SUMMARY OF SUBMISSIONS

APPENDIX 9 ATTACHMENT 1

		Comment Against Criteria						
Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Score	Fixed Lump Sum	Rank
Ralmana Pty Ltd trading as R J Vincent & Co All requirements have been met.	Yes	It was established in 1955. Though the specific number of fulltime employees was not stated, it indicated the company has 48 employees residing in the northern suburbs, which equates to nearly 50% of its workforce. Its structure of business and details of key personnel (construction manager, project engineer and site supervisor) including areas of expertise, project experience and qualifications were provided. An extensive list of specialised equipment relevant for the works and afterhours contacts for emergency requirements were supplied. It stated the company employs supplementary support staff to facilitate project requirements and ensuring additional back up coverage for supervision and offsite duties.	It demonstrated experience completing road reconstruction and duplication projects for private and public sectors. Examples of works included projects for the City of Wanneroo (Mirrabooka Avenue duplication at Landsdale - duration March 2018 to September 2018 and Marmion Avenue duplication at Merriwa and Butler - from February 2017 to July 2017) and Tamala Park Regional Council (Neerabup Road Upgrade Phase 2 - from March 2016 to November 2016). Other examples of works were listed and numerous were in land development sites.	It demonstrated a sound understanding of the City's requirements. It submitted a detailed methodology and preliminary program with construction activities, from site setup and establishment, excavation and preparation to sealing, asphalt works and linemarking, final trim and tidy works by the specified date for practical completion. However, its proposed 4.5 weeks full road closure of Northshore Drive was considered too long a period and not supported.	It is located in Balcatta. It proposed to utilise local subcontractors and businesses (including Stiles Electrical Services and Kennards Hire, Joondalup) for goods and services.	66.8%	\$2,853,004	1

		Comment Against Criteria						
Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Fixed Lump Sum	Rank
Civcon Civil & Project Management Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	It was formed in 2012. It currently operates with over 120 personnel. Its organisational structure and details of key personnel (construction manager, project manager, project manager, project manager, project engineer, site manager and site supervisor) including their CVs were provided. It stated all its plant operators are fully qualified and trained in the operation of plant including machine maintenance. A small list of standard equipment that will be used to complete the works was supplied. It indicated the company has established infrastructure for afterhours contacts and access to a resource pool of over 140 employees.	It has experience completing civil works and road construction projects for WA government agencies including Curtin University of Technology (stage 1 - construction of a new road through Curtin University's Bentley campus – duration late 2015 to early 2017), Public Transport Authority (stages 2, 3 and 4 - construct additional lanes along the existing two-lane Ranford Road, from Railway Bridge to Nicholson Road, eastbound and westbound directions, late 2016 to early 2017) and Metropolitan Redevelopment Authority (extending King Street from Perth City into Northbridge, mid 2017 to early 2018). These were mainly major projects though involved moderate civil works with no total road construction.	It demonstrated a good understanding of the required tasks. Its Submission included the proposed methodology and approach to carry out the works in three stages, from site establishment to offline work activities (stage 1), mainline work activities (stage 2), median and verge work (stage 3) and practical completion. It is noted it did not detail the City's nominated sub-contractor in its proposed electrical component of required street light works. Also, limited information was supplied on the proposed lane closure, duration and possible detour routes. Its proposed lateral shift of traffic through existing landscaped medians was considered not ideal.	It is based in Subiaco and has one other office located in Belmont. It proposed to use local subcontractors (Encompass Construction Risk Services for dilapidation survey, KR Surveys for construction survey set out, CAD model work and asconstructed drawings and Cobblestone Concrete for concrete for concrete for concrete works. It indicated 16% of its permanent employees reside in the City of Joondalup.	65%	\$2,782,102	2

		Comment Against Criteria						
Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Fixed Lump Sum	Rank
Densford Civil Pty Ltd (Conforming and Alternative Offers) All requirements have been met.	Yes	It was established in 1991. It currently has over 60 fulltime employees. An organisational chart and details of key personnel (operation manager, project manager, project engineer, project supervisor and surveyor) including their qualifications, skills and experience were provided. It indicated the company aims to complete majority of the works with its internal plant and operators as it currently owns, operates and maintains an extensive list of major plant. Its submission included afterhours contacts. It indicated the company has contingency measures in place, ensuring adequate allocation of staff or resources during the course of the works.	It has extensive experience completing road upgrade projects for private and public sectors including local governments. Numerous examples of works were provided and these included Russell and Hammond Road intersection improvement (duration 12 weeks from February 2018 to May 2018) for the City of Cockburn, Hodges Drive duplication (from February 2013 to June 2013) for the City of Joondalup, Toodyay Road intersection upgrades (duration 60 weeks from October 2016 to November 2017) for DM Roads / Main Roads WA. Though some examples of works provided were of major projects, others were of similar works or scale to the City's requirements.	It demonstrated its understanding of the required tasks. It submitted a comprehensive response with detailed methodology and construction programs. It proposed to carry out the works in six stages and two options for completion of works, (1) as a conforming offer and timeline meets the specified date for practical completion by 23 December 2020 and (2) as an alternative offer for practical completion by 5 March 2021. Option (1) has 16/18 week road closure. The proposed road closure in option (1) and alternative completion date in option (2) did not meet the City's requirements and were not supported.	It is located in Osborne Park. It stated it will aim to utilise local subcontractors for electrical works (Stiles Electrical Services) and for irrigation and landscaping services (Total Eden).	61.8%	\$3,130,946 (Conforming) \$3,495,703 (Alternative)	3

			Comment Agains	t Criteria				
Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Fixed Lump Sum	Rank
WCP Civil Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	It was founded in 2009 and currently has 100 fulltime employees. Its structure of business and details of key personnel (general manager, operation manager, safety manager, project manager, project engineer, project supervisor, safety advisor, profiling manager and asphalt manager) including their CVs were provided. A detailed list of the company's owned equipment was supplied and afterhours contacts were nominated. It stated the company also has additional workforce and labour hire options available.	It demonstrated experience completing road upgrade projects for local governments in WA. It has in the past completed various projects for the City and these included Barridale Drive parking improvements (duration two months from October 2017 to November 2017), Hepburn Avenue roundabout construction (three months duration from January 2017 to April 2017), Hillarys animal exercise beach car park upgrade – 11 weeks completed 2019) and Ocean Reef Road / Trappers Drive intersection upgrade (two weeks duration completed 2018). Other examples of works were provided and these were for minor to moderate scale projects for the Cities of Nedlands and Perth, Town of Bassendean, the Shires of Mundaring and Peppermint Grove.	It demonstrated a good understanding of the required tasks. A work method statement was provided. It proposed a four phase construction process, (1) roundabout demolition and temporary infills to facilitate traffic management, (2) offline construction works, (3) and (4) reconstruct existing road – future southbound lanes and northbound/eastbound Whitfords Avenue lanes, respectively, and (5) finishing trades. Traffic management control was described in its proposed construction methodology as a four phase process though its diagram maps did not provide a clear visual process for the control of traffic during construction phasing.	It is located in Gnangara. It indicated the company has numerous staff members reside within the boundaries of Wanneroo and Joondalup. Its subcontractor for traffic control is located within the City.	60.3%	\$2,403,840	4

			Comment Agains	t Criteria			Fixed Lump Sum	Rank
Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score		
All requirements have been met.	Yes	It commenced operation in 2010. Its structure of business and details of its proposed project management team (project manager, project engineer, site manager, leading hand and administrative support) including their qualifications and years of industry experience were provided. It listed a number of small to medium sized plant which will be used to carry out the works. Though the number of full-time employees was not stated, it indicated the company has the ability to increase resources where required through existing hire agreements with several plant and labour hire companies. Afterhours contacts for emergency requirements were not supplied.	It has experience completing road upgrade for private and public sectors including local governments in WA. Four examples of works were provided and these were for the Shire of Serpentine Jarrahdale's Park Rd rehabilitation at Byford (duration Mar/Apr 2020), City's Marmion Av and Gilbert Rd intersection upgrade at Duncraig (Jan/Mar 2020), Programmed Facility Maintenance on behalf of the Public Transport Authority's Mirrabooka Bus Station entry/exit road reconstruction (Mar/Apr 2020) and BGC / City of Perth's Irwin St reconstruction at East Perth (Jan/Mar 2018). These were moderate civil projects, the largest being Irwin St reconstruction, and no full road construction projects though considered may be able to adapt to complete the City's requirements.	It demonstrated a good understanding of the required tasks. Though it submitted a general construction methodology, it detailed stages (1 to 6) of works to be undertaken. However, stages 2 and 3 proposed lateral shift of traffic through existing landscaped ground were considered not ideal. Also, its proposed construction program has no nominated date for practical completion.	It is located in Gnangara. It stated the company utilises local quarries, licenced tips and plant hire businesses. Many of its employees (70%) are either Joondalup or Wanneroo rate payers. The company is a member of the Joondalup and Wanneroo Business Associations.	60.2%	\$2,711,024	5

		Comment Against Criteria						
Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Fixed Lump Sum	Rank
Raubex Construction Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	It was incorporated in Australia in 2019. It is an incorporated branch of the listed parent entity, Raubex Group Ltd, which was established in 1974 and is one of South Africa's construction materials supply groups. The specific number of fulltime employees was not stated. Its project organisation chart and details of key personnel (operational director, project manager, senior supervisor and senior safety manager) including their qualifications and industry experience were provided. Its submission included a list of key equipment and details of afterhours contacts. It did not specifically address the ability to provide additional personnel though indicated the company has a strong support base at its established workshop in Welshpool.	It demonstrated experience completing various road construction projects for private and public sectors in WA. Examples included Brookton Hwy reconstruction (duration from Feb to Jun 2020) for MRWA, Thomas Road widening (start/finish May 2020) and Norseman passing lanes construction (Jan to Apr 2020) for DM Roads. These were mostly regional projects in linear or controlled sites with little or no drainage or existing services works. Other examples were provided but works involved mainly landfill facilities and these included landfill cell construction and associated works (Oct 2019 to Feb 2020) for Resource Recovery Solutions / Instant Waste and Henderson landfill capping (Dec to Jul 2019) for the City of Cockburn.	It demonstrated a sound understanding of the City's requirements. Its submission included a detailed construction methodology and proposed four stage construction phasing. It nominated date for practical completion of works which meets the City's specified timeframe. However, its proposed approach to closing the car park during works was not supported due to current vendors using the area.	Its WA's office is located in Welshpool. It intends to utilise local subcontractors including Stiles Electrical Services for electrical works, Tree Lopping Perth Northern for tree removal, Perth Excavating for demolition and removal, Horizon Landscaping for landscaping and Elliots Irrigation for irrigation.	59.4%	\$2,845,170	6

			Comment Agains	t Criteria				
Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Fixed Lump Sum	Rank
D.B. Cunningham Pty Ltd trading as Advanteering Civil Engineers All requirements have been met.	Yes	It was established in 1980. Though the specific number of fulltime employees was not stated, it indicated the company currently has four fulltime engineers, one administrator, four site foreman / safety officers and a labour workforce varying from five to 50 depending on the number of projects on hand and their size. Its company structure and details of key personnel (managing director, project manager/site engineer, safety management representative, site engineer, project manager and administration manager) including their CVs were provided. It stated the company owns or has available a wide range of plant and equipment to complete the works. It has a project resource plan in place, including contingency measures and backup resources. Afterhours contacts for emergency requirements were supplied.	It has experience completing civil projects for private and public sectors including state government agencies in WA. The company has in the past carried out the re-construction of the intersection of Morley Drive and Flinders Street in Yokine (duration April to July 2016) for DM Roads, upgrading the existing intersection of Brookton Highway and Holden Road (November 2013 to April 2014) for DM Roads and Main Roads WA and refurbishment of bridge over Ellen Brook and associated roadworks (January to May 2018) for Main Roads WA. Other examples included more recent projects though some were carried out at relatively controlled sites.	It demonstrated a good understanding of the required tasks. A preliminary construction program was supplied and the company proposed to carry out works in four stages. However, the information submitted was general and not job specific. Also, no specific site traffic management plan or methodology provided detailing traffic movements through the site during construction.	It is based in West Perth and it has a regional office located in Busselton. It indicated some of the key materials the company will source locally for this project will be crushed limestones, irrigation materials, small tools and if required, clean fill. It has 10% of its staff reside in the City.	58.5%	\$2,407,670	7

		Comment Against Criteria						
Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Fixed Lump Sum	Rank
RCA Civil Group Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	It was formed in 2001 as S.G.S Bobcat. In 2012 it changed its name to RCA Civil Group Pty Ltd. An organisational structure and details of key personnel (director/general manager, director/construction manager, operations manager, civil supervisor, project manager/safety advisor, site supervisor/manager, operator/leading hand and operator/traffic controller) including their years of industry experience were provided. It nominated a small range of equipment which was considered appropriate to complete these types of civil construction project. Though it did not address the number of fulltime employees, it listed 15 additional personnel that can be called upon if required and afterhours contacts were supplied.	It demonstrated experience completing minor to moderate road construction projects for WA local governments. Examples included construction works on Kent Street and Hayman Road roundabout (duration nine weeks, completed July 2019) for the Town of Victoria Park and City of South Perth, on Henderson Road and Lowlands Road at Hopelands (six and four weeks, completed February and April 2018, respectively) for the Shire of Serpentine Jarrahdale and on various lane ways (four weeks per laneway, completed March 2017) for the City of Stirling. Most of these works were linear runs and smaller scale to the City's requirement.	It demonstrated its understanding of the City's requirements. It submitted a nine stage construction program and standard approach to carry out the works. However, its proposed methodology has limited details on traffic management, relating to control and management of traffic and pedestrian movements and or detours during construction which is key to this project.	It will endeavour to source local sub-contractors and suppliers for goods and services.	55%	\$3,186,377	8

			Comment Agains	t Criteria				
Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Fixed Lump Sum	Rank
Egan Civil Pty Ltd (Castle Civil) All requirements have been met.	Yes	It commenced operation in 2011. It currently employs 12 staff. Its structure of business and details of key personnel (managing director/project engineer, project manager, supervisor, plant operator and project administrator) including their key responsibilities, industry experience, qualifications and training were provided. It indicated the company has a range of current plant for use on projects and for hire. Also, it has access to local labour hire companies, including Hays Recruitment and Starc Resources, for additional personnel at short notice if required. However, afterhours contacts for emergency requirements were not addressed.	It demonstrated experience completing drainage and road works for private and public sectors in WA. Five examples of works were provided and these were for the design and construct of gross pollutant tank (Feb to Apr 2020) for the City, road construction and drainage works on Cockman Way (Feb to Mar 2017) for the City of Kwinana, drainage installations and upgrades (2017 to 2019) for the City of Rockingham, Laverton airport runway/taxiway construction (Jan to Mar 2020) for the Shire of Laverton and drainage and road works on Roe Hwy (Jul 2016 to Feb 2017) for Monford Group and McConnell Dowell. These were predominantly drainage and local road upgrades and smaller scale projects with not much works associated with live services.	It did not fully demonstrate its understanding of the required tasks. A construction program was supplied however it was inconclusive, with no indicative dates of construction or practical completion. Also, it did not fully address traffic and pedestrian management during construction.	It is located in Naval Base. It indicated one of its proposed subcontractor, Surveying Solutions WA, is located in the City. It currently employs three local machine operators.	45.9%	\$1,853,339	9