

TENDER 019/21 PROVISION OF PRELIMINARY WORKS PRIOR TO ROAD RESURFACING

SCHEDULE OF ITEMS

Item	Description	Unit of Measure
1	Removal and disposal of kerbing	Linear metre
2	Kerb backfilling (sand)	Linear metre
3	Removal and disposal of pram ramps	Each
4	Cutting, removal and disposal of 600 mm wide section of concrete crossover	Linear metre
5	Cutting, removal and disposal of 600 mm wide section of asphalt crossover	Linear metre
6	Cutting, removal and disposal of 600 mm wide section of brick paved crossover	Linear metre

SUMMARY OF SUBMISSIONS

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Estimated Total Comparative Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Providing Similar Services	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Dowsing Group Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	Dowsing Group Pty Ltd was established in 1985 and employs 150 staff with 89 of these based in WA. The company has two directors and provided its organisation structure for the key dedicated management team members supported by three site teams of concreters / plant operators. Resumes for the supervisory positions were submitted highlighting skills, experience and qualifications which were considered appropriate to perform the allocated roles. Details for plant operators were omitted. A comprehensive list of plant and equipment specific to the scope of works, together with category specification, make / model, year of manufacture, type and purpose was sighted. Two full-time mechanics are employed to maintain the equipment. All project personnel are interchangeable between the designated teams due to cross skilling, offering resource contingency. Additional plant and equipment has been allocated of equivalent quality and specification. After hours information was provided for two key personnel.	Dowsing Group Pty Ltd demonstrated extensive experience in providing similar services being listed as a preferred supplier for WALGA (Roads, Infrastructure and Depot Services PSP009) and being the previous contractor to the City from 2015-2018 whereby it conducted kerb and pram ramp removal, saw cutting of asphalt and crossovers, removal of concrete and asphalt crossovers, kerb backfilling, reinstatement of irrigation, supervision and project management for approximately 80-100 streets per year. A list of current and previous contracts was sighted comprising 18 similar contracts for local governments and one for the Public Transport Authority. Project descriptions, contract values and dates were noted for each contract. Details for three additional projects were submitted, two for City of Melville in 2021 (\$21k) and (\$56k), and one for Shire of Ashburton during 2017-2018 (\$590k). References were provided.	The company demonstrated a thorough understanding of the required tasks. It provided detail for how it will schedule the works, conduct assessments to determine the nature and extent of traffic management and how it will notify residents and liaise with the City for existing services information. Works will commence at the requested time with dust emissions mitigated by conducting operations in accordance with its Environmental Management Plan. It will confirm locations of buried services and clarified how it will cut and cap off reticulation and test once reinstated. Plant and equipment to be used was stated. An example project timeline for the works was submitted accompanied by identification and control measures for the major risks which are critical to the project's satisfactory outcome.	Dowsing Group Pty Ltd has offices in Perth, Sydney and Auckland. It is located in Maddington. The company will purchase fuel and hardware within the City of Joondalup.	85.5%	\$1,563,859	1

TENDER 019/21 PROVISION OF PRELIMINARY WORKS PRIOR TO ROAD RESURFACING

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Estimated Total Comparative Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Providing Similar Services	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Asphaltech Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	Asphaltech Pty Ltd commenced operations in 1994 and employs 45 staff. Its organisation structure was sighted headed by a Managing Director and one further director. The company submitted details of its key personnel proposed for the City's scope of works and their percentage allocation to the project. Years of service and roles / responsibilities were noted, and accompanying resumes highlighted relevant experience and qualifications. Information for equipment operators was omitted. It provided an extensive list of fleet which included category, make, model, year of manufacture and purpose, which would be available for the City's project, and stated that it has two items of back-up machinery for every specialised machine that is required to complete the project. It can accommodate extra work load with three in-house crews operating. Numerous contacts were provided for outside of hours emergencies.	The company demonstrated substantial experience in completing similar projects providing five specific examples of contracts it has held with local governments with scopes of works comparable to the City's project being City of Melville between 2016-2021 (\$5m p.a.), City of Stirling between 2020-2021 (\$2m p.a.), City of South Perth between 2020-2021 (\$1.4m p.a.), Shire of Mundaring from 2019-2024 (\$2.6 p.a.) and Town of Victoria Park from 2019-2024 (\$3.9m). Elements of these works comprised concrete and kerbing, however, the scopes also included the supply and laying of asphalt and profiling services. Numbers of projects, challenges and outcomes were specified within the contract information. Five projects were listed as being current contractual obligations with anticipated dates for completion during 2022. The company has estimated that 15% of its operational capacity will be dedicated to the City's preliminary works. References were provided.	The company demonstrated a sound understanding of the required tasks providing its approach to the works which covered most of the City's requirements, including aspects not specifically related to kerb removal. The company will inspect the roads and provide an estimated duration for the project. Whilst it can prepare and implement traffic management plans, this responsibility will be undertaken by the City's appointed contractor. Details for how the company will remove concrete structures once irrigation has been cut and capped were noted including the introduction of alternative walkways for pedestrians and crossovers to maintain service levels. Its methodology covered base preparation for brick paving, back filling and installation of pavement markers / signage. Proposed timelines for elements of the works to be conducted were omitted.	Asphaltech Pty Ltd is based in Malaga and Neerabup. The company employs a total of seven full-time employees who reside within the City of Joondalup. It supports local business using Jaycar, XL Line Marking and CVP Electrical who are all located within the City's boundaries	82.1%	\$1,573,494	2

TENDER 019/21 PROVISION OF PRELIMINARY WORKS PRIOR TO ROAD RESURFACING

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Estimated Total Comparative Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Providing Similar Services	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>WCP Civil Pty Ltd</p> <p>All requirements have not been met.</p>	Partially	<p>The company was established in 2009 and employs 50 field personnel. The company submitted an organisation chart depicting the management structure, which comprised the General Manager, Site Supervisor and Project Manager, and supporting resumes to illustrate their relevant qualifications, skills and experience. Skills of employees who would be operating the plant and equipment were not sighted. Its nominated plant / equipment comprising skid steer loaders, six wheel trucks, three tonne excavators and load vehicles, which are maintained by in-house technicians, was considered appropriate to conduct the City's scope of works. It has built strong relationships with plant and personnel suppliers throughout WA to develop a large pool of resources that can be drawn upon at short notice. It runs multiple crews with civil crews all having the same core capabilities enabling personnel to be swapped if the need arises. Emergency contact information was sighted for four employees.</p>	<p>The company demonstrated substantial experience in completing similar projects. It cited six examples of civil maintenance projects it has conducted which mostly included demolition of roads, concrete kerbs and paths for City of South Perth 2020-2021 (\$750k) and 2018-2019 (\$750k), Shire of Peppermint Grove in 2018 (\$120k), City of Stirling in 2019 (\$250k), City of Albany and Main Roads WA in 2019 (\$1m) and City of Perth in 2018 (\$120k). It has also constructed the shared path to Burns Beach for the City in 2019. Some of these projects included elements that were superfluous to the City's requirements including reconstruction of concrete paths, profiling, drainage upgrades, tactile paving and asphalt laying. Outcomes of the works completed were identified. Dates for various contracts were provided. Three references were noted from the project examples provided.</p>	<p>The company demonstrated reasonable understanding of the required tasks. It provided a high level methodology which included the preparation and implementation of management plans with the City locating services and marking prior to the company commencing demolition. The use of plant and equipment was clearly articulated with kerb and pram ramp concrete removed by excavator during the City's required working hours and disposed of at a recycling centre using the six wheel truck. Specific details for saw cutting existing driveways were noted with the company acknowledging that it will reinstate the irrigation works and will return to conduct a back fill. Timeframes for undertaking tasks were lacking. Critical assumptions were submitted which were considered acceptable.</p>	<p>The company is located in Gnangara and stated that 60% of its workforce resides within the City of Joondalup and that it will purchase small tools, meals and sand from suppliers within the City's boundaries.</p>	75.8	\$3,441,459	3

TENDER 019/21 PROVISION OF PRELIMINARY WORKS PRIOR TO ROAD RESURFACING

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Estimated Total Comparative Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Providing Similar Services	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>Sparta Enterprises Pty Ltd as trustee for the D'Adamo Family Trust trading as Stirling Paving</p> <p>All requirements have not been met.</p>	Partially	<p>Stirling Paving is a family based business which commenced over 48 years ago. It employs eight staff with half of the workforce being employed in a consultancy / business / administrative capacity. Whilst resumes were not submitted to demonstrate projects worked on including the scope, person's role and their involvement, a high level summary was provided highlighting years of experience. The company will sub-contract the saw cutting component of the works to a contractor who has been contracting to Stirling Paving for over 20 years. Whilst it was noted that the sub-contractor is registered with Concrete Institute of Australia, information for skills and project experience was omitted. Its nominated specialised equipment was considered inadequate to perform the volume of works given the City's rigid road resurfacing program where timelines are critical to ensure project workflow is completed successfully within the quarterly targets. Equally the requirement to provide additional personnel and resources was not addressed which is essential to deliver an intense program. Details were provided for emergencies outside of normal working hours.</p>	<p>The company demonstrated experience in completing similar projects having been the City's supplier of preliminary works prior to road resurfacing from 2000 to 2015. It stated that it has been sub-contracting to GMF Contractors for the last six years undertaking subdivisions and is listed as a preferred contractor to the City of Stirling (since 1990) constructing right of ways in accordance with the specifications. Whilst summarised statements were provided covering constraints and contract outcomes associated with the City's previous scope of works, the exact scope of works conducted under other contracts was lacking. A list of contracts, periods and dates was omitted. Three references were provided.</p>	<p>The company demonstrated a sound understanding of the required tasks. It listed steps that will be undertaken including performing an assessment of the site for hazards, how it will conduct kerb removal (based upon its nominated removal rate) and how it will cut and remove concrete or asphalt. The backfill process was defined with a timeframe of two-three days to complete after commencement. Communication with the City regarding traffic management, site clean-up and repair work was noted.</p>	The company is based in Stirling. It did not meet any of the assessment criteria.	48.8%	\$1,441,991	4

TENDER 019/21 PROVISION OF PRELIMINARY WORKS PRIOR TO ROAD RESURFACING

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Estimated Total Comparative Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Providing Similar Services	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>East to West Plant Services Pty Ltd</p> <p>All requirements have not been met.</p>	Partially	<p>East to West Plant Services Pty Ltd was established in 2017 and employs 32 full-time staff. Its overall business structure was noted headed by a director in WA and a director in NSW supported by a General Manager, Operations Manager and Supervisor. It stated that its nominated staff are based in WA. Resumes sighted highlight good experience and qualifications for the key supervisory personnel which are appropriate to the City's scope of works. Details for the number of equipment operators located in WA and their relevant skills were not addressed. The company has nominated a five tonne wheeled excavator and sweeper plus a tipper truck to the City's scope of works however details for replacement plant and equipment in the event of breakdown were not evidenced. The ability to provide additional staff was not adequately addressed with a generic statement made that the company would remain flexible in order to meet the requirements of the City. Primary contact details were noted for the Director.</p>	<p>The company did not demonstrate sufficient experience in completing similar projects citing one example of works it had conducted at Claremont Train Station on behalf of John Holland Group and the Public Transport Authority during 2021. Whilst it provided a breakdown of some of the elements of the works to compare with the City's requirements encompassing working adjacent to residential homes, commercial properties and schools, arranging temporary footpath diversion and protecting assets, the exact scope of works was not defined. Three references were provided. The requirement to provide a list of contracts was not addressed.</p>	<p>The company demonstrated a sound understanding of the required tasks. It outlined its methodology whereby it will undertake a site inspection and precondition survey and record the findings. It will review the location of reticulation and cut / cap only those areas impacted by the construction. It stated it will assess the need for traffic control and confirm the requirements with the City, in addition to reviewing the site for safe delivery locations and the identification of any hazards. Examples of signage and traffic control were noted. Specific detail was provided for how the kerb will be saw cut and what equipment will be used. The reinstatement of services and clean-up of the area was articulated. Suggested timeframes for elements of the works were omitted.</p>	<p>The company is based in Cloverdale and services both WA and NSW. The company employs residents of the City of Joondalup and uses many suppliers within the City's boundaries including Total Eden, Soils Aint Soils, Bunnings and Joondalup Landscape Supplies.</p>	47.5%	\$4,361,178	5