

## SUMMARY OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Estimated Contract Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
WCP Civil Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	<p>WCP Civil was established in 2009 and maintains a workforce of over 50 personnel. It provided a detailed structure of its business and listed the nominated project support team including skills of key personnel and equipment operators. It operates and maintains readily available specialised equipment that is sufficient to carry out the project including the ability to hire more equipment if required. It has access to additional resources that can be drawn upon on short notice and stated who the emergency point of contact would be if successful.</p> <p>It provided its safety statistics since 2015 and demonstrated its full compliance to requirements of ISO 9001 for Quality, ISO 14001 for Environmental Management and AS/NZS 4801 for Safety.</p>	<p>WCP Civil Pty Ltd demonstrated considerable experience completing road and drainage works for the City and other local governments. City works include the Whitfords Avenue Shared Path and the Ocean Reed Road and Trappers Drive intersection Upgrade. Scopes of projects also included larger earthworks for CBH Limited. The value and period of the projects were clearly articulated, and referee contacts were provided for the Cities of South Perth, Kwinana and Albany.</p>	<p>WCP Civil Pty Ltd demonstrated a good understanding of the project. It provided a work method statement customised to the requirements of the project addressing the construction methodology for the various tasks including risks and mitigation strategies associated with site surveys, dust management, access and security, sub-contractors, and traffic management. It proposed a list of six sub-contractors that will be engaged for completion of the project and provided a provisional contraction program in the form of a gantt chart. It clearly outlined a schedule for estimated monthly progress claims.</p>	<p>WCP Civil Pty Ltd is located in Gnangara.</p> <p>It stated that 30% of staff live either in the boundaries of the Cities of Joondalup or Wanneroo. It maintains a relationship with local businesses for the provision of mechanics, doctors, lunch, gyms, fuel and lubricants, parts, tooling and activity centres.</p>	73.3%	\$1,453,283	1

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Estimated Contract Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>RCA Civil Group Pty Ltd</p> <p>Not all requirements have been met. RCA Civil Group Pty Ltd is not fully accredited to requirements for ISO 9001 for Quality, and ISO 14001 for Environmental Management. It stated that it has aligned its compliance towards the required standards and is working towards full accreditation in the 2019/2020 financial year.</p>	Partially	<p>RCA Civil Group Pty Ltd was originally established in 2001 Its organisational structure and details of 11 key personnel skills, qualification and experience was supplied. A list of personnel was nominated as backup resources if required. It provided a list of specialised equipment including the ability to source additional equipment. After-hours contacts were specified for three personnel. Safety statistics since 2016 were cited.</p>	<p>RCA Civil Group Pty Ltd demonstrated considerable experience providing civil, drainage, concrete, subdivisions, road construction, plant hire, asphalt and kerbing works. Previous City works include the Erindale Black Spot Project, the Robertson Rd Cycle Way, and the Venturi Drive Local Traffic Management Scheme. Other similar projects were undertaken for other local governments including a list of major WA roadworks. Referee contacts were provided for the City of Stirling, Shire of Serpentine Jarrahdale and Town of Victoria Park. The value and dates of completed projects was stated.</p>	<p>RCA Civil Group Pty Ltd demonstrated a good level of understanding of tasks required. Its project specific methodology contained an implementation plan and details of specific site tasks. Associated risks and appropriate mitigation strategies were stated in traffic management, weather, quality of material and workmanship, breakdowns, site attendance, afterhours security, and conservation. Three sub-contractors were nominated and a comprehensive project gantt chart was included. Its estimate of monthly progress claims did not indicate the percentage values for each claim</p>	<p>RCA Civil Group Pty Ltd's head office location is in Byford with an alternative yard located in Wanneroo.</p> <p>It stated it will endeavour to source local subcontractors and utilise local suppliers as part of the project.</p>	70.2%	\$1,630,112	2

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Lump Sum Contract Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
MRCN Pty Ltd (West Force Construction) All requirements have been met.	Yes	West Force Construction was established in 2006 It is majority owned by Raubex Group Limited, South Africa. It provided a detailed organisational chart indicating its business structure and a large number of employees. Skills and experience were covered in CV's for two nominated personnel and a template of its safety management plan indicated further information on nominated personnel and after-hours contacts to be filled if successful. Its ability to source additional personnel and resources for the project was not clearly defined. West Force Construction is fully compliant to requirements for ISO 9001 for Quality, ISO 14001 for Environmental Management and AS/NZS 4801 for Safety. Its safety records for 2017 and 2018 were provided.	West Force Construction demonstrated experience completing projects that contain similar aspects to the tender requirements. Its most notable project was the construction of a pedestrian shared path between Bassendean Station and Lord Street for Main Roads WA. Other projects were completed for the PTA, Western Power, Laing O'Rourke and MSP Engineering. The values of all projects were indicated, however the dates or periods of when the projects occurred were not provided. Referee contacts were listed for the above projects.	West Force Construction demonstrated a reasonable level of understanding of the project tasks. It provided a sequence of works to be undertaken including plant and equipment use and five sub-contracted services. It identified the major project risks are dust and heritage, however no mitigation strategies were provided. It stated it will submit progress claims monthly, however it did not propose figures for the claims. A detailed construction program gantt chart was included.	West Force Construction Ltd is located in Welshpool.  It proposed to use, if successful, local Cities of Joondalup and/or Wanneroo materials and service suppliers like fuel, local labour force, construction supplies. It currently employs two personnel who reside in the Cities of Joondalup and Wanneroo.	60.2%	\$2,270,984	3

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Estimated Contract Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in completing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Egan Civil Pty Ltd (Castle Civil) Not all requirements have been met. The Offer does not have appropriate certifications or systems in place that meet or align with Specifications for compliance to requirements of ISO 9001 for Quality, ISO 14001 for Environmental Management and at least one of AS/NZS 4801 or OHSAS18001 for Safety, as specified in the Tender.	No	Non-conforming. Not assessed.						