

SUMMARY OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Assessment Price	Rank
		Demonstrated experience providing similar services	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the requirements	Social and economic effects on the local community			
M P Rogers & Associates Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	It demonstrated substantial experience providing coastal and marine engineering services in WA to local and state government and private enterprise. Current clients are Fremantle Ports, Department of Wildlife, LandCorp, Department of Transport, WALGA, Southern Ports Authority, EPA, Shire of Broome and the Cities of Joondalup, Perth and South Perth. Works undertaken for the City include: coastal vulnerability & processes assessments, water quality monitoring, concept design reports and coastal hazard risk management and adaption plans. Works for other clients includes: foreshore management plan, jetty design, various projects for Elizabeth Quay, Port Coogee & Albany waterfront.	M P Rogers & Associates Pty Ltd was established in 1993 and has 12 staff with nine specialist engineers. A staff structure was supplied and supported by a staff qualifications matrix, staff profiles and CVs of eight key staff and a listing of technical resources. Key roles within the assigned team have nominated back-up personnel should it be required. A safety policy and table of contents of its procedures manual was supplied. The company has had no safety incidents recorded in the past two years.	M P Rogers & Associates Pty Ltd demonstrated a thorough understanding of the requirements. The response addressed the work methodology undertaken to prepare a job plan and fee estimate, communication and meetings, access to technical library, reporting, the level of personnel assigned to the tasks, reviews and certification.	The company is located in Osborne Park. It will endeavour to use local businesses such as printers and surveyors	78.1%	\$166,560	1

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Assessment Price	Rank
		Demonstrated experience providing similar services	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the requirements	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>Advisian</p> <p>All requirements have been met.</p>	Yes	<p>Advisian demonstrated considerable experience in completing a variety of projects in Western Australia and other states. Thirty-three examples of work were supplied as evidence of their experience. Some of these include: Denham foreshore revitalisation stage 1A, Port Geographe reconfiguration, Two Rocks coastal engineering investigation and preliminary breakwater design, Broome boating facility, seawall and breakwater inspections, Jervoise Bay southern breakwater assessment, Deepwater Point boat ramp study, Open Coast & Broken Bay beaches coastal hazard study and management plan, Quinns Rocks metocean data collection and a coastal processes study for the City of Greater Geraldton.</p>	<p>Advisian was established in 1971 and has more than 2,500 staff across 22 countries. It is part of the WorleyParsons network of 24,500 staff across 42 countries. There is 150 staff based in Western Australia. A business structure was supplied and supported with profiles and CVs of 14 staff nominated for the City's contract. Additional personnel are available from the Perth office of other offices in Australia. A copy of its safety policy and the safety record of 2015-16 were supplied.</p>	<p>Advisian demonstrated a comprehensive understanding of the requirements. The response addressed its understanding of the scope of work and the specific work methodology for project management, design and documentation, feasibility studies, investigations and reports, concept and preliminary design and costing, review and preparation of technical specifications, detailed design for marine documentation, tender technical support and contract administration and management.</p>	<p>The company is located in West Perth.</p> <p>Where possible, Advisian will endeavour to engage local residents for the delivery of onsite surveys and data collection and will engage with local businesses to supply additional services not currently included in this contract.</p>	72.8%	\$144,050	2

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Assessment Price	Rank
		Demonstrated experience providing similar services	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the requirements	Social and economic effects on the local community			
W & G Engineers Pty Ltd (Jointly with Baird Australia)	Yes	<p>The two organisations demonstrated experience in a variety of engineering projects and coastal studies undertaken in Western and South Australia. W & G Engineers Pty Ltd: jetty and berthing pontoon design and investigations, Fremantle Sailing Club dinghy ramp design, Carpenter's Landing boat ramp upgrade design (SA), Royal South Australian Yacht Squadron wave attenuating structure design, Exmouth marine loading facility design, Penneshaw cruise ship tender berth design (SA).</p> <p>Baird Australia: Broome town site coastal hazard risk management and adaption planning project, Derby coastal vulnerability study, Wollongong City Council coastal engineering services, BHP Billiton coastal engineering services</p>	<p>W & G Engineers was established in 1979 and has 215 staff in Australia and 22 in Perth. The structure of the company was supplied with details of a team of 7 staff for the City's contract with staff also available from Adelaide. It has had no safety incidents since its inception. No safety policy or procedures were provided.</p> <p>Baird Australia was established in 1981 and has 80 staff across 6 worldwide offices, with 7 staff in Australia. The company structure was supplied and supported by the details of two key staff. Three additional staff are available from Sydney. It has a quality system which includes a safety policy and management plan. It has had no safety incidents recorded in the past two years.</p>	<p>W & G Engineers Pty Ltd demonstrated an understanding of the requirements. The response stated they understand the scope of services set out in the tender and the requirements will be issued in project specific briefs by the City throughout the contract. It then reiterated its understanding through prior experience in a number of consultancy panels for ports, structural, civil and coastal engineering services; however the City's contract is not a panel arrangement.</p>	<p>The company is located in West Perth.</p> <p>The company suggested an initiative to add a local procurement section in the project design reports as a prompt and a method of recording, demonstrating and documenting how local industry has been considered in the design.</p>	58.4%	-	4
All requirements have been met.								

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Assessment Price	Rank
		Demonstrated experience providing similar services	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the requirements	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Haskoning Australia Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	It demonstrated experience in a variety of coastal projects. Seventeen examples were provided supporting their experience. Only three of these were for Western Australian clients (City of Albany and City of Greater Geraldton). Examples of work included: Emu Point coastal processes study, Whiting Beach erosion processes study, Trinity Point marina design and sea grass modelling, Tuncurry Seawall, Abbot Point metocean services and dredge plume modelling, Greenfield Port development, Tuross Head boat ramp and car park investigation and Collaroy-Narabeen demonstrated a satisfactory understanding of the requirements. fishermans beach coastal zone management plan.	Haskoning Australia Pty Limited is a division of Royal Haskoning DHV established in 1881. It has 100 global offices, with offices in Sydney, Perth, Newcastle and the Gold Coast in Australia. Haskoning Australia Pty Limited commenced operations in 2011 with more than 50 staff across all locations. It was not clear how many staff are located in Perth or how many of the key personnel are located in Perth. An organisational chart was not provided; however a profile was provided for 14 key staff which was further supported by the CVs of 2 staff. Additional resources was addressed. The company has a safety management system in place and has had no incidents in the past 5 years. No safety policy was supplied.	The company demonstrated some understanding of the requirements by providing the process undertaken for an example coastal erosion project. The methodology set out the general work process and also identified issues that would be paid attention to and the design standards and guidelines that would be used.	The company is located in Perth. One member of staff is a resident of the City of Joondalup and the company would endeavour to use local companies for services they are not able to offer.	53.5%	-	5

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Assessment Price	Rank
		Demonstrated experience providing similar services	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the requirements	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Water Technology Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	It demonstrated experience in a variety of projects such as coastal hazard, erosion & vulnerability assessments & seawall condition assessments. Only one example was for work conducted in WA. Projects include Western Port Local coastal hazard assessment, coastal erosion Ho Tram Vietnam, seawall assessment Port Fairy, Hobson Bay seawall condition and coastal vulnerability assessments, Amity Point shoreline erosion management plan, Wyndham Harbour data collection and a variety of assessments, Whale World Albany siltation expert witness, Port Welshpool environmental feasibility assessment, Coffs Harbour boat ramp basin improvement design, Bemm River boat ramp and jetty upgrade options assessment.	Water Technology Pty Ltd was founded in 2000. It has 60 staff in total, with 1 staff member based in Western Australia (a project engineer). A team of nine key personnel were nominated for the City's contract, with profiles and CVs provided for each. The ability to provide additional personnel was not specifically addressed; however the offices across Australia would have capacity. The company operates an AZ/NZS 4801:2001 safety management system and provided a copy of its safety policy and safety record of the past two years.	Water Technology Pty Ltd demonstrated a satisfactory understanding of the requirements. The response addressed budget/quotations, project management, assignment of roles to team and general work processes.	The company is located in Subiaco. The company would consider opening a Perth office in the City of Joondalup.	48.3%	-	6

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Assessment Price	Rank
		Demonstrated experience providing similar services	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the requirements	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Arup Pty Ltd All requirements have not been met. The offer was subject to a number of additions and amendments to the conditions of contract relating to standard of care, termination, acceptance and re-performance of services, financial offsets, insurance, indemnity and limitation of liability	No	Non-Compliant, not assessed.						
Cardno WA Pty Ltd (Alternative Offer) All requirements have not been met. The offer was subject to a number of amendments to the conditions of contract relating to financial offsets, referral to arbitration, indemnity and insurance.	No	Non-Compliant, not assessed.						

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Assessment Price	Rank	
		Demonstrated experience providing similar services	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the requirements	Social and economic effects on the local community				
Sagar Marine Pty Ltd	No	Non-Compliant, not assessed.							
All requirements have not been met. It did not address compliance with conditions of contract, specification, sub-contracting, conflict of interest, registration and licences and critical assumptions.									