

TENDER 030/17 CITY CENTRE LIGHTING UPGRADE STAGE 2

APPENDIX 17

SUMMARY OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS

ATTACHMENT 1

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Price Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>Stiles Electrical and Communication Services</p> <p>All requirements have been met.</p>	Yes	<p>Stiles Electrical and Communication Services has been in operation since 1999 and is based in Joondalup. The company has 25 employees. An organisational chart was supplied and supported by the role, experience and qualifications of four staff nominated to oversee the City's project. It has accounts with a range of labour hire and plant hire companies, if additional resources are required.</p> <p>The company operates an accredited quality management system to ISO 9001:2015. Copies of its safety and health management plan was submitted with the Offer. The company's safety record of the past two years and after-hours contacts for emergency requirements were not provided.</p>	<p>It demonstrated extensive experience completing works of a similar nature. The company has successfully completed similar works for numerous local governments including the City. Numerous project examples were provided as evidence of the company's experience and included design, supply and installation of 140 custom and standard City of Perth specification Multipole light poles for Elizabeth Quay project, procurement, supply and installation of 300 series mini variant of Multipole for Kings Square Subdivision project for Broad Construction, installation of a range of 300-Series and 201-Series Multipole poles for Perth City Link (Stage 2 and 3) project for Downer Infrastructure.</p>	<p>Stiles Electrical and Communication Services demonstrated a thorough understanding and appreciation of the City's requirements. The work break down addressed all the scope items with detailed methodology and approach. Lead-times for the light poles, caged ragbolts and light fittings were also supplied. The company stated that a full project program will be developed with the City on award of Contract. It envisaged a project delivery of 26 weeks from award of the Contract.</p>	<p>It is located in Joondalup.</p> <p>The company employs local residents and uses local suppliers. It is providing training and mentoring for 15 apprentices through National Electrical and Communications Association.</p>	77.7%	\$2,945,287	1

TENDER 030/17 CITY CENTRE LIGHTING UPGRADE STAGE 2

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Price Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Complete Cabling and Construction All requirements have been met.	Yes	<p>Complete Cabling and Construction has been in business since 2009. It has 60 staff and is located in Wangara. Qualifications, industry experience and skills of nine key personnel were provided but no organisation chart was supplied. After-hours contact for emergency requirements was provided and the company has the ability to provide additional personnel and resources, if required.</p> <p>The company operates an accredited Quality Management System ISO 9001:2015, Environmental Management System ISO 14001:2015 and Occupational Health & Safety Management System OHSAS 18001:2007 and AS/NZS 4801:2001. Copies of its health and safety policy, health, safety and environment plan and safety records were provided. The company had 17 safety incidents in 2016 and seven in 2017.</p>	Complete Cabling did not demonstrate sufficient experience completing similar street lighting projects. Five projects out of supplied seven example projects were not similar in scope to this requirement.	The company demonstrated some understanding of the City requirements. It provided a detailed methodology addressing all scope of works with detailed project implementation program. Its methodology proposed to relocate existing light poles to new locations where as the scope requires the existing light poles to be completely removed and disposed of.	<p>The company is located in Wangara.</p> <p>It will purchase materials locally and employs local residents.</p>	51.3%	\$3,513,740	NA

TENDER 030/17 CITY CENTRE LIGHTING UPGRADE STAGE 2

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Price Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
DJM Electrical Services All requirements have been met.	Yes	DJM Electrical Services has been in business for an unknown period. It is located in Connolly. The submission did not provide information on its organisation structure, support team, after-hours contacts for emergency requirements, its ability to provide additional resources and safety	The company did not demonstrate sufficient experience in completing similar projects. It worked as a sub-contractor to Interlec (WA) Pty Ltd in the Joondalup Drive Lighting Upgrade project. It also carried out the investigation works for Stage 2 and Stage 3 of this project and electrical supply and installation works for two land subdivision projects. Periods and dates were not supplied for any submitted projects.	The company demonstrated an understanding of the City requirements. It provided a site-specific methodology addressing the scope of works, regulations and completion of work. A project program was also supplied.	The company is based in Connolly, employs local residents, supports local businesses and volunteers its services and equipment to local social, sporting, schools, charities and the health provider sectors.	40.4%	\$3,407,820	NA

TENDER 030/17 CITY CENTRE LIGHTING UPGRADE STAGE 2

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Price Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
The Garcia Family Trust t/as Advance Excavations	Yes	Advance Excavations has been in business since 1989. The company is located in Gnangara and has 13 staff. An organisation chart and details of three key staff were provided. The company does not hold any electrical licence and will sub-contract the electrical works to Allswift Pty Ltd. Capacity of Allswift Pty Ltd was provided. After hours contacts were provided but its ability to source additional resources was not addressed. Advance Excavations operates its own quality management system and has a safety policy in place. A copy of its safety policy was supplied but no safety records.	The company did not demonstrate sufficient experience completing projects of a similar scale and value. Out of its submitted three project examples only Broome Town Centre overhead to underground conversion and streetlighting project is of a similar scale.	Advance Excavations did not demonstrate sufficient understanding of the requirements. A generic methodology was provided with a proposed timeline that did not address the specific requirements of the City's project.	It is located in Malaga. This criterion was not specifically addressed.	33.6%	\$2,646,003	NA
All requirements have been met.								

TENDER 030/17 CITY CENTRE LIGHTING UPGRADE STAGE 2

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank	
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community				
Hender Lee Electrical and Instrumentation Contractors Pty Ltd	No	Non-compliant not assessed							
All requirements have been met.									