

TENDER 043/16 PENISTONE PARK COMMUNITY SPORTING FACILITY

SUMMARY OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Qualitative Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
McCorkell Constructions (W.A.) Pty Ltd  All requirements have been met.	Yes	McCorkell Constructions has been in operation for more than 85 years. Its head office is in Victoria and it has an office in Perth since 2011. It has 50 staff across Australia. The company and project organisation chart were provided and supported by experience, qualifications and role of the nominated Construction Manager, Project Manager and Site Manager. A list of current and future commitments of the company was supplied. Three significant sized projects (Dayton Community Centre, Sunscape Office/Warehouse and Ocean Gardens Palm Court Apartments) will be underway at the commencement of this Contract. The company operates an accredited safety management system (AS/NZS 4801). A copy of its safety policy, safety statistics and table of contents of its quality, safety and management system was supplied.	The company demonstrated substantial experience completing projects of similar scope and size. Six completed project examples were provided and these included construction of Piara Waters sports pavilion for the City of Armadale, Collegians Football Clubrooms for the City of Nedlands, Bramston Park Community Centre for the City of Joondalup, Bertram Community Centre for the City of Kwinana, Lathlain Community Centre for the Town of Victoria Park and Kingsway Baseball Club for the City of Wanneroo. The company is currently constructing Harrisdale Sports Pavilion for the City of Armadale and extension of the Wanneroo/ Joondalup SES Facility and Warwick Hockey Facility for the City of Joondalup.	The company demonstrated a thorough understanding of the requirements. A project specific methodology addressing site set up, materials handling and crange, building structure, external and internal walls, sequencing of finishes, external works and services coordination. A detailed list of subcontractors including contingency/alternatives was provided. A comprehensive construction program and schedule of progress claims were also supplied.	Its WA office is located in Perth.  No specific response was submitted for this criterion.	64.4%	Option 1 \$2,675,850 Option 2 \$2,663,100	1

## TENDER 043/16 PENISTONE PARK COMMUNITY SPORTING FACILITY

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Qualitative Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>Pindan Constructions Pty Ltd t/as Pindan Constructions</p> <p>All requirements have been met.</p>	Yes	<p>Pindan has been in operation since 1977. It has 450 staff in its Perth Head Office and regional South West Office in Busselton. The company and project organisation chart were provided and supported by the experience, qualifications and role of six team members. A list of current and future commitments of the company was supplied. Six significant sized projects will be underway at the commencement of this Contract but the company has sufficient resources and personnel to carry out this project. The company operates an accredited safety management system (AS/NZS 4801). A copy of its safety policy, safety statistics and table of contents of its quality, safety and management system was supplied.</p>	<p>The company demonstrated considerable experience completing projects of similar scope and size. Numerous project examples were provided and these included construction of Pearsall Hocking Community Centre for the City of Wanneroo, Coogee Surf Life Saving Club for the City of Cockburn, Grenville Reserve Community and Sport Facility for the City of Stirling, Bridgetown Library for the Shire of Bridgetown-Greenbushes, Centenary Park Sports Pavilion for the City of Canning and Maylands Multipurpose Centre (The Rise) for the City of Bayswater. The company is currently completing the extension works of the Wanneroo Civic Centre for the City of Wanneroo, Ellenbrook North Community Pavilion for the City of Swan and Eaton Sports Pavilions for the Shire of Dardanup.</p>	<p>Pindan Constructions demonstrated a sound understanding of the requirements. A comprehensive construction management plan addressing site facilities, site access, material handling and storage areas, preliminary construction methodology, site fencing and demolition and enabling works. A detailed list of subcontractors and a comprehensive construction program were supplied but schedule of estimated progress claims was not provided.</p>	<p>Its head office is located in Perth.</p> <p>No specific response was submitted for this criterion.</p>	60.4%	<p>Option 1 \$3,226,677</p> <p>Option 2 \$3,217,517</p>	2

TENDER 043/16 PENISTONE PARK COMMUNITY SPORTING FACILITY

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Qualitative Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>The Trustee for the Arkline Hybrid Trust t/as Alita Enterprises Pty Ltd</p> <p>All requirements have been met.</p>	Yes	<p>Alita Constructions has been in operation since 2004. It is based in Forrestdale with approximately 19 staff. The company organisation chart was provided and supported by the experience, qualifications and role of six team members. A list of current and future commitments of the company was also supplied. Three significant sized projects (Vincentian Retreat, John Calvin School Capel campus and Caversham Community Centre) will be underway at the commencement of this Contract. Safety statistics and a safety management plan of the company were provided.</p>	<p>It demonstrated some experience in completing similar construction projects for local governments and private organisations. Five completed project examples were supplied supporting its experience but only the construction of Byford &amp; Districts Country Club for the Shire of Serpentine Jarrahdale and Carey Baptist Community Centre for Carey Baptist College are of similar size and scope. Other three project examples (construction of The Samoan Church for The Samoan Independent 7th Day Adventist Church, Serpentine Jarrahdale Community Resource Centre and construction of three multi-purpose halls for John Calvin School) are of different scope and smaller scale. It is currently constructing Caversham Community Centre for the City of Swan and Capel campus for John Calvin School. A description of the scope of works, value and period and dates for all projects were supplied.</p>	<p>The company demonstrated an understanding of the requirements. The construction methodology addressed contract commencement, procurement, demolition and earthworks, structure, construction of external areas, car parking and environmental controls during construction. A construction program and basic list of subcontractors were provided but schedule of estimated monthly progress claims was not supplied.</p>	<p>The company is based in Forrestdale.</p> <p>No response was submitted for this criterion.</p>	48.4%	<p>Option 1 \$2,866,500</p> <p>Option 2 \$2,858,100</p>	3

TENDER 043/16 PENISTONE PARK COMMUNITY SPORTING FACILITY

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Qualitative Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>Bistel Construction Pty Ltd</p> <p>All requirements have been met.</p>	Yes	<p>Bistel Construction has been in operation for the past two years. It is based in Osborne Park with an unknown number of staff. The company organisation chart was provided. Experience, qualifications and role of Project Manager, Quality Advisor, Site Construction Manager and OHS Advisor for this project were supplied. The company will have two ongoing residential projects (a two storey residence and 5 x residential units) at the commencement of this Contract. Safety statistics and a safety management plan of the company were provided.</p>	<p>Bistel Construction did not demonstrate sufficient experience in completing similar construction projects. Only one project example (construction of Secret Harbour Life Saving Club for the City of Rockingham) is a similar sized project to the Penistone Park community sporting facility. The company also completed Stage 6B Baseball Facility – Kingsley for the City of Wanneroo and Alfred Skeet change rooms at Forrestdale for the City of Armadale.</p>	<p>The company demonstrated an understanding of the requirements. A detailed project construction methodology was provided addressing pre-mobilisation to site, construction of facility building, tennis court, softball, basketball and cricket practice zones, external works and demobilisation from site. The submission also addressed residents interface, pedestrian movements and care of existing facilities. A detailed construction program and an extensive list of subcontractors were provided but project and personnel commitments of the sub-contractors were not provided. A schedule of estimated monthly progress claims was also not supplied.</p>	<p>It is located in Osborne Park.</p> <p>No specific response was submitted for this criterion.</p>	44.4%	<p>Option 1 \$2,831,245</p> <p>Option 2 \$2,824,377</p>	4

## TENDER 043/16 PENISTONE PARK COMMUNITY SPORTING FACILITY

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Qualitative Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Macfield Construction Pty Ltd  All requirements have been met.	Yes	Macfield Construction has been in operation for more than three years. It is based in Nedlands with eight full time and part time employees. The company organisation chart was not provided. Experience, qualifications and role of four staff were supplied. The company has no current projects/commitments. Safety statistics and a safety management plan of the company were provided.	Macfield Construction did not demonstrate experience in completing projects of similar scope and size. None of its submitted three project examples (ground preparation for two rugby fields and supply of three netball courts at HBF Joondalup for Venues West and construction of an eight unit apartment complex) are similar in scope to the Penistone Park Community Sporting Facility.	The company did not demonstrate an understanding of the requirements. The submitted response was generic and lacked details of the construction methods to be adopted. A basic list of sub-contractors was supplied without their previous experience, project and personnel commitments and financial capabilities. A provisional construction program and schedule of estimated monthly progress claims were provided.	The company is located in Nedlands.  No specific response was submitted for this criterion.	31.3%	Option 1 \$2,610,886 Option 2 \$2,609,386	5

TENDER 043/16 PENISTONE PARK COMMUNITY SPORTING FACILITY

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Qualitative Rank	
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community				
Topend Living Pty Ltd t/as Buildon Construction All requirements have not been met.	No	Non-compliant not assessed							