

**TENDER 014/21
CHICHESTER PARK COMMUNITY SPORTING FACILITY PROJECT
SUMMARY OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS**

**APPENDIX 12
ATTACHMENT 1**

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant ? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Demonstrated experience in providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Capacity	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Devlyn Australia Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	It demonstrated substantial experience completing Community Sporting Facility Construction Projects with similar scopes of work throughout Western Australia. Its projects included Belhaven Park Sports Amenities Building - City of Wanneroo (2019), Dalwallinu, Multi-Purpose Sporting Complex - Shire of Dalwallinu (2019), Bencubbin Multi-Purpose Complex - Shire of Mt Marshall (2017-2018), Woodlands Community Centre - Shire of Dundas (2019) and Rockingham Tennis Club - City of Rockingham (2019). Works carried out included installation of electrical mains, roofing, hydraulic upgrades, painting, cabinetry and some demolition.	It demonstrated a sound understanding of the City's requirements. Its proposed methodology covered much of the requirements including good details on the pre-construction/site establishment phase, demolition, protection of trees/vegetation, site access, traffic management, commissioning, handover and defect management. It listed its proposed sub-contractors and provided basic data. However detailed information on its sub-contractors experience relevant to this RFT was absent. A Gantt Chart with relevant information including milestone dates, approval dates and practical completion dates was provided.	It has been in operation for over 30 years, established in 1990. It has delivered countless projects in WA's metropolitan and regional locations. The company has a team of 42 full-time employees. It gave details of its current and future commitments including values percentage of works complete and an indication of start and end dates. It indicated it has additional resources available if or when required and that it already has sufficient resources to be able to complete a project of this nature. It provided a list of plant and equipment to be used in delivering this project but stated that the items were subject to change dependant on scope requirements.	It has two offices, one in Canning Vale and one in Bunbury. It has 5 full-time employees who are City of Joondalup residents. One of its proposed sub-contractors is located within the City.	64.5%	\$4,830,665	1

TENDER 014/21
CHICHESTER PARK COMMUNITY SPORTING FACILITY PROJECT
SUMMARY OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant ? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Demonstrated experience in providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Capacity	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Geared Construction Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	<p>It demonstrated substantial experience completing projects with similar scope of work, outcomes and requirements for local government agencies. It listed five local government projects in detail including: the Wanneroo District Netball Association Clubrooms - City of Wanneroo (scheduled for completion by December 2021), Herb Graham Recreation Centre (2019), Bennett Park Pavilion (2021), Hamer Park and Moyle Pavilion (scheduled for completion by December 2021) and Yokine East Clubrooms (2017) all projects for the City of Stirling.</p> <p>It completed the extension and refurbishment of the Ellersdale Park clubroom building for the City in November 2020 and successfully completed the Sorrento Tennis Club Refurbishment for the City in August 2018.</p>	<p>It demonstrated a sound understanding of the requirements, providing a detailed methodology and Gantt Chart highlighting key activities and dates. It provided a substantial list of subcontractors and the services each subcontractor would provide, with most having sub-contracted the same or similar services to the company in the past 3 years. Geared Construction maintains an Integrated Management System (IMS) which has been developed in accordance with the integrated international ISO standards for HSE and Quality (HSEQ) ISO 45001 (Health and Safety) and ISO 14001 (Environment) and ISO 9001 (Quality) and is working towards this accreditation.</p>	<p>It has been in business for 5 years and its core business is construction, refurbishment and maintenance. It currently has 11 full time and two part time employees. Details of its proposed management team (Construction Manager, Project Manager and Site Supervisor) allocated to this project including their responsibilities and qualifications were provided. Current and future commitments were supplied, and emergency contacts details listed. Geared Construction Pty Ltd has the industry experience and proven capacity to complete the works.</p>	<p>Its principal location is Gnangara. It will try to source materials locally. Some of its subcontractors are from the City and it sponsors the youth community teams at Joondalup Utd Football Club.</p>	63.5%	\$4,437,853	2

**TENDER 014/21
CHICHESTER PARK COMMUNITY SPORTING FACILITY PROJECT
SUMMARY OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS**

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant ? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Demonstrated experience in providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Capacity	Social and economic effects on the local community			
BE Projects (WA) Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	It demonstrated substantial experience completing projects with elements comparable with the requirements of this project. It listed numerous construction and development sporting facility projects it has completed such as; Kalamunda Districts Hockey Club - City of Kalamunda (2018), Golden Bay Sporting Pavilion and Singleton Sports and Community Centre - City of Rockingham, (2017), Lakelands Shared Sports Facility - City of Mandurah, (2020) and Goomalling Sporting Pavilion - Shire of Goomalling (2015). Scope of works for these projects included conducting works concurrently across multiple sites, staged handovers, constructing change rooms, toilets, function rooms and storerooms. BE Projects is also currently constructing the Craigie Leisure Centre for the City, due for completion in 2022.	It demonstrated a good understanding of the required tasks. It provided a construction management plan addressing most requirements including technical methodology, bulk earthworks, public safety, traffic control, and quality and it outlined its interpretation of the daily program. It covered impact to the residents, managing public safety and proposed site set-out. The company named multiple sub-contractors showing that most had sub-contracted the same or similar services to BE Projects previously but minimal detail on each sub-contractor was provided. Included was an estimated monthly progress claim sheet showing anticipated claims over a twelve-month period.	The company was established in 2010. Its organisational chart illustrates the structure of the business identifying key personnel for the project including construction and site managers and supervisor. A list of sub-contractors and services they provide was included. A current commitment schedule was provided, naming clients, project values, architects and percentage of works completed for each project. A separate table demonstrated how this project would impact its current resources. It did not disclose the number of its full-time employees but stated it has significant structure and capacity to fulfil this proposed project.	Its head office is in Perth and has two depots, one in Subiaco, one in Boddington It stated that two of its employees resides in the City. It will endeavour to utilise local based trades and suppliers if successful.	61.5%	\$4,685,426	3

**TENDER 014/21
CHICHESTER PARK COMMUNITY SPORTING FACILITY PROJECT
SUMMARY OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS**

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant ? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Demonstrated experience in providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Capacity	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Swan Group WA Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	It demonstrated experience completing various design and construction projects for both state and local government clients, but no Community Sporting Facility projects. Case studies provided , included the following; Construction of “Containers for Change” container depository building - City of Perth (2020), “Safe Night Space” women’s rest facility - City of Perth (2020), Custodial Stations – WA Police Force (2021) and “Fire and potable water station” - Crown Perth (2018). It did provide details of relevant staff experience in completing Community Sporting Facility Construction projects, indicating these staff would become key personnel in this requirement.	It demonstrated a good understanding of the City’s requirements. A Project Delivery Plan included a detailed program, pre-construction activities, construction methodology, aftercare. site inductions, logistics, access, security and environmental protection. It provided an extensive list of sub-contractors but identifying specific sub-contractors to be engaged in this project was not obvious, as there was much repetition of some services to be provided, such as electrical and concrete, where more than four sub-contractors were named. There was no conclusive outcome as to whether the sub-contractors had agreed to participate in this project or had sub-contracted the same or similar services to the Swan Group, as there were many varying responses. It is accredited to ISO 9001 Quality Management Systems.	The company was established in 2001, indicating it had nearly 40 direct employees. It provided a table listing its key personnel and copies of eight of their CV’s which included their years in the industry, roles and responsibilities, professional skills and a summary of the key accounts they’ve work on. A summary of its current and future commitments was provided which included its clients, works, start/completion dates and personnel assigned. Included were emergency contact details for the project and advice that support staff covering all roles within the business was available. A table summarising its plant and equipment for the project was lacking data. It demonstrated the capacity required to undertake the works.	It is currently located in Wangara. It stated it has many staff who are residents of the City and would actively engage with local material/service suppliers should it be awarded the Contract.	57.8%	\$4,510,830	4

**TENDER 014/21
CHICHESTER PARK COMMUNITY SPORTING FACILITY PROJECT
SUMMARY OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS**

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant ? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Demonstrated experience in providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Capacity	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Hickey Constructions Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	It demonstrated experience in community sporting facility extensions and refurbishments for local governments, but not to the volume of work as this requirement. It provided details of recent projects; Falkland Park Clubrooms – the City (2020), Mawson Park - Toilet/Sporting - the City (2018), Sorrento Bowling Club - the City (2019), Wanneroo Aquamotion - City of Wanneroo (2021) and Warwick Bowling Club - the City (2021). It is currently undertaking works for the extension and refurbishment of the Emerald Park Clubrooms in Edgewater for the City which is a similar but smaller project than this requirement.	It demonstrated its understanding of the required tasks, outlined in its extensive method statement for proposed construction. It outlined the tasks to be from site establishment, demolition, mechanical, electrical and plumbing works. A Gantt Chart was provided with tasks included and start and finish dates provided. It listed 17 subcontractors proposed to be used on the project with services to be sub-contracted such as electrical, mechanical, hydraulics, carpentry, roofing and brickwork, but no statements to support the reason for using these sub-contractors was evident. Hickey Constructions Pty has certification to ISO 9001, ISO 14001 and ISO 45001	It has been in operation since 2014., It has 7 full time employees. Its main business is contract management of construction and maintenance projects. After hours contact details were included, and additional resources were available. The company works closely with two companies which have resources available at all times and are always on call both during the week and after hours as required. Details of specialised equipment to be used were provided along with a brief description and its main use. Current commitments were listed with start and expected completion dates provided. The company has certification to ISO 9001, ISO 14001 and ISO 45001. Though it demonstrated the capacity required to provide the services, the panel noted the company has a small team or number of full-time staff.	Its head office is in Yanchep and it currently leases a storage unit in the City of Joondalup. It has 2 employees living in the City. As it currently holds the maintenance and minor works contract for the City, it regularly sources materials and equipment from within the City.	56%	\$4,621,497	5

**TENDER 014/21
CHICHESTER PARK COMMUNITY SPORTING FACILITY PROJECT
SUMMARY OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS**

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant ? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Demonstrated experience in providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Capacity	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Classic Contractors Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	It did not fully demonstrate experience completing community sporting facility construction projects. It provided details of the following construction projects, but none were similar to this requirement; Carey Baptist College - Forrestdale Campus (2016), Kennedy Baptist College (2020), HBF Stadium (Southside Toilet) - Venues West (2020), Gold Netball (Office space) - Venues West (2021), Regent College (Administration building) - Victoria Park (2020). Brief details of scope, challenges and successes were included.	It did not demonstrate its understanding of the required tasks sufficiently. It included its project methodology and process which appeared generic and did not address the requirements directly. It provided a number of names of sub-contractors, some with brief particulars, but detailed information overall was not provided. No charts, schedules, timeframes or evidence that it could deliver the project was given.	It provides construction services to undertake small to medium sized projects in both the commercial and residential sectors. It has 35 employees. The company has been operating for over 25 years. Details of its current and future commitments including clients, values and periods were provided. It provided a snapshot of the proposed project team of five and their availability for this project, which ranged from 10 percent for its Director to 100 percent for its Site Manager. A schedule of vehicles and mobile plant and equipment was provided. After hours contacts and the ability to provide additional personnel were not addressed.	It is located in Willetton. It did not address this criterion directly but did name a sub-contractor who is registered within the City.	39%	\$4,483,976	6