marking and traffic management. A pictorial representation highlighting the works was supplied but no construction program was included. The electrical works was also not addressed.	Its head office is located in Balcatta. The company employs local residents and use local suppliers and businesses.	66.9%	\$1,566,832	2

			Comment Against	Criteria				
Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price	Price Rank
Tracc Civil Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	TRACC Civil was established in 2010. It is located in Bibra Lake and has 200 staff. The organisational chart for this project and the company was provided and supported by the role, qualifications and experience of five key personnel. A list of specialised equipment was supplied. The Construction Manager and the Site Manager were designated as the afterhours contacts for emergency requirements and company has access to additional personnel and resources, if needed. The company operates on ISO AS/NZS 4801:2001 (Occupational Health and Safety Management Systems), AS/NZS ISO 9001:2008 (Quality Management System) and ISO 14001:2008 (Environmental Management Systems). Copies of its occupational health and safety policy and safety records were supplied.	The company demonstrated considerable experience completing projects of similar value, complexity and nature. Eighteen project examples with images were submitted by the company to demonstrate its experience and these included Beeliar Drive duplication for the City of Cockburn (2017), South Yunderup / Pinjarra Road Intersection for Satterley (ongoing), Mundijong Road Extension for the City of Rockingham, Gillmore Avenue dual carriageway construction for the City of Kwinana, civil works for Ocean Reef Road and Joondalup Drive intersection upgrade (2016) and Civil and Landscaping Works for Ocean Reef road Duplication from Oceanside Promenade to Swanson Way (2017) for the City of Joondalup.	TRACC Civil demonstrated a thorough understanding of the project requirements. Its proposed methodology included traffic control and management, dust control, procurement, mobilisation, demolition and topsoil removal, earthworks for new pavement, subgrade construction, asphalt, kerbing, footpath and concrete work, stormwater drainage, landscaping and demobilisation. A provisional project program was supplied.	It is located in Bibra Lake. The company will use local material/service suppliers.	66.5%	\$1,623,543	3

			Comment Against	Criteria				
Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
BCL Group Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	BCL Group has been in operation since 2012. The company is located in Wangara and has 42 staff. The organisational chart of the company was supplied with the details of 11 key personnel. The nominated Project Manager and the Project Engineer have limited experience in similar type projects. A list of specialised equipment was supplied. The company has the ability to provide additional personnel and resources. After hours contacts for emergency requirements were supplied. The company operates its own quality management system. Copies of its safety policy, safety statistics and safety management plan were provided.	BCL Group did not demonstrate sufficient experience completing similar projects. Out of the thirteen project examples submitted to support its experience, only one (Whitfords Road roundabout and calming node construction) was similar. Other project examples were of civil projects for land development, landscaping and streetscape upgrades and these included Augusta Street, Laverton upgrade for the Shire of Laverton, landscape enhancement for Department of Parks and Wildlife, Bunbury, Kalgoorlie Health Campus carpark construction for the Department of Finance and Elizabeth Quay civil and landscape works for Metropolitan Redevelopment Authority (MRA).	The company demonstrated an understanding of the project requirements. A provisional program was supplied and supported by a detailed construction methodology to complete the work.	The company is located in Wangara. The company will look to utilise local material/service suppliers.	56%	\$1,493,011	NA

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No		Comment Against	t Criteria		Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
The Trustee for the Dowsing Family Trust t/as Dowsing Group All requirements have been met.	Yes	Dowsing Group has been in operation since 1985. The company is located in Kewdale with more than 60 staff. The organisational chart of the company was provided and supported by the qualifications and experience of seven key personnel. A comprehensive list of specialised equipment was supplied. After hours contact and the ability to provide additional resources and personnel were addressed. Copies of its health and safety management plan and safety records were supplied	Dowsing Group demonstrated experience completing road construction and concrete works projects. Numerous project examples were submitted and these included civil works for Oceanside Promenade for the City of Joondalup (2016), Newman Drive widening and Kalgan Drive intersection improvement for the Shire of East Pilbara (2015), Forrest Square car station civil works for the City of Subiaco (2016), Berwick Street/Hillview Terrace intersection upgrade (2015) and Lathlain Place Street revitalisation project (2014) for the Town of Victoria Park	Dowsing Group did not demonstrate sufficient understanding of the project requirements. The submitted brief construction methodology addressed to complete the project in four stages. It submitted a brief response to carry out the electrical works and have not allowed for horizontal boring of communication conduits. A provisional project program was provided	. The company is located in Kewdale. The company employs local residents and will use local material/service suppliers.	53.2%	\$2,049,139	NA

			Comment Against	Criteria				
Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price	Price Rank
D.B Cunningham Pty Ltd trading as Advanteering - Civil Engineers All requirements have been met.	Yes	Advanteering – Civil Engineers has been in operation since 1980. The company is based in West Perth and has eight full time engineers, one administrator and four site foreman/safety officers. The structure of the company was provided with the resumes of ten key personnel. The nominated Site Supervisor for this project has only two years of experience. A brief list of specialised equipment was submitted. The company has back up personnel and will hire the key plant for this project. After-hours contacts were provided. Copies of its safety management policy was provided but safety records were not supplied. The company operates on ISO AS/NZS 4801:2001 (Occupational Health and Safety Management Systems), AS/NZS ISO 9001:2008 (Quality Management System) and ISO 14001:2008 (Environmental Management Systems).	Advanteering – Civil Engineers demonstrated experience completing similar projects. Seven examples were provided supporting its experience and these are Morley Flinders Roadworks and Intersection improvements (2016), Kwinana Freeway Roadworks & Barrier Installation (2016), Brookton Highway/Holden Road Roadworks & Intersection Upgrades (2014) for Downer Mouchel/MRWA and Museum Street Roadworks for the City of Perth (2015-16).	The company demonstrated an understanding of the project requirements. A methodology specific to the project was supplied addressing mobilisation, site establishment, clearing and demolition, pavement, asphalt works, concrete works, line marking, site clean- up and demobilisation.	The company is based in West Perth. The company will use local material/service suppliers.	53.1%	\$1,237,178	NA

			Comment Against	Criteria				
Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price	Price Rank
Civcon Civil & Project Management Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	Civcon Civil has been in operation since 2012. It currently employs 130 personnel and is located in Nedlands. The structure of the company was provided and supported by the resumes of six key personnel. A list of specialised equipment was supplied. After-hours contact and the ability to provide additional personnel and resources were addressed. The company operates on ISO AS/NZS 4801:2001 (Occupational Health and Safety Management Systems), AS/NZS ISO 9001:2008 (Quality Management System) and ISO 14001:2008 (Environmental Management Systems). Copies of its safety statistics for the past two years and safety and health policy were provided	The company demonstrated experience completing similar projects. Five project examples were submitted supporting its experience and these included Parliament Place and Harvest Terrace road reconstruction for the City of Perth (2016-17), Main Street Stage 1 project for Curtin University (2015-16), Railway Street and Market Street shared path extension for the City of Perth (2016) and Perth City Link services scheme for MRA (2013- 14).	The company demonstrated some understanding of the project requirements. A provisional program was supplied and supported by a construction methodology addressing demolition, procurement, underground service construction, road construction, profile and overlay works, concrete works, soft landscaping and light pole installation. The submission did not make any reference to using recycled pavement in the sub-base of the new carriageway which is a project requirement.	This criterion was not specifically addressed.	53%	\$1,631,906	NA

			Comment Against	Criteria				
Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price	Price Rank
Horizon West Landscape Constructions All requirements have been met	Yes	Horizon West is a commercial landscape construction company established in 2007. It is located in Wangara and has 50 full time employees. The organisational chart of the company and resumes of eight key personnel were provided. None of these eight key personnel have experience nor qualifications in civil engineering works. A list of specialised equipment relating to landscaping was supplied. After hours contact and the ability to provide additional resources and personnel were addressed. The contents of its Health, Safety and Management Plan and safety records of the company were supplied.	The company did not demonstrate experience completing similar projects. Four project examples submitted were primarily of landscaping works. A list of 12 projects without any details was also supplied.	Horizon West did not demonstrate an understanding of the project requirements. A brief methodology without any details of the works and a project program were supplied.	It is located in Wangara. The company employs residents and will use local businesses/suppliers of the City.	39.2%	\$1,773,035	NA

			Comment Against C	Criteria				
Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price	Price Rank
Broadtrans Civil Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	Broadtrans Civil is based in Wangara. Limited information was provided on the company structure and experience and qualification details of its key personnel. It stated that all employees are available for afterhours contacts. A brief list of equipment was supplied. No information was provided on its period in business, number of full time employees, ability to provide additional personnel and resources. A brief health and safety policy and safety statistics were supplied.	Broadtrans Civil did not demonstrate experience completing similar projects. Three project examples were provided but none in high traffic metropolitan areas and these were Wandi South Stage 3 sub-division works for Peritas, Glenariff Boulevard Canning Vale sub- division works for Nicheliving and Ocean Keys shopping centre roadworks for AMP Capital.	The company demonstrated some understanding of the project requirements. A brief provisional program was supplied. The submission stated that a detailed construction program will be developed after discussion and input from stakeholders. The methodology addressed earthworks, asphalt works, concrete works, landscaping and utilities and line marking.	It is based in Wangara. This criterion was not specifically addressed.	36.1%	\$1,636,080	NA

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria						
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price	Price Rank
Environmental Industries Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	Environmental Industries, a primarily commercial landscape company, has been in operation since 1975. Its head office is in Canning Vale and it employs more than 160 employees. The organisational chart of the company and resumes of five key personnel were provided none of whom have similar project experience. A brief list of specialised equipment and a copy of the company's health and safety policy were provided. No information was supplied on afterhours contacts for emergency requirements, its ability to provide additional resources and safety records.	The company did not demonstrate experience completing similar projects. All of the five submitted project examples are of landscape and open space development projects and not relevant civil construction projects in relation to roadworks.	Environmental Industries did not demonstrate an understanding of the project requirements. Its submitted methodology gave insufficient information to demonstrate the required knowledge to complete the works. The submission proposed total road closure which is not considered appropriate as north bound traffic in the project area has to be maintained.	Its head office is in Canning Vale. This criterion was not specifically addressed.	26.6%	\$2,078,899	NA

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria							
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price	Price Rank	
Flexi Group Services WA Pty Ltd	No	Non-compliant							
All requirements have not been met.		Not assessed							
IC Energy Pty Ltd	No								
All requirements have not been met		Non-compliant Not assessed							