

SUMMARY OF SUBMISSIONS

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Estimated Total Comparative Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>MMM (WA) Pty Ltd</p> <p>All requirements have been met.</p>	Yes	<p>MMM (WA) Pty Ltd employs 20 staff plus four apprentices, two trainees and two persons on work experience. It was established in 2005. The company submitted comprehensive information to demonstrate the years of relevant industry experience, qualifications and licences held for its key supervisory staff and equipment operators which were appropriate for the scope of works. It provided a list of the proposed plant and equipment that will be used to extract and transport the sand including its description, purpose, make, model and ID number. Three persons were nominated for after-hours contact and a sub-contractor has been nominated to prepare the Traffic Management Plan. It has a huge fleet highlighting its ability to allocate additional plant and equipment if required, however, the ability to source additional personnel resources was not addressed.</p>	<p>MMM (WA) Pty Ltd demonstrated extensive experience in completing similar projects. It is a WALGA preferred supplier under Roads, Infrastructure and Depot Services, Erosion Control and Foreshore Protection and has performed 61 projects for sea and river erosion repair works since 2008. Extensive information was sighted, including photographs, the project description, site management arrangements, project status, contract value and dates for 12 foreshore protection and erosion control projects for Department of Biodiversity, Conservation and Attractions, Cities of Swan, Bayswater, Melville, Perth, South Perth and Towns of East Fremantle and Victoria Park. Three references were provided two being for local governments.</p>	<p>The company demonstrated a thorough understanding of the required tasks. A Gantt chart was submitted showing all the activities and number of days the works will take to complete. It confirmed that the works will be completed over 15 nights between 7pm to 5am with 12 hour breaks allowable between work shifts. A strategy for how it will excavate the sand and the specific plant and equipment that will be used for this task was noted. A 2,000 litre dust suppression vehicle will be used to manage any excess dust created and trucks will be covered by tarpaulins during the sand transportation. Three crews will be deployed, and a full explanation was provided for what each crew will undertake. Verification of quantities of sand bypassed using truck counts, will be supported by daily individual vehicle movements supported by GPS tracking data as required by the City. Potential hazards and mitigation strategies were submitted including compliance with <i>Environmental Protection (Noise) Regulations 1997</i>. Truck access routes and locations of temporary fencing were clearly stated. Processes for managing resident feedback were noted.</p>	<p>The company is based in Maddington and uses local service stations within the City of Joondalup to refuel trucks and machinery.</p>	77.4%	\$259,983	1

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Estimated Total Comparative Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Social and economic effects on the local community			
NEO Civil Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Partially	NEO Civil Pty Ltd is a family-owned business and was established in 2010. It did not specifically state the number of employees however a human resources schedule showed 18 persons, their time in the role, and availability for the project. An organisation structure showed the relationship between the Director / Project Manager supported by a site supervisor, HSEQ Manager and Project Engineer. Resumes were submitted for the key supervisory staff and machine operators showing adequate experience and qualifications. Whilst the company provided a comprehensive list of plant and equipment that would be available for the delivery of the project, it was not clear what items had been dedicated to the works. It has several relationships in the civil construction industry allowing it to source extra workers and equipment on demand. Out of hours emergency contact information was not sighted. It has nominated a sub-contractor for the provision of traffic management	The company demonstrated substantial experience. It listed 42 projects, including time for completion and contract value, predominantly undertaken for state and local government agencies. Project profiles were noted for ten of the completed projects, with completion dates and values, encompassing elements of foreshore and seawall works similar to the City's requirements for the Cities of Rockingham, Mandurah and Albany and the Shires of Gingin and Coolgardie. A search of WALGA's preferred supplier list under Roads, Infrastructure and Depot Services, Erosion Control and Foreshore Protection did not show this company listed. It did not include details for its current contractual commitments for the Evaluation Panel to determine its capacity to perform the works. Multiple references were provided.	The company demonstrated a reasonable understanding of the required tasks. It submitted a schedule of tasks to be completed with site possession and practical completion expected in two weeks. The Evaluation Panel was not confident that the timelines could be achieved given that the company's current contractual commitments had not been addressed. One day was allocated for submitting and approving management plans which was considered ambitious. The traffic management plan will be submitted seven days prior to site possession which is not in accordance with the tender documentation which stipulates 28 working days. The main elements of the construction were covered, and it addressed the requirement for dust suppression despite the dust management plan not being attached. Noise management was not addressed however it was noted that silencing equipment on machinery will be a variation to the contract as part of the critical assumptions. The methodology for moving the sand including how it will measure the volumes transported was noted. Specific safe work method statements / job safety analysis, and details supporting how resident feedback will be processed were omitted.	It did not specifically state its principal place of business however the Offer included an address in Joondalup. It has operations in Western Australia, South Australia, Queensland and the Northern Territory. It was noted that one staff member resides in Mullaloo.	49.6%	\$377,000	2

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Estimated Total Comparative Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Estimating and Civils Australia Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Partially	<p>The company did not submit any details for its company structure. It will engage a sub-contractor to undertake traffic management.</p> <p>A list of plant and equipment including make, model and description was sighted however the purpose, age, maintenance history, load / reach capacity were not included.</p> <p>The ability to provide additional personnel and plant / equipment if required was lacking. Details were submitted for two emergency contacts.</p>	<p>The company demonstrated limited experience in completing similar foreshore / erosion projects with examples included for minor civil road works only as follows: City of Stirling – Beaucott and Astor laneway construction 2020-2021 (\$300k) plus further earthworks, roadworks and drainage (\$200k), Shire of Serpentine-Jarrahdale – Munro Road pavement works and resurfacing 2021 (\$60k), Downer EDI – Karrynyup Road principal shared path construction (\$400k), Deo Gloria Church – civil works building, drainage and car park 2022 (\$200k).</p> <p>Details of current contracts in place were not provided to ascertain the company's current commitments. Four references were provided.</p>	<p>The company did not demonstrate sufficient understanding of the required tasks. It will develop an overall project plan upon contract award and has allocated a two week program to complete the tasks which was questionable given that the company did not submit sufficient information to demonstrate its capacity. A detailed construction program in the form of a Gantt chart was not included. A 20 tonne excavator will be used to execute the works however this was not listed in the company's plant and equipment schedule. A table indicating the level of noise likely to be generated from the plant and equipment was sighted. Dust management and controls to prevent sand drift were considered inadequate, and the approach to measuring quantities of sand bypassed was not addressed. Importing limestone to construct a temporary hardstand for trucks to manoeuvre on was considered as a risk of contamination. Associated risks and elimination strategies were noted. Resident feedback processes were not included.</p>	<p>The qualitative criteria was not met for this category.</p> <p>Estimating and Civils Australia Pty Ltd did not specifically state its principal business location, however, the Offer was submitted with an address in Wanneroo.</p>	30.5%	\$188,894	3